




SUMMARY REPORT OF THE EXTERNAL EVALUATION

of the Master's degree programme

27.04.02 'Quality Management in Agriculture and Food
Industry'

delivered by the Volga State University of Technology



2016

While preparing this Summary Report we used information from the Self-Evaluation Report and the Report on the External Review of the Master's degree programme 27.04.02 'Quality Management in Agriculture and Food Industry' delivered by the Volga State University of Technology.

The presentation document for the use by the National Accreditation Board.

CONTENTS

General information on educational institution.....	4
Information on the educational	5
Programmes undergoing accreditation	5
Achievements of the educational programmes.....	6
External review panel.....	11
The Goal Of The Align Tempus Project.....	13
Alignment of criteria	14
Compliance of the external review outcomes with the standards	15
Conclusion of the external review panel.....	27
Programme of peer review panel site visit	28

GENERAL INFORMATION ON EDUCATIONAL INSTITUTION

Full name of the educational institution	<i>Federal State Autonomous Educational Institution of Higher Education the «Volga State University of Technology»</i>	
Founders	<i>Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation</i>	
Year of foundation	<i>1932 – The Volga Forestry Engineering Institute 1968 – Gorky Mari State Polytechnic Institute 1995 – Mari State Technical University 2002 – SEI HPE «Mari State Technical University» 2012 – FSAEI HPE «Volga State University of Technology» 2016 – FSBEI HE «Volga State University of Technology»</i>	
Address	<i>3 Lenin Sq., Yoshkar-Ola, Republic of Mari El, Russia</i>	
Rector	<i>Dr. Of Agreecultural Sc., professor Romanov Yevgeny Mikhailovich</i>	
License	<i>Series 90Л01 № 0000377reg.. № 0342 of 19.09.2012, permanent</i>	
State accreditation	<i>State Accreditation Certificate № 0339, series 90A01 № 0000342 от 29.12.2012</i>	
Number of students	<i>10532</i>	
	<i>Full-time</i>	<i>6446</i>
	<i>on-site and off-site</i>	<i>375</i>
	<i>Part-time</i>	<i>3711</i>

INFORMATION ON THE EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMMES UNDERGOING ACCREDITATION

Educational programmes	27.04.02 «Quality Management in Agriculture and Food Industry»
Level of training / Standard period of training	Master's degree programme / 2 years
Structural subdivision	Faculty of Management and Law (Dr. of Economics, professor Larionova Nina Ivanovna)
Major department (head of major departments)	Department of Management and Law (Dr. of Economics, Arzamastsev Aleksey Dmitievich)
Date of the site visit	June 24-2 ,2016
Person responsible for public accreditation of the educational programme	Head of the Department for Information Policy Tsareva Gusal Rinatovna

REFERENCE DATA ON STUDENT ENROLLEMENT FOR THE PROGRAMME 27.04.02 «QUALITY MANAGEMENT IN AGRICULTURE AND FOOD INDUSTRY»



ACHIEVEMENTS OF THE EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMMES

Quality of the delivered educational programmes

The quality of education and training of graduates of the programme 'Quality Management in Agriculture and Food Industry' is assessed on the basis of the entrance examinations analysis, the results of knowledge assessment in the disciplines of the curriculum, interim and final state attestation of graduates.

The analysis of the academic progress of Master's students and graduates in Programme 27.04.02 Quality management remains stable: 70-75%.

Provision of up-to-date education

The curricula of the Department's study programmes have been designed with the consideration of international educational standards in the sphere of management in technical systems and professional standards in the qualification level ПС 40.062. Specialist on product quality (Professional activity in the sphere of product (services) quality management) national and regional priorities of innovation development of economy, the University's mission, traditions, research schools, requirements of national and international labour market and the professional community.

The Faculty regularly receives letters from the leading regional organizations with requests for qualified cadre, which facilitates the updating of the curricula.

The up-dating of the contents of the programmes is provided by their regular revision, implementing research results of the teachers in the study process, introducing new Master programmes.

This study programme is closely associated with Russia's joining the World Trade Organization (WTO) and Russian manufacturers of goods and services entry into the European market. One of the conditions of Russia's membership in WTO is quality management and quality assurance systems that are compliant with the European standards. According to these requirements, the service responsible for the quality assurance system of production, storage and sales should operate at any industrial and agricultural enterprise. Russia has to improve the competitiveness of goods by introducing and employing a quality management system at enterprises. Today well-established and respectable companies have quality offices and services, and they certify goods and production processes on a voluntary basis. The mission of the academic programme is to train specialists in quality management and quality assurance of goods and services, where quality serves as a material basis to meet production as well as individual needs, thus determining unique public, economic and social values.

Competency of the teaching staff

The Faculty of Management and Law comprises 41 teachers (including part-time personnel), the percentage of degree holders is 87,8%: out of this number – 5 (12,2%) are Doctors of Sciences; 31 (75,6%) – Candidates of Sciences. 5 (12,2%) don't have any post-graduate degree.

During the last five years the teachers of the Faculty have gone through 43 further education programmes. The teachers have practical experience in the spheres of management, public administration, economics of industry, quality management at food manufacturing companies.

Many teachers are federal and regional government award recipients and winners of different contests and competitions. Annually they publish text books and student training manuals.

The Faculty has agreements on strategic partnership with the following organizations:

- The Ministry of culture, press and national affairs of the Republic of Mari El, Agreement 566/2016 of 25 April 2016 – permanent
- Bauman Kazan State Academy of Veterinary Medicine, Agreement 661/2015 of 17.03.2015, permanent
- Yakovlev Chuvash State Pedagogical University
- The Public Organization of the Republic of Tatarstan «The Executive Committee of the Tatar World Congress», Agreement 809/2016 of 29 April 2016 –permanent
- Faculty of organizational sciences, University of Belgrade (Serbia)
- Danubius University (Sládkovičovo, Slovak Republic)

Research

Annually the Faculty holds different research events:

The National Olympiad in management (April);

The National Research and Practice Conference of graduate and undergraduate students and young teachers «Government and Corporative Management: the State and Prospects in the XXI century»;

The National Research and Practice Conference «Public Administration: challenges and solutions»;

The National Student Research and Practice Conference «Current Issues of Modern Management: scientific paradigms and practical aspects»;

The National Youth Forum «The Granite of Science: Youth. Innovation. Management».

The students of the Faculty are successful participants in different kinds of contests, competitions, conferences at the regional, national and international levels:

International Student Olympiad «Entrepreneurship and Management» (Saint Petersburg);

The National Research and Practice Conference «The Practice of Corruption Management: challenges and achievements» (Kazan);

The Boytsov National Student Olympiad in Management with international participation (Kursk)

The National Competition of achievements of the talented youth «Russia's National Asset»;

The Intellectual Olympiad of the Volga Federal Region (Saransk);

Inter-Regional Student Olympiad «Management of Change and Organizational Behaviour in Business » (Samara);

The republican competition of youth business projects conducted in the framework of the state programme for the support of small and medium enterprise;

The competition of student social video commercials.

Student graduation works annually take top places in national competitions for the best Bachelor and Master theses in their specialty fields. The best students have an opportunity to take part in the Faculty's research projects. This practice helps them to acquire useful skills and get some financial rewards.

Research results are discussed at international, national, regional and local conferences, and are published in research journals. During the period of 2011-2015 the teachers published 85 articles in the peer reviewed journals, 32 monographs, 658 articles in the journals included in the database of RSCI, and 11 publications in the foreign SCOPUS journals and 8 - in international collections of articles.

Material and technical resources

There are adequate and sufficient resources for the delivery of the Master's Degree Programme 27.04.02 '*Quality Management in Agriculture and Food Industry*'. The study process is equipped with up-to-date software including the following products: Business game BUSINESS COURSE: Maximum, BUSINESS COURSE: Corporation +, BUSINESS COURSE: Enterprise, 1C: Enterprise 8.0, Project Expert 7.18, Statistica, ConCi Sales Forecasting ForExSale, Simple Anketten, Law Inquiry Computer System Consultant Plus и ICS Garant, Moodle (electronic education).

There are specialized rooms and laboratories with modern equipment which provide the implementation of the study programme. Computer classes with the Internet access are used to solve complex technical and management tasks which require special software.

Employability of graduates

Employability of graduates of Programme 27.04.02 Quality Management has been high and stable at 98%.

Academic mobility of students

Academic mobility is one of the priority areas of enhancing the University's performance. The University trains Bachelors and Masters in network study programme and academic exchange programmes.

Undergraduate and post-graduate students take an active part in the international exchange programmes within the framework of network interaction under the agreement Mittweida University of Applied Sciences (Germany). They participate in international student for a (Russian-Chinese Youth Forum «The Volga – the Yangtze» 2015)

INFORMATION ON THE LEADING TEACHERS OF THE STUDY PROGRAMMES

Dr. Guzal Tsareva

*Associate Professor of the Department of Management and Law,
Deputy Head of the Centre for Information Policy and Public Relations*

Dr. Vasily Berdnikov

*Candidate of Technical Sciences, Chief technologist of LLC 'Poultry Farm
Akashevskaya'*

Dr. Natalia Maksimets

*Candidate of Technical Sciences, Associate Professor of the Department of
Management and Law, Member of Educational and Methodological
Association*

Dr. Alexander Volkov

*Candidate of Technical Sciences, Associate Professor of the Department of
Management and Law, Vice Rector for Informatization*

Dr. Zoya Skulditskaya, programme director

Associate professor of the Department of Management and Law

Dr. Vladimir Shulepov

*Candidate of Technical Sciences, Associate Professor of the Department of
Management and Law Candidate of Technical Sciences, Associate Professor
of the Department of Management and Law*

EXTERNAL REVIEW PANEL



Andre Govaert (Belgium)

Review Chair, international expert

Expert of the ALIGN project: visiting professor KULeuven



Zbigniew Palka (Poland)

Deputy Review Chair, international expert

Expert of the ALIGN project: professor, A. Mickiewicz University (Poznan)



Durdica Dragojevic (Croatia)

Panel member, international expert

Representative of CEENQA – quality assurance network of Central and Eastern Europe



Dr. Vladislav Pylin (Russia)

Panel member, representative of professional community,

Deputy Director, Research Institute for Quality Monitoring in Education, member of the Russian Union of Industrialists and Entrepreneurs (RSPP)



Ms. Svetlana Ivanova (Russia)

Panel member, representative of students

MA student, Linguistics (1st year)



Dr. Maria Smolentseva (Russia)

Panel member, representative of Volgatch University

Associate Professor, Department of Foreign Languages



Dr. Evgeny Sharapov (Russia)

Panel member, representative of Volgatch University

Associate Professor , Senior Researcher, Department of Innovations and Research



Oksana Matveeva (Russia)

Panel member, NCPA's expert

Deputy Head of the Accreditation Office, National Centre for Public Accreditation



Elina Moon (Russia)

observer

2 year Master Student of Higher School of Economics,

THE GOAL OF THE ALIGN TEMPUS PROJECT

The external review was conducted under the Align Tempus Project "Achieving and checking the alignment between academic programmes and qualification frameworks".

The main objective of the project is to enhance the intelligibility, consistency and transferability of qualifications through establishment of mechanisms for HEIs to achieve alignment of academic programmes with NQFs and for QA agencies to check such alignment.

Specific Objectives are:

To promote a better understanding of HEIs and EQA agencies of the role of QFs, their structure, as well as the differences between the different KINDS and LEVELS of student achievement

To build on the capacity of HEIs to write and access learning outcomes that define the various types of student achievement

To build on the capacity of the HEIs to use the QF alignment to facilitate student transfer, joint qualifications and benchmarking

To enable the EQA agencies to check whether proposed learning outcomes and their assessment mechanisms match of QF descriptors at each level by establishing mechanisms for ensuring consistency of judgements across institutions

Align Tempus partners:

European partners: The Central and Eastern European Network of Quality Assurance Agencies in Higher Education (CEENQA), Adam Mickiewicz University in Poland, Koblenz-Landau University (Germany), Bath Spa University (England), Dun Laoghaire Institute of Art, Design and Technology (Ireland), KU Leuven University in Gent (Belgium).

Armenia: Ministry of Education and Science, Yerevan Brusov State University of Languages, Yerevan State Medical University, National Center for Professional Education Quality Assurance (ANQA), Armenian Students' Association (ANSA), Republican Union of Employers of Armenia.

Russia: Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation, National Centre for Public Accreditation (NCPA), North Arctic Federal University, Moscow State Pedagogical University, the Volga State University of Technology, Russian Student Union, the Russian Union of Industrialists and Entrepreneurs

Ukraine Ministry of Education and Science, Sumy State University, Khmelnytskyi National University, Ukrainian Association of Student Self-government, the Association of Employers.

ALIGNMENT OF CRITERIA

NCPA's Standards	ALIGN TEMPUS Standards
1. Policy (goals, development strategy) and quality assurance procedures of a study programme	1.1 2.4 2.6 2.9
2. Design and approval of programmes	1.1 1.2 1.3 1.4 1.8 1.10 2.1 2.2 2.3 2.6 2.7
3. Student-centred learning, teaching and assessment	1.4 1.5 1.8 2.3 2.4 2.8
4. Student admission, support of academic achievements and graduation	1.5 1.7 1.9 2.5
5. Teaching staff	1.6 2.7 2.10
6. Learning resources and student support	1.6 1.7 1.9 2.10
7. Collection, analysis and use of information for managing the study programme	2.3 2.7
8. Public information	1.7
9. On-going monitoring and periodic review of programmes	1.4 2.1 2.2 2.3 2.6 2.9
10. Cyclical external quality assurance of study programmes	2.9

COMPLIANCE OF THE EXTERNAL REVIEW OUTCOMES WITH THE STANDARDS

STANDARD 1. ACADEMIC PROGRAMME ALIGNMENT

Compliance with the standard: **substantial compliance**

Good practice

Master's programme 27.04.02 'Quality Management in Agriculture and Food Industry' has clearly defined goals coordinated with the mission and the development strategy of the University. The study programme (SP) is oriented towards the training of specialists on food quality management and complies with the requirements set by the environment. When designing the study programme the requirements of relevant Federal Educational Standards, professional standards, the 7th level descriptors of the NQF of the RF, and also the requirements for auditors of management systems for safety of food products (GOST 53755-2009 (ISO/TS 22003:2007) «Management Systems for Food Safety. Requirements for bodies performing audit and certification of the management systems for food products» and GOST ISO 19011-2012 «Guidelines for the audit of management systems».

The SP maintains close links with representatives of the professional community who are involved in the educational process at all stages: development of the competency-oriented model of graduates, participation in public and professional evaluation, supervision of final qualification papers, research, and work in the state examination boards. The programme is implemented under the Agreement with Bauman Kazan State Academy of Veterinary Medicine which expands educational opportunities of students.

The employed procedures and mechanisms ensure that the intended learning outcomes are attainable and measurable. Besides, there is a competency passport which ensures adequate use of strategic and tactical educational technologies.

The system "RITM" is used for formative assessment of learning outcomes after studying separate disciplines (modules), work placement, term projects. The students can get the information about their academic progress from the teachers of the disciplines or in their personal accounts at the University portal.

The SP is annually reviewed in accordance with the goals and the results of their implementation. The contents of the study disciplines and their methodological provision are updated with consideration of the development of science and technology and the students' needs. These changes are reflected in the curriculum; elective subjects are changed in the first place.

Master students have an opportunity to continue their education at the Institute for Lifelong Learning of VolgaTech on the following programmes: 'Marketing', 'State and Municipal Administration', 'Business

Assessment', Russian-Dutch programme 'Marketing Education in Russia'. These opportunities broaden a possible range of job positions; give additional opportunities for professional career development, including related areas of economic activity and foreign firms. There is an agreement with the South-West State University (Kursk) under which the graduates of the Programme can enroll in a post-graduate programme in Quality Management at South-West State University.

CRITERION 1. The academic programmes are properly titled and lead to awards at the appropriate level, consistent with European and national qualifications for higher educational qualifications and the Dublin Descriptors for Master's awards.

Compliance with the criterion: **partial compliance**

Master's Programme 27.04.02 'Quality Management in Agriculture and Food Industry' is properly titled. On completion of the programme and a successful public defense of the Master's thesis graduates are awarded the Master's Degree which corresponds the 7th level of the European Qualifications Framework, and the draft "National Qualifications Framework of the Russian Federation (2012).

CRITERION 2. The academic programmes are informed by and consistent with occupational standards where appropriate.

Compliance with the criterion: **substantial compliance**

In the process of developing the academic programmes the working groups responsible for the alignment process were guided by: the Federal State Educational Standards (International Cooperation in the Field of Protection of Environment and Nature Management; Quality Management in Agriculture and Food Industry'); occupational standards – see descriptors on Generic Labor Functions and Labor Functions in the Competence-Based Model of a Graduate.

CRITERION 3. The aims of the programmes are appropriate for the student intake, and can be realized through students' attainment of the programme/module learning outcomes.

Compliance with the criterion: **substantial compliance**

The programme's goals are implemented in accordance with the mission and development of general cultural competences, which define the graduate's ability to conduct independent research and develop generic and professional competences necessary for the activity in the sphere of food quality management. The competences formed on the completion of the Programme make it possible for the Master's graduates to expand the knowledge acquired at the Bachelor's level, to make

decisions in the sphere of food quality management, carry on independent research, innovative, managerial activity, to have ability for self-education, and to aim for professional development.

CRITERION 4. All learning outcomes at module level are at the appropriate level, and assessed through fair, valid and reliable student assignments/tests.

Compliance with the criterion: **substantial compliance**

The Competence Passport of each academic discipline (module) 1) describes the importance of competences in the competence model of a graduate (determined by conducting surveys of internal and external stakeholders); 2) contains a competence structure, i.e. describes knowledge and skills of graduates; 3) describes strategic and tactic education technologies and methods and tools for assessment of competence acquisition (threshold, advanced highly developed).

CRITERION 5. Throughout their course of study, students are able to monitor their academic progress and development, and receive advice on how they can improve and enhance their work

Compliance with the criterion: **full compliance**

The students can monitor their academic progress in the following ways: 1) at the beginning of their studies each student fills in an individual plan, which serves as the main document of academic progress monitoring 2) the teacher performing the current control informs the students about the forms of formative assessment in a discipline (module) or a course paper and assessment criteria; 3) the results of formative assessment by the RITM system are available online.

CRITERION 6. The teaching and learning activities employed within the modules are informed by reflection on professional practices, and designed to enable students to develop the knowledge, skills, abilities and professional competencies that will enable them to achieve the modules' learning outcomes.

Compliance with the criterion: **substantial compliance**

The graduates of the study programme are ready to perform tasks which correspond to the labour functions described in professional standard 239.40.062 Specialist on food quality. The developers of the Master's study programme have correlated professional tasks and labour functions with qualifications requirements, which ensure conducting the teaching and learning activities on the basis of professional practice and achieving the intended learning outcomes.

CRITERION 7. The structure of the programme ensures the progression of students' learning, and provides appropriate opportunities for student choice.

Compliance with the criterion: **substantial compliance**

The programme is logically structured to ensure the students' learning progression. And this is evidenced by: 1) cohesion and coherence of the modules/course in the academic programme; 2) clear definition of 'input' and 'output' competences; 3) a tool called 'matrix of competence acquisition', which effectively shows the real 'progression' of students, and the way the competences are acquired. The variable part of the study programme is flexible enough and give students freedom to choose from courses available.

CRITERION 8. The credits ratings (national and ECTS) for modules are properly aligned with the designated student workloads for the modules

Compliance with the criterion: **substantial compliance**

The student work load is determined by the curriculum and is defined both in hours and ECTS. The maximum amount of students workload is 54 hours (1,5 ECTS) per week, including contact (classroom) and independent work. The maximum amount of contact hours equals 14. The approved number of exams, tests, project papers is set in the programme curriculum.

CRITERION 9. Students are provided with clear and current information about the learning opportunities and support available to them

Compliance with the criterion: **full compliance**

The study programme regularly places current information about opportunities and support for students from public organizations and focus groups, such as the Student Union, environment protection groups of Volgtech, associations of foreign students, historic society "CLIO", student construction brigades, voluntary initiative student organization "VIOS", the student trade union organization, the club for historic reconstruction "the Volga Way", amateur arts club, sports club "Polytechnik", the club of international friendship "The Bridge", "the Young Family" club, the students' rescue team "Volgtech".

A system of involvement of talented youth in research is in place, which includes participation in conferences, forums, contests, competitions and festivals of regional, national and international level. The results of student research are published in collections of articles and journals, issued by Volgtech.

The coordination of research work is carried out by the department of research programmes, publications and intellectual property, and by student associations, such as the "Umnik PGTU" club, Student Research Society, Student Design Engineering Bureau.

CRITERION 10. The design, delivery and monitoring of the academic programmes is 'student centred', engaging students collectively and individually as partners in the development, assurance and enhancement of their educational experiences

Compliance with the criterion: **partial compliance**

Development, implementation and monitoring of the study programme are based on the student-centred approach and involve students both collectively and individually as partners in the development, provision and improvement of the study programme (for example, by way of considering the students' opinion, discussions about the course enhancement, participation of students in the quality assurance procedures).

STANDARD 1. AREAS FOR IMPROVEMENT

1. In order to implement the standard educational «Bachelor – Master – Doctor» it is necessary to take measures for extending cooperation with other HEIs, including foreign HEIs in the sphere of diversification of third level study programmes creating conditions for students to enter post graduate programmes.
2. It is recommended to include in the curriculum special disciplines delivered in English. This will help to overcome the language barrier and increase competitiveness of graduates both in the national and international labour market.
3. It is necessary to introduce a mechanism of independent certification of assessment tools.
4. Conditions should be created for the students of the programme to get professionally certified (e.g., certification in auditing management systems of food safety according to the GOST requirements).
5. Conditions should be created for the masters' participation in the programmes of international cooperation (double degree programmes, short term exchange visits, grant and project activity, participation in international conferences, post graduate programmes abroad, etc.).
6. It is necessary to maintain closer cooperation with other faculties in the sphere of designing engineering programmes, and to set up introductory courses of Quality Management within the framework of LLL.

7. Learning outcomes should be more specific and based on the Dublin Descriptors. Special attention should be paid to general and generic professional competencies. Representatives of the professional community (including graduates) should be more actively involved in the development of study programmes and their implementation at all stages through the quality assurance system and the teachers.
8. It is recommended to train students for their prospective enterprising activity, and to give them an opportunity to choose optional subjects.
9. In order to increase the objectivity of student learning outcome assessment it is necessary to continue improving the assessment scales.
10. It is recommended to establish contacts with other HEIs, which have a relevant infrastructure for provision of the academic process.
11. It is necessary to enhance cooperation with employers and involve them in the advisory committees, and as graduation theses supervisors.
12. It is recommended to introduce the processes of student centered learning by way of involving students in the developing programmes.
13. Students should take a more active part in the mobility programmes utilizing for this purpose different communication channels.

STANDARD 2. ALIGNMENT OF QUALITY ASSURANCE PROCESSES

Compliance with the standard: **substantial compliance**

Good practice

VolgaTech developed and introduced a system of quality management (SQM) on the basis of ISO 9001:2008 «Quality Management System. Requirements», and «Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area» (ESG-ENQA). Such a SQM model constitutes a set of internal requirements ensuring the quality of the educational performance of the University. It also allows to guarantee the consideration of the Russian and European law when developing local normative documents.

VolgaTech confirms that the relevant quality assurance mechanisms are in place and are open to an independent evaluation in case when the SOM model of VolgaTech covers areas regulated by FSES, PS, NQF (RF NQF, 2012).

VolgaTech constantly improves the effectiveness of SOM through the analysis of the ways of improving and changes in the system. With this aim in view the results of work of the structural units are analyzed, where the following information is used:

- a) internal quality assurance processes:
 1. internal monitoring and audit, which contribute to enhancing the study process effectiveness;

2. regular monitoring of SP implementation, which is performed by the methodological committee of the Department of Management and Law, methodological committee of the Faculty of Management and Law, Education and Methodology Department of the University;
3. monitoring and information about the employability of graduates, surveys and employer satisfaction analysis, which are carried out by the Career Development Centre of PSTU;
4. anonymous surveys of students about their satisfaction with the quality of academic process, which is held by Education and Methodology Department of the University.
- 6) external quality assurance processes:
 1. results of state accreditation, and follow up procedures (plan of corrective actions);
 2. an obligatory procedure of the external reviewing of Masters' theses.

The procedures of SP design, implementation and monitoring are student centered. The students are actively involved at all stages of SP's implementation, both individually (completing individual work plans, designing their own learning path; choosing work placement; choosing a form of study; participation in surveys about the quality of the study process, disciplines, teachers, etc.) and collectively (working in the self-regulated Student Union). The students' participation in the life cycle of a SP is regulated by normative documents which are in the open access on the University website.

The SP is also implemented in the part-time form with the use of distance education technologies which expands opportunities for students with special needs.

The applied mechanisms and procedures clearly define the requirements for the consideration of professional requirements and external evaluation when developing, approving and monitoring the SP. During the 2015-2016 academic year, under the guidance of new regulations, the syllabus and curriculum of the programme have been completely revised and adapted to the new requirements of FSES and PS.

CRITERION 1. There are clear criteria against which academic programmes are assessed in the programme approval, monitoring and review process.

Compliance with the criterion: **full compliance**

VolgaTech has developed and introduced Guidelines on the quality management in PSTU which describes the mechanism of designing, implementing and reviewing study programmes. The mechanism includes obligatory review which is conducted by both the methodological committee of the Faculty and public and professional expert council. The

criteria against which an academic programme is assessed at each stage of its lifecycle are clearly set.

CRITERION 2. The roles and responsibilities for programme design, development, approval and monitoring are clearly articulated.

Compliance with the criterion: **full compliance**

The Guidelines for academic programme development describe the roles and responsibilities of people involved at each stage of the academic programme cycle.

CRITERION 3. Students are involved in programme design and in the processes of programme development, approval, monitoring and review

Compliance with the criterion: **partial compliance**

Students are actively involved in all life cycles of the study programme's implementation both individually (by way of filling out individual plans, thus choosing their own learning path; choosing work placement and mode of study; participating in satisfaction surveys on the academic process, subjects, teachers, etc.) and collectively through the participation in the student self-governing Student Union. Students' involvement is coordinated and monitored according to a number of regulatory documents. The documents are available on the University internal portal.

CRITERION 4. There are effective policies which ensure that the academic standards for credit and awards are rigorously maintained at the appropriate level, and that student performance is judged against these standards.

Compliance with the criterion: **substantial compliance**

The university has developed and implemented a module rating technology 'RITM', which provides a fair assessment of students' academic progress, encourages regular quality work during the academic year and effectively organizes their independent work. Assessment criteria (positive threshold) are set for each course separately; they are written in the course syllabus and defined in the technological maps. The Master Degree is awarded on condition of successful acquisition of intended competencies of all study disciplines and public defense of

graduation thesis. The requirements to graduation theses are developed by the Department of Management and Law, and they are accessible. Clear and guarantee a high standard of graduates' training.

CRITERION 5. There are clear and effective policies and processes for assessing the recognition of prior learning and supporting student mobility between courses of study and institutions.

Compliance with the criterion: **substantial compliance**

The University has developed and implemented some mechanisms regulating the student mobility: 1) between the levels of education (Bachelor - Master - Post graduate); 2) within the study programme (full-time, part-time); 3) within the educational institution (between study programmes); 4) between educational institutions (a different educational institution, including those from abroad). The policies and procedures that pre-define the student life-cycle are clearly described and publicly available on the university webpage.

CRITERION 6. Knowledge of professional standards/requirements and external expertise (e.g., from subject experts, employers and professional associations) is used to inform the design, development, approval and monitoring of academic programmes.

Compliance with the criterion: **substantial compliance**

VolgaTech has a set of regulations ensuring that professional standards and external expertise are used for academic programme design, development, approval and monitoring: 1) The Guidelines on developing new academic programmes of higher education emphasized the importance of consideration of the professional standards requirements; it introduced a new tool - 'competence-based model of a graduate', that effectively shows the compliance of an academic programme aims and objectives with requirements of the relevant OS and FSES. 2) Regulation on Public Expert Councils proposed more intensive involvement of external stakeholders into academic programme development and approval; 3) Regulation on academic programme of HE description introduced an important mechanism for collecting and analyzing external stakeholders' feedback. There is an obligatory supplement "The Competency Passport of a Graduate", where the significance of competency is determined by employer survey.

CRITERION 7. There are appropriate arrangements to train and support academic and professional/administrative staff, who are involved in the design, delivery, approval and monitoring of academic programmes.

Compliance with the criterion: **full compliance**

According to the Regulations on Qualification Enhancement of teaching and support staff the teachers have to take further education programmes once every three years. The university provides organizational and financial support for qualification enhancement in leading universities, institutes for qualification enhancement, inter-regional centers for lifelong learning, professional organizations, enterprises, business centers, foreign HEIs, etc. Alternatively, there is an Institute for LLL at the Volga Tech that offers various short (less than 16 hours) and longer programmes contributing into professional/administrative/management growth.

CRITERION 8. There are clear policies and processes in place to ensure the integrity of student assessment (e.g., though marking schemes, moderation processes, examination board regulations), and the effectiveness of these policies is regularly reviewed.

Compliance with the criterion: **full compliance**

VolgaTech has introduced Regulations on formative and summative assessment of students. The document regulates the forms and norms for monitoring the quality of students' progression through implementing the appropriate assessment methods. Another document ensuring the integrity of assessing students' achievements is Regulation on examination board (for the final state certification). This document sets requirements for graduation thesis, forms of final state attestation, the composition of the state examining board, and the appeals procedure. It is required that that the chair of an examination board is always a person who is not associate member of Volga Tech, and officially not connected to the university. The effectiveness of such regulations is annually reviewed. The revised regulations are approved by the Academic Council.

CRITERION 9. The policies and processes of programme design, development, approval and monitoring are regularly reviewed in order to ensure the effectiveness and continuous enhancement of current practices.

Compliance with the criterion: **full compliance**

The University has introduced a quality management system based on ISO 9001:2008 «Quality Management System. Requirements», and «Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area» (ESG-ENQA). VolgaTech constantly enhances the effectiveness of quality management system through the use of the quality policy, quality objectives, the results of internal audits, data analysis, corrective and preventive measures, and the analysis conducted by the university management.

CRITERION 10. There are effective policies in place to ensure that staff appointed to teach and support student learning on academic programmes are appropriately qualified, and that delivery of the programmes is supported by the appropriate learning resources.

Compliance with the criterion: **substantial compliance**

The Regulation on Academic Programme of Higher Education set out clear requirements to the quality of the teaching staff responsible for the implementation of the Master's programme: education; research and publication activity. The information about material and technical resources is also a necessary requirement. The study programme undergoes a regular procedure of internal and external review, which ensures its compliance to all requirements.

STANDARD 2. AREAS FOR IMPROVEMENT

1. It is necessary to include a procedure of a comparative analysis of the quality assurance system with similar systems of leading Russian and foreign Universities in order to enhance the mechanisms and procedures of learning outcomes alignment with the labour market requirements.
2. Students should be more involved in quality assurance procedures.
3. It is recommended to consider establishing an association of the alumni at the Faculty (Department) and involve them in career advice activity, extracurricular events and other forms of support of the study programme.
4. An external evaluation should be carried out when developing the curriculum and conducting self-evaluation of the study programme. It is also recommended to carry out external testing of student learning outcomes, benchmarking and to involve other stakeholders.
5. It is necessary to enhance students' involvement in the quality assurance processes at the stage of developing and approving the study programme.
6. It is recommended to work out a system of recognition of informal learning in cooperation with local employers and part-time students.
7. It is necessary to improve the system of informing students about the results of conducted surveys and to include more open-type questions in the questionnaires for students and other stakeholders, e.g., employers.
8. It is recommended to improve interaction with other faculties.

CONCLUSION OF THE EXTERNAL REVIEW PANEL

Standard	Criterion	Compliance with the criterion	Compliance with the standard
Standard 1	1.1	partial	substantial
	1.2	substantial	
	1.3	substantial	
	1.4	substantial	
	1.5	full	
	1.6	substantial	
	1.7	substantial	
	1.8	substantial	
	1.9	full	
	1.10	partial	
Standard 2	2.1	full	substantial
	2.2	full	
	2.3	partial	
	2.4	substantial	
	2.5	substantial	
	2.6	substantial	
	2.7	full	
	2.8	full	
	2.9	full	
	2.10	substantial	

The External Evaluation Panel recommends that the National Accreditation Board **accredit the Master's degree study programme 27.04.02 'Quality Management in Agriculture and Food Industry' delivered by the Volga State University of Technology for the period of 6 years.**

PROGRAMME OF PEER REVIEW PANEL SITE VISIT

Time	Activity	Participants	Venue
June 24, Friday			
8.30	Meeting at the hotel lobby (Alexey Fominykh)		<i>Ludovico Moro</i> hotel
08.45	Arrival at Volga Tech (building 1)		Room 406
09.00 – 10.50	Private meeting of the Panel		ауд. 406, 1 корпус
10.50-11.00	Coffee break	Peer Review Panel	
11.00 – 12.00	Meeting with Volga Tech representatives responsible for the AP (Review of the alignment of the AP)	Peer Review Panel, ALIGN project team at Volga Tech	Room 406
12.00 – 13.00	Lunch		<i>Tarelka</i> restaurant
13.00 – 16.00	Meeting with 2 AP Working Groups (review of the alignment of the AP)	Peer Review Panel, 2 Academic Programmes Working Groups	Room 406
16.00 – 16.15	Coffee break	Peer Review Panel	Hall of the 4 th floor
16.15 – 19.15	Meeting with Volga Tech representatives responsible for the AP (Review of Quality Assurance Alignment)	Peer Review Panel, representatives of Volga Tech Academic Department, Department of Licensing and Accreditation, Center for Quality Management	Room 406
20.00	Dinner		<i>Ludovico Moro</i> restaurant

Time	Activity	Participants	Venue
June 25, Saturday			
09.00	Arrival at Volga Tech (building 1)		
09.00 – 10.00	Meeting with students and graduates of 2 academic programmes	Peer Review Panel, students, graduates	Room 406
10.00 – 10.50	Private meeting of the Panel	Peer Review Panel	Room 406
10.50-11.00	Coffee break	Peer Review Panel	Hall of the 4 th floor
11.00 – 12.00	Closing meeting on the ALIGN Project results	Peer Review Panel, 2 Academic Programmes Working Groups	Room 406
12.00 – 13.00	Work with check-lists	Peer Review Panel, 2 Academic Programmes Working Groups	Room 406
13.00 – 14.00	Lunch		<i>Chashka</i> restaurant
14.00	Departure		