

RESOLUTION OF THE NATIONAL ACCREDITATION BOARD MEETING

June 28, 2024

Form of the meeting: online and offline.

Venue: Peoples' Friendship University of Russia named after Patrice Lumumba, Miklukho-Maklaya Str. 6, Moscow, 117198, Russian Federation.

Devices for online participation in the meeting: Yandex Telemost - a programme to organize videoconferences

Start time: 14.00.

End time: 17.00.

The overall number of Board members: 27

The meeting **was attended** by 15 members of the National Accreditation Board: I. Arzhanova, V. Bolotov, S. Golubenko, M. Gusev, I. Dokuchaev, E. Zima, I. Kuksa, I. Muradova, N. Nikitina, V. Ponka, V. Filippov, O. Tsapko, A. Chaplygin, A. Epshtein, E. Esentaev.

A quorum is present. The National Accreditation Board is eligible to make decisions on all issues of the agenda.

A person, who counts votes: Galina Motova, Academic Secretary.

Invited experts:

A. Aldungarova (Kazakhstan), Zh. Beksultanov (Kyrgyzstan), M. Verkhoturov, N. Zhernakova, L. Zhuravleva, E. Kiseleva, O. Larionova, A. Mikliaeva, A. Nasyrov. (Kyrgyzstan), S. Panasenko, S. Poroiskiy, S. Ryzhkin, A. Stepovoy, V. Sushinskiy (Belarus), S. Sydykova (Kazakhstan), A. Taeva (Kazakhstan), E. Khabibullina, T. Shindina, A. Scherbak, A. Schukin, A. Yamashkin.

AGENDA:

1. Performance results of NCPA and the National Accreditation Board in 2023-2024 academic year (G. Motova).

2. The results of the joint international external review of clusters of educational programmes (G. Motova) carried out jointly with:

EQEA (China):

- National Research Tomsk State University;
- Moscow State University of Psychology & Education.

Bilim-Standard (Kyrgyzstan):

- Kyrgyz National University named after J.Balasagyn.

IAAR (Kazakhstan):

- Ural State Medical University of the Ministry of Healthcare of the Russian Federation (against WFME standards).

3. The results of the international external review of clusters of educational programmes delivered by (G. Motova):⁷

- Bashkir State Agrarian University,
- Novosibirsk State University of Economics and Management,
- Russian Timiryazev State Agrarian University,
- Astrakhan State Medical University of the Ministry of Healthcare of the Russian Federation,
- Orel State University named after I.S. Turgenev,
- Institute of International Economic Relations,
- Moscow State University of Civil Engineering (National Research University).

4. The results of remedial actions (G. Motova):

- Achinsk branch of Krasnoyarsk State Agrarian University,
- Tomsk State University of Control Systems and Radioelectronics.

5. Other issues

1. The first issue of the agenda was presented by **G. Motova «Performance results of NCPA and the National Accreditation Board in 2023-2024 academic year»**

Questions were asked.

Votes:

«for» - 15, «against» - 0, «abstain» - 0.

Unanimously.

Following the voting results it is resolved: to take the information into consideration.

2. The second issue of the agenda was presented by **G. Motova «The results of the joint international external review of clusters of educational programmes carried out jointly with:**

EQEA (China):

- **National Research Tomsk State University**

Questions were asked.

V. Bolotov: What were the most interesting things about the external review?

A. Yamashkin: Great material and technical resources, in-depth research, highly qualified teaching staff. Dean of the TSU Faculty of Geology and Geography spoke at the meeting of the Federal Academic Methodological Association about growth prospects. The students made a great impression. Experience of work and communication with Chinese colleagues is interesting. TSU is a modern university aimed at the development of the Russian East. Recommendations of the panel were aimed at the university and faculty development. All points of growth are highlighted by TSU itself.

Votes:

«for» - 15, «against» - 0, «abstain» - 0.

Unanimously.

Following the voting results it is resolved:

- 1) To accredit the cluster of educational programmes in «Geology» (05.03.01, 05.04.01), «Geography» (05.03.02, 05.04.02) for the period of 6 years.

– **Moscow State University of Psychology & Education**

Questions were asked.

V. Bolotov: Why did the external review panel give the summative assessment «substantial compliance»? What was lacking for «full compliance»?

A. Mikliaeva: Good material and technical resources do not guarantee the fundamental character of education; the training is too practice-oriented. The overall goals of study programmes are not defined.

Votes:

«for» - 15, «against» - 0, «abstain» - 0.

Unanimously.

Following the voting results it is resolved:

- 1) To accredit the cluster of educational programmes in «Psychological and Pedagogical Education» (44.04.02) for the period of 6 years.

Bilim-Standard (Kyrgyzstan)

– **Kyrgyz National University named after J.Balasagyn**

Questions were asked.

V. Bolotov: Why the marks for the IT cluster are lower than for the other clusters?

A. Schukin: The level of the study programmes is high; the university closely cooperates with the professional community. The external review panel outlined the growth path of the study programmes, in particular, the development of a new study programme that could cover a wider scope of knowledge and competences. To take into consideration instructional techniques that are more suitable for the IT study programmes. To enhance cooperation with partner foreign IT companies.

V. Filippov: To what extent the programmes of the cluster «Oriental Studies» comply with the international requirements for learning the oriental studies and sinology?

E. Khabibullina: The Russian school of oriental studies laid the foundation for the study programme under review; the university closely cooperates with Chinese HEIs

that allows the university to be on a world level. The programme is too practice-oriented, that is why it is recommended to enhance research component of Master students training.

E. Esentaev: We plan to continue cooperation with NCPA; the university is preparing for the new stage of joint accreditation. NCPA greatly supports the Kyrgyz agency in organization and methodology.

Votes:

«for» - 15, «against» - 0, «abstain» - 0.

Unanimously.

Following the voting results it is resolved:

- 1) To accredit the cluster of educational programmes in «Marketing» (581000) for the period of 6 years.
- 2) To accredit the cluster of educational programmes in «Social Work» (540200) for the period of 6 years.
- 3) To accredit the cluster of educational programmes in «Sinology» (532300) for the period of 6 years.
- 4) To accredit the cluster of educational programmes in «Information Systems and Technologies» (710200), «Software Engineering» (710400), «Information Technologies» (510300) for the period of 6 years.

IAAR (Kazakhstan)

– Ural State Medical University of the Ministry of Healthcare of the Russian Federation (against WFME standards)

Questions were asked.

V. Bolotov: Is there a fundamental difference in standards and approaches to accreditation of two agencies?

E. Kiseleva: WFME has a student-centered approach; the accreditation process is built on stakeholders' opinion.

A. Chaplygin: How the Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation and the Association of Medical Universities are related to this accreditation?

V. Bolotov: The Ministry of Health can not and should not support this approach due to political reasons.

V. Filippov: There are many agencies in the world that carry out accreditation of medical programmes. The university chooses the agency itself.

G. Motova: Russian medical HEIs are interested in international recognition of their study programmes as it attracts foreign applicants for whom international quality recognition of study programmes is important. Russia does not have quality assurance agencies recognized by the World Federation for Medical Education, that is why Russian HEIs do not have much choice: either to be accredited by **IAAR**, or to undergo a joint accreditation by NCPA that is recognised in Russia and abroad.

N. Zhernakova: The recommendations were aimed at greater public awareness of the mission and goals of the HEI and the study programmes. The external review was specifically focused on student-centered learning. I would like to mention high quality clinical facilities – partners of the university.

V. Filippov: I suggest we should trust opinions of our colleagues.

V. Bolotov: I invite experts to share their experience about a joint external review and publish an article in one of the reputable journals.

G. Motova: I suggest preparing a report about the joint accreditation of medical programmes and sending it to the Ministry of Healthcare.

Votes:

«for» - 15, «against» - 0, «abstain» - 0.

Unanimously.

Following the voting results it is resolved:

- 1) To accredit the educational programmes in «General Medicine» (31.05.01), «Pediatrics» (31.05.02), «Dentistry» (31.05.03), «Pediatrics» (31.08.19), «Anesthesiology-Reanimatology» (31.08.02), «Orthopedic Dentistry» (31.08.75) for the period of 6 years.

3. The third issue of the agenda was presented by G. Motova on **the results of the international external review of clusters of educational programmes delivered by:**

– **Astrakhan State Medical University**

Questions were asked.

V. Bolotov: Dear experts, please share your thoughts.

V. Sushinskiy: I think that the study programmes should be accredited as the university showed good results. Russian and Belarusian HEIs have much in common.

S. Poroykiy: Accreditation does not give employment privileges. It enables to train foreign students in medical study programmes. The goal of accreditation is not to search for drawbacks, but to give recommendations for improvement.

Votes:

«for» - 15, «against» - 0, «abstain» - 0.

Unanimously.

Following the voting results it is resolved:

- 1) To accredit the cluster of educational programmes in «General Medicine» (31.05.01), «Pediatrics» (31.05.02), «Dentistry» (31.05.03) for the period of 6 years.

– **Bashkir State Agrarian University**

Questions were asked.

V. Bolotov: What was the inclusion of the study programme «Construction» (08.03.01, 08.04.01) in the cluster «Environmental Management» driven by? The same question is about the study programmes «Power Industry» and «Transport»?

A. Aldungarova: In this case the profile of the studied disciplines is oriented to agricultural construction and design of the agroindustrial complex.

A. Stepovoy: The common features of these study programmes are programmes in agricultural engineering and engineering components.

Zh. Beksultanov: I liked that the University' staff has positive attitude and the academic degree holders rate is high. I would like to mention the relations between the educational institution and the professional community.

Votes:

«for» - 15, «against» - 0, «abstain» - 0.

Unanimously.

Following the voting results it is resolved:

- 1) To accredit the cluster of educational programmes in «Construction» (08.03.01, 08.04.01), «Environmental Management and Water Use» (20.03.02, 20.04.02), «Land Management and Cadastre» (21.03.02, 21.04.02), «Geodesy and Remote Sensing» (21.03.03) for the period of 6 years.
- 2) To accredit the cluster of educational programmes in «Food Products of Plant Origin» (19.03.02, 19.04.02), «Food Products of Animal Origin» (19.03.03, 19.04.03), «Technology of Production and Catering» (19.03.04, 19.04.04) for the period of 6 years.
- 3) To accredit the cluster of educational programmes in «Applied Informatics» (09.03.03), «Economics» (38.03.01, 38.04.01), «Business informatics» (38.03.05) for the period of 6 years.
- 4) To accredit the cluster of educational programmes in «Sectoral and Regional economics» (5.2.3.), «Management» (5.2.6.) for the period of 6 years.
- 5) To accredit the cluster of educational programmes in «Operation of transport and technological machines and systems» (23.03.03, 23.04.03), «Thermal power and heat engineering» (13.03.01, 13.04.01), «Power industry and electrical engineering» (13.03.02) for the period of 6 years.
- 6) To accredit the cluster of educational programmes in «Electrical technologies, electrical equipment and power supply of the agro-industrial complex» (4.3.2.), «Technologies, machines and equipment for agro-industrial complex» (4.3.1.) for the period of 6 years.

– **Russian Timiryazev State Agrarian University**

Questions were asked.

V. Bolotov: Dear experts, please share your thoughts.

A. Aldungarova: The HEI and experts worked as a team. The level of the study programmes is very high.

A. Scherbak: The infrastructure and equipment are on a high level; the students are greatly satisfied with the educational process. The university provides conditions for self-development and realization of students' potential. The growth point for the programmes of secondary vocational education is enhancing the electronic educational environment.

Votes:

«for» - 15, «against» - 0, «abstain» - 0.

Unanimously.

Following the voting results it is resolved:

- 1) To accredit the cluster of educational programmes in «Biology» (06.03.01, 06.04.01) for the period of 6 years.
- 2) To accredit the cluster of educational programmes in «Biotechnology» (19.03.01, 19.04.01), «Plant-Based Food Products» (19.03.02, 19.04.02), «Animal-Based Food Products» (19.03.03, 19.04.03) for the period of 6 years.
- 3) To accredit the cluster of educational programmes in «Plant-Based Food Products» (19.02.11) for the period of 6 years.
- 4) To accredit the cluster of educational programmes in «Construction» (08.03.01, 08.04.01), «Construction of Unique Buildings and Structures» (08.05.01) for the period of 6 years.
- 5) To accredit the cluster of educational programmes in «Construction and Operation of Buildings and Structures» (08.02.01) for the period of 6 years.

– **Orel State University named after I.S. Turgenev**

Questions were asked.

V. Bolotov: What is the reason that only 3 out of 9 standards got “full compliance”?

G. Startceva: When allocating the marks, the external review panel gave more recommendations for further improvement of the study programmes.

Votes:

«for» - 15, «against» - 0, «abstain» - 0.

Unanimously.

Following the voting results it is resolved:

- 1) To accredit the cluster of educational programmes in «Operation of transport and technological machines and complexes» (23.03.03, 23.04.03), «Ground transport and technological means» (23.05.01) for the period of 6 years.

– **Novosibirsk State University of Economics and Management**

Questions were asked.

Votes:

«for» - 15, «against» - 0, «abstain» - 0.

Unanimously.

Following the voting results it is resolved:

- 1) To accredit the cluster of educational programmes in «Information Systems and Technologies» (09.03.02, 09.04.02), «Applied Information Science» (09.03.03, 09.04.03), «Innovation Studies» (27.03.05, 27.04.05), «Fundamental Information Science and Information Technologies» (02.03.02) for the period of 6 years.
- 2) To accredit the cluster of educational programmes in «Economics» (38.03.01), «Management» (38.03.02, 38.04.02), «Public Administration» (38.03.04, 38.04.04), «Business Information Science» (38.03.05), «Economic Security» (38.05.01), «Banking and Finance» (38.04.08) for the period of 6 years.
- 3) To accredit the cluster of educational programmes in «Economics and Accounting (by fields)» (38.02.01), «Business Activity in Logistics» (38.02.03), «Finance» (38.02.06), «Banking» (38.02.07) for the period of 6 years.

– **Institute of International Economic Relations**

Questions were asked.

V. Bolotov: We would like to hear the feedback about accreditation of a non-state HEI.

A. Nasyrov: The University has strong traditions, the graduates are aware of their career path. An individual learning path is in place. The programme «Digital Economics» is delivered; it favorably distinguishes the university. The study programme's profile is foreign economic activities. The panel strictly evaluated the programmes, gave clear recommendations for improvement: to enhance research, to provide financing for the software, to pay attention to qualification enhancement of the teaching staff in mastering foreign languages, to expand its geographic reach. Panel's recommendations do not drastically influence the state of the study programmes.

A. Chaplygin: It is the university under the Russian Foreign Trade Academy, we know it, it exists for almost 30 years.

Votes:

«for» - 15, «against» - 0, «abstain» - 0.

Unanimously.

Following the voting results it is resolved:

- 1) To accredit the cluster of educational programmes in «Economics» (38.03.01), «Management» (38.03.02), «Public and Municipal Administration» (38.03.04), «Business Informatics» (38.03.05) for the period of 6 years.

– **Moscow State University of Civil Engineering (pilot LTA-technology)**

Questions were asked.

V. Bolotov: Dear colleagues, members of the Board, what do you think about LTA accreditation?

E. Zima: This procedure makes HEIs' life easier as it solves many issues while preparing for accreditation. At the same time, it deprives the university's staff of the opportunity to communicate with the experts directly.

V. Ponka: We should not be afraid of new steps; life is changing; we should be changing too.

V. Bolotov: So, colleagues, we come to a conclusion that you support the idea of LTA-accreditation. It should be focused on the growth points of the study programmes.

L. Zhuravleva: One of the recommendations for the university was to inform the public about their unique character and to be more open.

Votes:

«for» - 15, «against» - 0, «abstain» - 0.

Unanimously.

Following the voting results it is resolved:

1) To accredit the cluster of educational programmes in «Construction» (08.03.01, 08.04.01), «Construction of unique buildings and structures» (08.05.01) for the period of 6 years.

4. The fourth issue of the agenda was presented by G. Motova on **the results of remedial actions by:**

– **Achinsk branch of Krasnoyarsk State Agrarian University**

Questions were asked.

Votes:

«for» - 15, «against» - 0, «abstain» - 0.

Unanimously.

Following the voting results it is resolved:

1) To extend the accreditation terms of the study programme in «Economics» (38.03.01) for the period of 2 years.

– **Tomsk State University of Control Systems and Radioelectronics**

Questions were asked.

Votes:

«for» - 15, «against» - 0, «abstain» - 0.

Unanimously.

Following the voting results it is resolved:

1) To extend the accreditation terms of the study programme in «Technical Operation of Transport Radio Equipment» (25.05.03) for the period of 2 years.

5. The fifth issue «**Other issues**» of the agenda was presented by V. Bolotov, who spoke about NCPA's good work.

Votes:

«for» - 15, «against» - 0, «abstain» - 0.

Unanimously.

Following the voting results it is resolved: to support the suggestion of V. Bolotov.

There was no further business, other issues were not raised.

Chair
of the National Accreditation Board

V. Bolotov

Academic Secretary
of the National Accreditation Board

G. Motova