





ON EXTERNAL REVIEW

of the educational programme

«Information Systems and Technologies» (09.03.02)

delivered by Vladivostok State University of Economics and Service

Vladivostok, 2019

REPORT ON EXTERNAL REVIEW

of the educational programme

«Information Systems and Technologies» (09.03.02)

delivered by Vladivostok State University of Economics and Service

The Chair of the Review Panel

Zang Binyu Bwg

Vladivostok, 2019

CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION	4
1. CONTEXT AND MAIN STAGES OF THE REVIEW	4
 1.1 Terms of Reference	4 5
2. DESCRIPTION OF THE STUDY PROGRAMME	9
3. FINDINGS	0
3.1 Standard 1. Policy (goals, development strategy) and quality assurance procedures of a study programme	12 357 90 1 2
4. RECOMMENDATIONS FOR IMPROVEMENT24	
5. CONCLUSION	6
ANNEX A2	7
ANNEX Б29	9
ANNEX B	1

External review of the educational programme «Information Systems and Technologies» (09.03.02) delivered by Vladivostok State University of Economics and Service (hereinafter - VSUES) was conducted on May 21-23, 2019 and included the analyses of self-evaluation report, site visit and preparation of the present report.

The main goal of the external review is to determine the correspondence of the reviewed educational programme «Information Systems and Technologies» (09.03.02) delivered by Vladivostok State University of Economics and Service to standards and criteria of public accreditation, which are developed by the National Centre for Public Accreditation (hereinafter -NCPA) and determined in compliance with the European Standards of Quality Assurance in Education ESG-ENQA.

The Final Report is the reason for decision of the National Accreditation Board on public accreditation of the study programmes in compliance with standards and criteria of NCPA.

1. CONTEXT AND MAIN STAGES OF THE REVIEW

1.1 Terms of Reference

According to item 1, 3 article 96 of the Federal Law of the Russian Federation of December 29, 20123 N.273-FZ "On education in the Russian Federation" organizations, which implement educational activities, may apply for public accreditation in various national, foreign and international institutions; employers, employer associations and designated organizations have the right to conduct public accreditation of professional educational programmes, which are delivered by an educational institution.

In order to conduct public accreditation of the educational programme «Information Systems and Technologies» (09.03.02) Vladivostok State University of Economics and Service applied to NCPA, which operates on the national level and is recognized by leading international organizations of quality assurance in higher education.

1.2 Composition of the Review Panel

The international experts were nominated by foreign quality assurance agencies upon NCPA's request.

The Russian expert was nominated by the Guild of Experts in Higher Education.

The employer representative was nominated by the company « Sozvezdie » (Vladivostok).

The representative of the students' community was suggested by Far Eastern federal University.

The composition of the External Review Panel was approved by NCPA. The Review Panel included five international and national experts:

 Zang Binyu - Doctor, Professor, School of Software, Shanghai Jiaotong University, member of the Software Engineering Discipline Review Group of the Academic Degrees Committee of the State Council of China — Review Chair, foreign expert;

- **Rimma Akhmetsafina** Candidate of Engineering Sciences, Associate Professor, Deputy Head of the Department of Software Engineering, Faculty of Computer Science, Head of the Internships and Projects Centre, National Research University Higher School of Economics, member of the Guild of Experts in Higher Education — Deputy Review Chair, Russian expert;
- Guo Yuchun Doctor, Professor, School of Electronics and Information, Beijing Jiaotong University, member of the Institute of Electrical and Electronics Engineers (IEEE), member of the Institute of Electronics, Information and Communication Engineers (IEICE) — Panel member, foreign expert;
- **Sergei Moiseev** Candidate of Engineering Sciences, Associate Professor, Director General of the company «Sozvezdie» Panel member, representative of professional community;
- **Dmitrii Kapitan** 4th year student, field of study «Information Systems and Technologies», School of Natural Sciences, Far Eastern Federal University Panel member, representative of students;

The focused expert knowledge of the Panel members, long-term experience of working in the system of higher education and profession, active position of students and employers became the basis for effective consideration of issues within the framework of evaluation.

The participation of the Russian representatives of the higher education system gave an opportunity to analyze the activity of the programmes under evaluation in the context of the world trends in quality assurance and within the scope of the national educational system.

1.3 Purposes and objectives of the review

The purpose of the public accreditation is improving quality of education and forming quality culture in educational institutions, discovering best practices in continuous enhancing the educational quality and public information on educational institutions in accordance with the European educational quality standards.

The main goal of the peer review is to determine the correspondence of the reviewed educational programme «Information Systems and Technologies» (09.03.02) delivered by Vladivostok State University of Economics and Service to standards and criteria of public accreditation, which are developed by NCPA and determined in compliance with the European Standards of Quality Assurance in Education ESG-ENQA; and to develop recommendations for the study programme with the purpose of improving the contents and structure of the study process.

1.4 Stages of the review

The review included three main stages:

1.4.1 Study of the self-evaluation report

Vladivostok State University of Economics and Service was responsible for conducting the self-evaluation procedure, developing and timely submitting of the self-evaluation report to NCPA. According to the "Guidelines on Self-evaluation of Educational Programmes", which were developed by NCPA, the self-evaluation report is written on **82** pages and includes: introduction, findings, conclusions, annexes. The self-evaluation procedure was conducted on the basis of SWOT-analysis according to every standard of NCPA.

According to the review schedule the self-evaluation report of the educational programme «Information systems and Technologies» (09.03.02) was submitted to NCPA and mailed to the members of the review panel 30 days before the site-visit.

While studying the self-evaluation report the panel members formed a preliminary opinion about the reviewed educational programmes on compliance with the NCPA standards and criteria on accreditation and with the European standards of education quality.

The members of the review panel assessed the quality of preparation of the self-evaluation report with regards to its text structuring, compliance of information with the report's sections; quality of perception; sufficiency of analytical data; availability of references to supporting documents; completeness of information. It provided the experts with an opportunity to form a preliminary opinion.

The review panel members pointed out some weaknesses of the selfevaluation report:

- Some of the report's sections contain information about the University as a whole, but do not contain information about the educational programme.
- The content of the sections does not always correspond to NCPA's standards.

Due to the results of the panel's preliminary work, the following conclusions were made:

During the site-visit the External Review Panel needs to review the documents of the educational programme, regulatory documents of the University, development programme of the Institute, organization of project activities, etc.

According to NCPA's standards and criteria of accreditation the preliminary assessment of the educational programme «Information Systems and Technologies» (09.03.02) may be defined as **partial compliance**.

Issues, which need detailed analyses:

- 1. Does the educational programme have contacts with Russian and foreign universities? Does the University involve teachers from leading universities to deliver lectures, mini-courses, workshops?
- 2. Data on students' mobility
- 3. Organization of the systematic monitoring of infrastructure, quality of the educational programme and certain disciplines, teachers, satisfaction with the programme's selection. Conducting regular surveys of graduates and teachers, analysis of the results and information of all stakeholders.
- 4. How commercial activities of the Institute are organized? What are the extrabudgetary resources?
- 5. Is an accessible environment for people with disabilities created? How the educational programme is adapted for people with disabilities?

- 6. How project activities and practice-oriented learning are organized? How innovative approaches to training with the account of the business and market requirements are employed?
- 7. Do employers participate in discussion and design of the educational programme, support and development of the educational process?
- 8. Competitive ability of the graduates on the labour market. Is relevance of learning outcomes and competences proved in practice?

At the preliminary meeting members of the review panel formulated the lines of inquiry, which defined the main strategy of the site-visit.

1.4.2 Site-visit

The review panel visited Vladivostok State University of Economics and Service on May 21-23, 2019 with the purpose of confirming the authenticity of the information, which was presented in the self-evaluation report, collecting extra information on the implementation of the accredited programme and checking its compliance with the standards and criteria of NCPA developed in accordance with the European standards of education quality assurance.

The time line and the agenda of the site-visit were determined by NCPA, and approved by the administration of Vladivostok State University of Economics and Service and the members of the review panel.

During the site-visit the review board members conducted a number of meetings and interviews with the University administration, Rector's advisor, Heads of Departments and staff, students, graduates and representatives of the professional community.

The Chair of the review panel managed the panel's work.

The panel considers that the self-evaluation report, which was presented by VSUES, provided the experts with an opportunity to form an integral view on specific features of implementation of the reviewed educational programme «Information Systems and Technologies» (09.03.02).

The studied documents and the interviewed persons, visits to the museum, library, sports centre, Deans' Office, Institute of Information Technologies (ИИТ), Department of Information Technologies and Systems (ИТС), laboratories and computer classes provided the review panel members with sufficient information about quality and prospectives of the educational programmes and introduction of project activities.

The review panel considers it necessary to highlight the effective cooperation of the experts and NCPA employees during the site-visit and its preparation.

The review panel notes the highest level of organizational provision and constructive work.

The executive staff of Vladivostok State University of Economics and Service provided the administrative support, which included arrangement of meetings and interviews, provision with working space, computers with an access to the Internet, necessary research, academic and methodological documents.

During the site-visit the review panel members requested additional documents.

On the last day of the site-visit the Chair of the review panel presented an oral report on the general conclusions to the executive staff of the University, Institute Directors, teachers and students. The agenda of the site-visit can be found in the Annex.

1.4.3 Conclusion on the findings of the external review

Based on the results of the external review of Vladivostok State University of Economics and Service the review panel submitted the Report on the results of the external review of the educational programme «Information Systems and Technologies» (09.03.02) delivered by the educational institution.

The draft report of **27** pages excluding Annexes was developed by the Chair of the Review Panel, approved by other Review panel members and submitted to the National Centre for Public Accreditation. Then the Report was mailed to the University's administration for making factual amendments.

2. DESCRIPTION OF THE STUDY PROGRAMME

Federal State Budgetary Educational Institution of Higher Education «Vladivostok State University of Economics and Service» (VSUES) (license №1799 of December 07, 2015) was established to deliver educational services on implementation of educational programmes of different types of education, professions, fields of study, research, social and cultural functions. The Russian Federation is a founder of the University. Functions and powers of the founder are exercised by the Ministry of Science and Higher Education of the Russian Federation.

Vladivostok State University of Economics and Service was founded in 1967, when the government of RSFSR decided to open Far Eastern Institute of Technology (FEIT). In 1995 it was included in the system of the Russian Federation State Committee on Higher Education and was renamed as Far Eastern State Institute of Technology (FESIT). In 1996 it was awarded the status of a university and became Vladivostok State University of Economics and Service (VSUES).

The Bachelor's degree programme 09.03.02 «Information Systems and Technologies» is delivered at the Institute of Information Technologies (ИИТ, Karina Shakhgeldyan, Director, Doctor of Engineering Sciences); the degree-awarding Department is the Department of Information Technologies and Systems (ИТС, Elena Kiikova, Head of the Department, Candidate of Economic Sciences, Associate Professor).

Mode of Study	Source of financing	Number, people
09.03.02 «Information	Systems and Technologies»,	, Bachelor's degree
full-time	state-financed studies	102
Tull-time	contract-based studies	46
part-time	state-financed studies	0
part-time	contract-based studies	99
on-site and off-site	state-financed studies	0
on-site and on-site	contract-based studies	14
Total		261

Present student cohort is presented in the table:

Facilities for practical training are the following: LLC "Yunigreid", training centre «Alter», PJSC «Mobile TeleSystems» (MTC), LLC «Ronda SoftWare", PJSC «Rostelecom», LLC «Sozvezdie», «Imperia Mebeli», LLC «VladSoft», LLC «Russian Fishery Company», PJSC «Primorie», Agency on Developing Human Capital in the Far East, LLC «Unilab-Vladivostok», LLC «Aiterra», LLC «Farpost», development company «MyTona», LLC «Centre of Urination Pathologies», LLC «Olympic-Trans», LLC «Expert-Nauka», LLC «Alians Telecom», LLC «Rosintellect Service», PJSC «Far Eastern Bank», LLC «Sofus»

Facilities of graduates' employability: PC «Izumrud», LLC «ASU-Consulting», LLC «Farpost», LLC «Russian Fishery Company», PJSC «Primorie», Agency on Developing Human Capital in the Far East, «Amaiama Auto», LLC «Farpost Development», LLC «Unilab-Vladivostok», PJSC «Mobile TeleSystems» (MTC), LLC «Ronda SoftWare», LLC «Aiterra»

3. FINDINGS

3.1 Standard 1. Policy (goals, development strategy) and quality assurance procedures of a study programme

Compliance with the standard: substantial compliance

Table 1 - Criteria to Standard 1

N⁰	Subject of Evaluation	Mark
1.	Availability of a documented inner quality assurance system providing continuous enhancement of quality in accordance with the developmental strategy of the educational institution	A
2.	Participation of all stakeholders (administration, teaching staff, students, employers, employer associations, branch ministries and departments – key partners in employment of graduates) in developing and implementing a quality assurance policy through relevant structures and processes	С
3.	Participation of all structural units of an educational institution in quality assurance processes and procedures	В

Analysis of the educational programmes' compliance with the standard:

The quality assurance policy is carried out with the help of the procedures for the development and approval of internal standards of VSUES. The procedural instruction «Identification, Structure and Design of VSUES Internal Standards (SK-STO-MI-28-001-2012)» is developed. The internal standards are available in the corporate information environment in the section «The VSUES Reference and Regulatory Documents». A number of documents is available on the main page of the website «Information about the Educational Organization» and on the websites of structural subdivisions in the section «Official Documents». The effectiveness of the implementation and monitoring of the quality assurance policy of the degree programme is carried out as a part of the annual self-evaluation. The reports on the results of self-evaluation are published on the VSUES website.

In 2018 the Development strategy of the University containing the goals and objectives of the quality assurance policy was developed.

Regular internal and external audits of the implementation of the quality assurance policy are conducted. The University has established the Start-Career Regional Center to involve key employers.

Achievements:

- The University has the documented quality assurance policy.
- The Development strategy of the University till 2023 is in place.

Recommendations:

• The University should efficiently involve teachers, students and employers in the development and introduction of the quality assurance policy and the development strategy of the University and Institute.

• The Institute Development programme should be designed and published on the basis of the University Development programme.

• The University should develop metrics for the evaluation of the Institute Development programme.

3.2 Standard 2. Design and approval of programmes

Compliance with the standard: substantial compliance

Table 2 - Criteria to Standard 2

N⁰	Subject of Evaluation	Mark
1.	Availability and accessibility of clearly defined, documented, approved and published goals and objectives of a study programme and expected learning outcomes and their correspondence to the mission and goals and objectives of the educational institution	A
2.	Availability of procedures for design, approval and revision of a study programme (including expected learning outcomes) with the account of the development of science and industry, and also with the consideration of stakeholder opinions (administration, teaching staff, students, employers)	В
3.	Consideration of the requirements of professional standards (if available), of labour market, of national qualification framework descriptors in the study programme	В

Analysis of the educational programmes' compliance with the standard:

The educational programme «Information Systems and Technologies» contains goals and expected learning outcomes that correspond to the VSUES mission, development strategy and goals. The development of the educational programme is regulated and annually updated in relation to the general description of the educational programme, working programmes, programmes of practical training, teaching materials with the account of the latest developments in science, engineering, culture, economy, technologies and social sector. The educational programme is discussed at the meetings of the Department; it is reviewed by employers and approved by the Academic Council of the University. When developing the programme, the requirements of the professional standards «Programmer», «Software Test Engineer», «IT System Technician» are taken into account.

Achievements:

• The educational programme is approved and publically available; it contains the goals, expected learning outcomes, etc.

• The procedure for the development and renewal of the educational programme is approved.

• The applied Bachelor-degree educational programme makes good effort on practice-based training.

Recommendations:

• The University should develop the procedures for the involvement of all stakeholders (teachers, students, employers) in the development and correction of the educational programme.

• The development of science and industry should be taken into account when developing the educational programme.

• The requirements of the professional standard "Software Test Engineer" (approved by the Ministry of Labour of the Russian Federation Order No 225H of 11 April 2014) should be fully taken into account when developing the educational programme.

3.3 Standard 3. Student-centred learning, teaching and assessment

Compliance with the standard: substantial compliance

Table 3 - Criteria to Standard 3

N⁰	Subject of Evaluation	Mark
1.	Consideration of needs of diverse groups of students and a possibility to create individual learning paths	В
2.	Use of methods encouraging students to take an active part in creating the learning process	В
3.	Use of clearly defined criteria and objective assessment procedures of learning outcomes/ competences of students corresponding to the expected learning outcomes, goals of the study programme and their purpose (diagnostic, formative or summative assessment)	В
4.	Information about the study programme, criteria and procedures for assessment of learning outcomes/competencies, about examinations, tests and other types of control.	А
5.	Use of procedures of independent assessment of learning outcomes	В
6.	Availability and effectiveness of appeals procedure and procedures for dealing with students complaints	В

Analysis of the educational programmes' compliance with the standard:

The students have a possibility to choose disciplines and online courses from the list of recommended courses and make an individual curriculum. They also can choose and suggest the topics for course and graduation works and facilities for practical training.

The University supports and uses information systems LMS Moodle, a student personal account, digital learning materials database, Interactive students testing system (CИTO), and webinars service. It allows the University to carry out the Final State Examination remotely and to make the educational process available for students with disabilities. The student e-portfolio is made and is available to be accessed on the University website.

VSUES adopts a new model of training, the practice-based approach to education, in that senior students combine studies with internship work corresponding to the field of study.

The mechanisms of feedback from students are developed. Questionnaires and surveys of students are regularly conducted to evaluate their satisfaction with the quality and delivery of the educational programme.

The documents regulating the forms, periodicity and procedure of the on-going monitoring of academic progress, interim and final assessment of students are developed: CK-CTO-ΠΟ-04-1.114-2017, CK-CTO-ΠΟ-04-1.122-2016, CK-CTO-ΠΟ-04-1.106-2017. They are available on the University website.

A competence-based model of a graduate and pools of assessment tools are developed; a point rating system of students' evaluation is used.

The VSUES portal contains the reports on evaluating quality of the educational process organization and students' academic progress.

The elements of WorldSkills are introduced in the educational process. Intentional learning is carried out (for the company «Izumrud»).

Various channels for information of students about the regulatory documents, academic progress, educational process, practical training, etc. are used.

Students' appeals and complaints are considered in due course.

Achievements:

• The University has the documents regulating all aspects of the educational process.

• The University has a wide range of information systems to carry out and support the educational process.

• The practice-based approach to education is used in the applied Bachelor's programme.

• The surveys of students on the quality of teaching are regularly conducted.

• A point-rating system is used for the evaluation of students' learning outcomes.

Recommendations:

• The results of students' surveys should be taken into account when designing the educational programme, curricula and holding competitions for teachers.

• The system for evaluation of students' competences should be developed.

• The number of elective disciplines should be increased with the account of the market demands and modern technologies.

• The mechanisms of external quality evaluation of the pools for assessment tools should be used; test materials developed for different monitoring forms should be certified.

• The University should extend cooperation with companies for students' practical training and project activities.

3.4 Standard 4. Student admission, support of academic achievements and graduation

Compliance with the standard: substantial compliance

 Table 4 - Criteria to Standard 4

N⁰	Subject of Evaluation	Mark
1.	Systematic carrier guidance work targeted at the recruiting and selection of applicants should be in place	А
2.	Availability and effectiveness of rules and regulations for admission, transfer of students from other educational institutions, recognition of qualifications, periods of study and prior learning	А
3.	Systematic work to support students' progression	В
4.	Recognition of higher education qualifications obtained in the RF and abroad (Diploma Supplement)	В
5.	Participation of students in mobility programmes	С

Analysis of the educational programmes' compliance with the standard:

The University has in place the Abiturient Center which is aimed at finding and attracting the most talented applicants. The Center assists in holding Open House days, regional and interregional academic contests for school children, regional rounds of academic Olympiads, career guidance activities at local schools.

The Institute of Information Technologies has established a Wodigy IT school. This school offers a variety of courses in programming for school students. The school enjoys popularity among students.

The Department of Information Technology and Systems pays due attention to student enrollment and conducts ISFIT Regional Competition (Information Society Functions on Information Technologies) - the Olympiad in computer science.

The entry standard for the programme increases every year. The information is available on the University website.

VSUES has developed local regulations governing student admission, transfer from other educational institutions and other issues. A special attestation committee comprising the leading teachings staff members of the Department is established every year to consider the issues related to student transfer to the programme. There is a procedure for organizing training in accelerated time period.

VSUES rating system of students' academic progress evaluation was developed in order to monitor and support students' academic progress and achievements. Student office and group curators are responsible for this procedure.

Students actively participate in national and international Olympiads, hackathons, competitions. Students are involved in research project implementation (in 2017 there were 4 projects, 13 student participants; in 2018 there were 3 projects and 15 student participants).

Provided students have high entrance grades and exceptional achievements in academic, research, social, cultural and sport activities, they may compete for an increased national academic scholarship and a universitysponsored personal scholarship of VSUES. Students enrolled in Information Systems and Technologies also compete for the scholarship of the President and the Government of the Russian Federation, personal scholarships awarded by the Ministry of Science and Higher Educational. The information on competitions and scholarship opportunities is available on the University website.

European Diploma Supplements are issued upon request. There is no information on recognition of academic certificates abroad.

The University has in place regulatory documents on student academic mobility, agreements on cooperation with 65 partners from 16 countries, 23 students' joint and exchange programmes, 6 double-degree programmes. Unfortunately, most programmes aim to train students in languages. Over the past 2 years only one student completed the study programme at a HEI in Greece.

International students are enrolled in Information Systems and Technologies Programmes (4 students from Uzbekistan, 1 student from Congo, 1 student from Laos).

Achievements:

• There is systemic enrollment work – open house days, courses for school students, excursions to the laboratory facilities of the University, student and teacher presentations at local secondary schools.

• The University organizes an IT Olympiad for enrollees, regional and interregional Olympiads for school students, regional rounds of national academic olympiads.

• Students enrolled in the programmes take part in national and international Olympiads and hackatons, Federal Internet examination for bachelor students, project work, Worldskills contests.

• Admission rules for national and international students as well as recognition of study periods and prior education is regulated by the local regulatory acts.

Recommendations:

• It is recommended to provide students with incentives to foster their involvement in research and academic schools (winter school, summer school ...) conducted by educational institutions, IT companies in Russia and abroad, conferences, seminars, etc.

• It is advisable to increase inbound and outbound national and international academic mobility of students.

• It is recommended to select students for academic mobility and offer them enrollment in field-specific study programmes at a HEI abroad.

• It is necessary to develop the system of recognition of courses completed at a foreign partner university.

3.5 Standard 5. Teaching staff

Compliance with the standard: full compliance

Table 5 - Criteria to Standard 5

N⁰	Subject of Evaluation	Mark
1.	 Qualification and competence of the teaching staff : Academic degrees and titles; Industry and state awards and prizes; Practical experience; Published text books, handbooks and methodological guidebooks 	A
2.	Relevance of specialists, degrees and titles and /or practical experience to the profile of the study programme	А
3.	Research activity of the teaching staff, implementation of research results in the academic process	В
4.	Use of innovative teaching methods and advanced technologies	А
5.	Visiting lecturers from other educational institutions including those from abroad	А
6.	Participation of the teachers in joint international projects, internships abroad, academic mobility programmes	В
7.	A system of financial and non-financial incentives for teachers	А
8.	 Availability and use of clear, transparent and objective criteria for: Hiring staff including teachers from foreign educational institutions, assignment to positions, promotion, dismissal; Dismissal of teachers with low level of professional competency 	A
9.	A system for career development and professional advancement for teachers	А

Analysis of the educational programmes' compliance with the standard:

Fifty-one members of the teaching staff are involved in the programme delivery. 74.5% are employed full-time, 64.52% hold academic degrees or titles, 12.4% are practitioners. Nearly all teachers have degrees in the relevant fields of study. Eleven representatives from the industry with over 3-year experience in the field are involved in the programme delivery.

The teaching load dynamics shows that total teaching load of the department staff has been gradually going down as well as teaching load per faculty member (in 2015-2016 academic year there were 20 permanent academic staff, in 2018-2019 - 15 permanent academic staff) and the total teaching load (in 2015-2016 – 23,304 teaching hours, in 2018-2019 academic year– 17,090 teaching hours).

Over the last four years the department staff have produced 8 monographs, over 140 articles, including 70 articles published in academic journals listed in Russian Science Citation Index (RSCI) database and 48 articles published in academic journals included in WoS μ Scopus databases.

Unfortunately, during the past four years there has been a decrease in the number of publications produced by the staff members.

Over the last four years both the teaching staff and students majoring in Information Systems and Technologies were engaged in 2 research projects supported by RFBR grants and carried out 15 research projects. The research results are introduced in the academic process, the content of the courses and the programme is revised and updated. Thus, in 2017-2018 academic year the content of the courses in Business Process Modeling, Information Systems Design, Enterprise IT Infrastructure has been revised and updated.

From 2015 to 2019 academic and research staff of the department obtained 5 patents and 16 state registration certificates of software and databases. Three applications for inventions, 3 utility models, 2 industrial designs, 15 software applications are still under consideration.

Advanced technologies and e-resources are actively introduced in the academic process. In order to support quality teaching, 18 online courses based on the LMS platform have been designed. Faculty Performance Rating System evaluates the performance of the faculty. The system includes a number of indicators which evaluate the use of e-learning tools in teaching.

The academic staff of the Department can update their qualification by attending professional development courses offered by VSUES, National University of Science and Technology, Moscow Institute Of Physics And Technology. The teaching staff can also develop and use online courses' designed in the framework of Lektorium project.

Specialists from the Far Eastern Branch of the Russian Academy of Science, practitioners and employers are involved in the programme delivery. Unfortunately, there are almost no teachers from the leading HEIs in Russia and abroad.

The teaching staff of the Department closely cooperate with their foreign partners by conducting joint conferences, Olympiads and lectures. In 2015 the members of the teaching staff of the Department delivered two courses and in 2018 conducted classes in 3 courses at Heilongjiang Bayi Agricultural University(Daqing, China).

The University has in place the system of financial and non-financial incentives for teachers and support measures for former employees (retirees).

The recruitment of the teaching staff is based on open competition. The decision is taken by a specially established Faculty Appointments Advisory Committee. Teaching and non-teaching staff should meet certain requirements set by the university, i.e. results of faculty performance rating. The procedure is well-documented.

There are the procedures for academic staff professional development.

Achievements:

• There are documented procedures and clear criteria for teaching staff recruitment.

• There is a system of financial and non-financial incentives for teachers.

• The teaching staff undergo internships at IT enterprises of the region.

• There are grant-supported research projects.

• The academic resources are regularly updated to include the most recent research outcomes.

• The members of the teaching staff register intellectual property rights on their inventions.

Recommendations:

• It is necessary to increase the number of publications produced by the teaching staff of the Department.

• It is advisable to develop international cooperation and involve the members of the teaching staff in international projects.

• It is recommended to foster inbound and outbound academic mobility of the teaching staff. For example, engage visiting lecturers from the leading HEIs of Russia and abroad to deliver lectures, short courses, workshops, etc. It is advisable to employ on-line communication technology to deliver lectures, workshops, etc., by the members of the teaching staff outside VSUES.

• It is recommended to update the content of academic courses and complement it with the most recent research results.

3.6 Standard 6. Learning resources and student support

Compliance with the standard: full compliance

Table 6 - Criteria to Standard 6

N⁰	Subject of Evaluation	Mark
1.	Provision of the study programme with material and technical recourses in accordance with the requirements of the curriculum (modern tools, equipment, computers, classrooms, laboratories)	А
2.	Availability of up-to-date library and information resources including those for independent study and research work	А
3.	Availability of infrastructure to ensure access to quality education to students with different opportunities and of different age, and to provide the development of social and educational component of the academic process	А
4.	The system of feedback on the satisfaction with conditions and organization of the study process should be in place	В
5.	Availability of accessible information about opportunities for student mobility and its support system	В

Analysis of the educational programmes' compliance with the standard:

The facilities and resources of the university are regularly updated.

All lecture rooms of the buildings are equipped with up-to-date multimedia systems A few classrooms are equipped with videoconferencing facilities.

The university premises and dormitories provide wi-fi access to the Internet.

The University has a Resource Information and Analytical Center, where students get access to e-learning resources: e-library and learning management systems. Student use these resources to do their research and course projects and prepare graduation theses. E-resources and services of the Center are available from all the premises of the library and from all the computers connected to intranet. Students registered on the University internet Portal can also access the library resources from remote computers.

The University is a unique complex of buildings and facilities with a developed campus infrastructure, including dormitories and a hotel, sports facilities, a medical center, a network of canteens and cafes, gyms and other facilities that provide all the conditions for living, recreating, sports and leisure activities of students and staff. Safe and convenient access of students with disabilities to the university buildings, classrooms and other facilities is provided att he University.

Different channels to collect student feedback are used. All full-time students take part in an anonymous survey once a year. There are also meetings with the rector, Institute and Department administration and student curators.

The information on the international mobility is available on the University website. There are mostly programmes in language training. Field-specific training programmes are not numerous. The same concerns information. The facilities and resources of the university are regularly updated.

All lecture rooms of the buildings are equipped with up-to-date multimedia systems A few classrooms are equipped with videoconferencing facilities.

The university premises and dormitories provide wi-fi access to the Internet.

The University has a Resource Information and Analytical Center, where students get access to e-learning resources: e-library and learning management systems. Student use these resources to do their research and course projects and prepare graduation theses. E-resources and services of the Center are available from all the premises of the library and from all the computers connected to intranet. Students registered on the University internet Portal can also access the library resources from remote computers.

The University is a unique complex of buildings and facilities with a developed campus infrastructure, including dormitories and a hotel, sports facilities, a medical center, a network of canteens and cafes, gyms and other facilities that provide all the conditions for living, recreating, sports and leisure activities of students and staff. Safe and convenient access of students with disabilities to the university buildings, classrooms and other facilities is provided att he University.

Different channels to collect student feedback are used. All full-time students take part in an anonymous survey once a year. There are also meetings with the rector, Institute and Department administration and student curators.

The information on the international mobility is available on the University website. There are mostly programmes in language training. Field-specific training programmes are not numerous. The same concerns information.

Achievements:

• VSUES provides all the necessary facilities, well-furnished classrooms and state-of-the-art laboratories to support educational process.

• The laboratory are equipped with state-of-the-art facilities used for academic and research purposes.

• There are decent conditions for student project work.

• The University has a well-developed infrastructure. There is a campus with academic buildings, sports facilities, and grounds for cultural events.

• Modern technologies and software are used in the educational process.

• Academic mobility is regulated by the act SK-STO-PL-04-1.107-2014.

Recommendations:

• It is recommended to improve the system of collecting student feedback not only related to the quality of the courses taught, but also on the conditions of studies and organization of the educational process.

• It is advisable to improve the accessibility of the environment for persons with disabilities (equip all the buildings with ramps, elevators, remove door stills, etc).

• It is advisable to publish information on academic mobility programmes in the relevant fields of study.

3.7 Standard 7. Collection, analysis and use of information for managing the educational institution

Compliance with the standard: substantial compliance

Table 7 - Criteria to Standard 7

N⁰	Subject of Evaluation	Mark
1.	Availability and effectiveness of the system for collecting and monitoring information about the study programme	В
2.	Participation of students and staff of the educational institution in collecting and analyzing information for managing the study programme	С
3.	The educational institution should have in place a unified effective information system on the basis of modern information technologies for managing the study programme	A

Analysis of the educational programmes' compliance with the standard:

VSUES has in place corporative information environment "Education Activity and Administrative Management", which is used for collecting and monitoring information about the study programme. The outcomes of the analysis are presented in reports B Π O-1 μ B Π O-2, the Self-evaluation report, the report on *Monitoring major directions of performance of a higher educational institution*. The information is used for corrective actions of the study programme.

There are annual student satisfaction surveys about the quality of education. Unfortunately, similar surveys of the teaching staff are not held.

There is an information system «E-Campus», which includes 39 subsystems and makes it possible to remotely run all educational activities, the system provides learning policy, scientific research and development, finance-

and-economy support. With its accessibility to both internal users (teaching staff and students), and external ones (graduates, students' parents, employers, schoolchildren) the CIE provides their full integrity into the University and Campus operation.

Achievements:

Availability of a developed information system for managing all spheres of University's performance.

Recommendations:

• A system for collecting and analyzing feedback from students and staff should be developed for effective management of the study programme.

• The collected information and decisions made on its basis should be made public for all stakeholders: students, teachers, supporting staff.

3.8 Standard 8. Public information

Compliance with the standard: substantial compliance

Table 8 - Criteria to Standard 8

N⁰	Subject of Evaluation	Mark
1.	Effective use of the official website of the study programme for its quality enhancement	В
2.	Publication of complete and accurate information on the study programme and its achievements on the official website of the educational institution and mass media	В
3.	Publication of objective data on the employability of graduates	В
4.	Integration in the environment, interaction of the educational institution with different professional associations and other organization including those from abroad	С

Analysis of the educational programmes' compliance with the standard:

The procedures for the University's official website maintenance are documented. With the help of website the prospective students, undergraduates, parents and employers are able to obtain the most complete and up-to-date information about the educational institution, study programmes, teachers, publications, research topics, contacts of teachers and university departments, etc.

The VSUES internal standards placed in the section "Information on the Educational Institution" are available for a wide range of users. The sites of structural subdivisions of the University also contain a special section for official documents.

The site of the Start-Career regional centre contains information of a very general character, without mentioning companies where the graduates are employed.

The ITS Department regularly organizes meetings with representatives of the companies of employers, such as, LLC Farpost IT, the Internet the WEBSEE agency, LLC Ayterra, JSC JSB Bank Primorye, the JSC Peter-Service company, "Postgres Professional", etc. As part of practice-based approach to teaching the 2nd and 3rd year students implement the projects to solve real life problems for business (under the guidance of teachers). The defense of these projects will be carried out with the participation of employers that will allow them to evaluate the skills of students at earlier stage and to offer internship, and further employment.

Achievements:

• The University site publishes complete up-to-date information about the University and the study programme under accreditation in the Russian language.

• Social networks Instagram and Facebook are used for informing the public.

• VSUES is in the 50 top Russian universities when it comes to internationalization, according to the 2018 National University Ranking (2018 NUR) published by Interfax news agency.

Recommendations:

• Full information about VSUES degree programmes under consideration should be available on the VSUES website in English and Chinese.

• More information on employment of VSUES graduates, their success stories, and interviews should be available on the website.

• Information about partner-companies and different ways of cooperation with them should be available on the web-site of the Department and the study programme.

• The programme should establish and develop connections with professional associations, such as ANKIT and international organizations.

3.9 Standard 9. On-going monitoring and periodic review of programmes

Compliance with the standard: substantial compliance

Table 9 - Criteria to Standard 9

N⁰	Subject of Evaluation	Mark
1.	Documented procedures of monitoring and periodic review of study programmes should be in place	А
2.	Availability of a feedback mechanism for students, employers, branch ministries and departments (key stakeholders in employment) in the process of monitoring and periodic review of a study programme	В
3.	Effectiveness of procedures for monitoring and periodic review of a study programme (enhancement of programmes)	В

Analysis of the educational programmes' compliance with the standard:

Regular monitoring and periodic review of the quality of the study programmes is a distinctive feature of VSUES. The study programme under accreditation (curriculum, syllabi, etc.) is reviewed and updated at least once a year to account for latest trends in technology, science and research, to employ world's best teaching practices, to ensure compliance with the laws and regulations, and to benefit from recommendations of employers. The list of companies that offer student work placement is updated in accordance with the partnership agreements. WorldSkills standards are employed to enhance the quality of a number of courses. An annual student survey (questionnaire) is carried out to determine students' expectations, needs and satisfaction with their university experiences. The student feedback is taken into account to ensure improved quality of the programmes.

In order to obtain feedback from VSUES graduates, a graduate database has been created and is annually updated. At least once every two years a survey is conducted among graduates who completed their degrees more than two years ago.

The study programme quality is assessed with the criteria approved at the Department of Information Technology and Systems meeting.

Achievements:

• The degree programmes are regularly reviewed and updated to account for the requirements of employers and regional labor market in order to enhance the quality of graduates' degrees.

• Practice-based approach contributes to enhancing the cooperation with employers.

• The centre for monitoring and prognosticating is functioning at the University.

• The regulating documents have been developed and are used:

– «The Order of Developing, Approving and Updating BA and MA programmes on the basis of FSES HE, reviewed in compliance with the Professional Standards programmes (СК-СТО-ПЛ-04-1.132-2018),

– «Internal Audit of the Process» (СК-СТО-ДП-21-001-2012)

– «Independent Evaluation of the Internal Quality Assurance of Education» (СК-СТО-ПЛ-04-1.130-2018), etc.

Recommendations:

• The procedures for periodic review of the study programme by students, graduates, teaching staff and employers should be enhanced.

• The findings of student surveys on their satisfaction with the conditions and organization of the education process should be made available to the Institute, major Departments and all stakeholders.

• The results of the surveys should be used when reviewing and updating the programme.

• The regulations for internal audit of the study programme should be updated.

3.10 Standard 10. Cyclical external quality assurance of study programmes

Compliance with the standard: full compliance Table 10 - Criteria to Standard 10

N⁰	Subject of Evaluation	Mark
1.	Periodic review of a study programme	А
2.	Availability of a corrective actions programme to follow up the results of external evaluation of study programmes	А
3.	Consideration of the results of previous procedures of external evaluation when conducting subsequent external procedures	А

Analysis of the educational programmes' compliance with the standard:

The procedures of external evaluation of the study programmes in the form of state, professional-public and international accreditation are regularly held. ITS students participate in the Federal Internet exam for bachelors.

In 2013, the degree programme of Information Systems and Technology was publicly accredited by the Agency for Quality Control of Education and Career Development (AKKORK), in accordance with that the Accreditation Certificate No. F-209 of June 28, 2013 was received. It is valid until 28.06.2016.

Achievements:

• External independent quality assurance procedures are carried regularly (professional-public accreditation, state accreditation, cooperation with employers in the form of supervising work placement and participating in state examination boards).

• The programme is listed among the best programmes of innovative Russia in 2018.

Recommendations:

• Employers should be more involved in evaluating the study programme through regular surveys, round tables, etc.

• A corrective action plan to follow up the results of external evaluation of the degree programmes should be further refined and made available to all stakeholders.

4. **RECOMMENDATIONS FOR IMPROVEMENT**

Thus, based on the analyses of the presented documents, meetings and interviews, conducted during the site-visit, with the purpose of enhancing the quality of implementing the educational programme under accreditation the Review Panel recommends that:

• The University should efficiently involve teachers, students and employers in the development and introduction of the quality assurance policy and the development strategy of the University and Institute.

• The Institute Development programme should be designed and published on the basis of the University Development programme.

• The University should develop metrics for the evaluation of the Institute Development programme.

• The University should develop the procedures for the involvement of all stakeholders (teachers, students, employers) in the development and correction of the educational programme.

• The results of students' surveys should be taken into account when designing the educational programme, curricula and holding competitions for teachers.

• The system for evaluation of students' competences should be developed.

• The number of elective disciplines should be increased with the account of the market demands and modern technologies.

• The mechanisms of external quality evaluation of the pools for assessment tools should be used; test materials developed for different monitoring forms should be certified.

• It is recommended to provide students with incentives to foster their involvement in research and academic schools (winter school, summer school ...) conducted by educational institutions, IT companies in Russia and abroad, conferences, seminars, etc.

• It is advisable to increase inbound and outbound national and international academic mobility of students. It is recommended to select students for academic mobility and offer them enrollment in field-specific study programmes at a HEI abroad. It is necessary to develop the system of recognition of courses completed at a foreign partner university. It is advisable to publish information on academic mobility programmes in the relevant fields of study.

• It is necessary to increase the number of publications produced by the teaching staff of the Department.

• It is advisable to develop international academic cooperation and the participation of the teaching staff in international research projects.

• The inbound and outbound academic mobility of the staff should be enhanced.

• It is advisable to improve the accessibility of the environment for persons with disabilities (equip all the buildings with ramps, elevators, remove door stills, etc).

• A system for collecting and analyzing feedback from students and staff should be developed for effective management of the study programme.

• The collected information and decisions made on its basis should be made public for all stakeholders: students, teachers, supporting staff.

• Full information about VSUES degree programmes under consideration should be available on the VSUES website in English and Chinese.

• More information on employment of VSUES graduates, their success stories, and interviews should be available on the website.

• Information about partner-companies and different ways of cooperation with them should be available on the web-site of the Department and the study programme.

• The regulations for internal audit of the study programme should be updated.

• A corrective action plan to follow up the results of external evaluation of the degree programmes should be further refined and made available to all stakeholders.

5. CONCLUSION

Based on the self-evaluation report analysis, documents and data submitted the External Review Panel has come to the conclusion that the educational programme «Information Systems and Technologies» (09.03.02) **substantially** comply with the standards and criteria of public accreditation of the National Centre for Public Accreditation.

The Panel recommends that the National Accreditation Board accredit the educational programme «Information Systems and Technologies » (09.03.02) delivered by Vladivostok State University of Economics and Service for the period of **six** years.

ANNEX A

SCHEDULE OF THE SITE VISIT OF THE EXTERNAL REVIEW PANEL

Time	Activity	Participants	Venue				
	May 21, Tuesday						
8.45	Arrival at the University		Building 1, 41, Gogolya Str.				
09.00 — 11.00	First meeting of the External Re	eview Panel	Small Hall, Rector's Office, Building 1				
11.00 — 12.00	administration and noonlo inconic reconnection		Biriuzovy Zal, Rector's Office, Building 1				
12.00 — 13.30	Tour of the University (visiting classrooms, library, etc.)	ERP	Buildings 1, 2, 3, 8				
13.30 — 14.30	Lunch	•	Restaurant "Avanta"				
14.30 — 15.00	Internal meeting of the Panel	ERP	Room 1530, Building 1				
15.00 — 16.00	Meeting with Institute Director	Institute Director, ERP	Room 1508, Building 1				
16.00 — 17.00	Work with documents	ERP	Room 1530, Building 1				
17.00 — 18.00	Meeting with representatives of professional community	Employers, ERP	Room 1508, Building 1				
18.00 — 18.30	Internal meeting of the Panel	ERP	Room 1530, Building 1				

Time	Activity	Participants	Venue		
May 22, Wednesday					
9.45	Arrival at the University	Building 1, 41, Gogolya Str.			
10.00 — 11.00	Meeting with Head of Department	Head of Department, ERP	Meeting with Head of Department		
11.00 — 11.30	Internal meeting of the Panel	ERP	Internal meeting of the Panel		
11.30 — 12.30	Meeting with students	Students, ERP	Meeting with students		
12.30 — 13.00	Work with documents, assessment forms	ERP	Work with documents, assessment forms		
13.00 — 14.00	Lunch		Restaurant "Avanta"		
14.00 — 15.00	Meeting with teachers	Teachers, ERP	Meeting with teachers		
15.00 — 15.30	Work with documents/ attending classes (optional)	ERP	Work with documents/ attending classes (optional)		
15.30 — 16.30	Meeting with graduates	Graduates, ERP	Meeting with graduates		
16.30 — 18.30	Work with documents, assessment forms	ERP	Work with documents, assessment forms		
	May 23, Th	ursday			
08.45	Arrival at the University		Building 1, 41, Gogolya Str.		
09.00 — 12.00	Internal meeting of the Panel: discussion of preliminary results of the site visit, preparation of the oral report of the panel	ERP	Room 1530, Building 1		
12.00 — 13.00	Closing meeting of the External Review Panel with the representatives of the University	ERP, University administration, Heads of the Graduate Departments, teachers, students	Hall of the Academic Council, Rector's Office, Building 1		
13.00 — 14.00	Lunch		Restaurant "Avanta"		
Departure					

ANNEX Б

PARTICIPANTS OF THE MEETINGS

Administration of the HEI, persons responsible for accreditation:

N⁰	Name	Position	Contact information
1.	Tatiana Terentieva	Rector	Tatyana.Terenteva@vvsu.ru 8(423)2404000
2.	Gennadii Lazarev	President	Gennadiy.lazarev@vvsu.ru 8(423)2404041
3.	Sergei Golikov	Vice-Rector for Educational and Research Work	Sergey.Golikov@vvsu.ru 8(423)2404053
4.	Yulia Chebova	Director of the Department for Educational Work	Yuliya.Rebrey@vvsu.ru 8(423)240-42-50
5.	Luidmila Kravchenko	Director of the Department for Monitoring and Prognosticating	Lyudmila.Kravchenko@vvsu.r u 8(423)2404079

Heads of departments:

Nº	Name	Position	Contact Information
1.	Elena Kiikova	•	Elena.Kiykova@vvsu.ru 8(423)2404060

Teachers:

N⁰	Name	Position	Contact Information
1.	Olga Bogdanova	Senior teacher	olga.bogdanova@vvsu.ru
2.	Boris Vasiliev	Associate Professor	boris.vasiliev@vvsu.ru
3.	Viktor Giniak	Associate Professor	Viktor.Grinyak@vvsu.ru
4.	Elena Emtseva	Associate Professor	Elena.Emtseva@vvsu.ru
5.	Marina Ermolitskaia	Associate Professor	marina.ermolitskaya@vvsu.ru
6.	Yuri Levashov	Associate Professor	yury.levashov@vvsu.ru
7.	Igor Mozharovskii	Senior teacher	studvvsu@gmail.com
8.	Leonid Pak	Senior teacher	Leonid.Pak@vvsu.ru
9.	Mikhail Sachko	Associate Professor	maxim.sachko@vvsu.ru
10.	Sergei Semkin	Associate Professor	Li15@rambler.ru
11.	Evgenia Sobolevskaia	Senior teacher	Study_z@list.ru

Students:

N⁰	Name	Field of Study		Contact Information
1.	Alena Artemieva	Information Systems and Technologies	3	+79025207010
2.	Yuri Bondarev	Information Systems and Technologies	2	+79024858148
3.	Evgenii Vinogradskii	Information Systems and Technologies	4	+79841437369
4.	Mark Vodianitskii	Information Systems and Technologies	1	+79841579978
5.	Andrei Garneda	Information Systems and Technologies	4	+79247385394
6.	Sofia Zagrebina	Information Systems and Technologies	3	+79246959401
7.	Vladimir Kosterin	Information Systems and Technologies	3	+79940125063
8.	Nikita Kuksin	Information Systems and Technologies	2	+79146854883
9.	John Massamba	Information Systems and Technologies	2	+79247216270
10.	Denis Mukhametzianov	Information Systems and Technologies	1	+79996143369
11.	Roman Perstov	Information Systems and Technologies	2	+79146733489
12.	Timurzhon Primov	Information Systems and Technologies	2	+79020766545
13.	Igor Silchenko	Information Systems and Technologies	3	+79502910060
14.	Artem Tutin	Information Systems and Technologies	1	+79242366945

Representatives of employers:

Nº	Name	Position	Contact Information
1.	Aleksandr Bazhin	Director General, LLC «Expert-Nauka»	+79502849123
2.	Sergei Belenev	Head of the IT Department, «Primorskii Vodokanal»	+79089941826
3.	Gasan Gasanbalaev	Deputy Director General, Agency on Developing Human Capital in the Far East	8(4232)2390999
4.	Irina Evstifeeva	Chief Human Resources Officer, «Primorie»	+79644467772
5.	Aleksei Efremov	Director General, LLC «Aiterra»	+79025245421
6.	Valeria Kolomeets	Manager of IT-projects, LLC «Russian Fishery Company»	+79644396252
7.	Ivan Kopylov	Expert of the Department for Using Information Technologies, branch of PJSC «MTC» in the Primorski Krai	+79149706315
8.	Polina Kucheruk	Leading expert, LLC «ASU-Consulting»	+79089923014
9.	Daria Logunovich	Head of the Service for Staff Recruitment, PJSC «Rostelecom»	+79914980051
10.	Tatiana Prikhodko	Personnel Director, LLC «Farpost»	+79146522226
11.	Oleg Salionov	Senior programmer, LLC «Amaiama Auto»	+79644320330

Graduates:

Nº	Name	Place of Work	Position	Contact Information
1.	Pavel Buzalov	PC «Izumrud»	Software Engineer	+79242590520
2.	Maksim Bulavinov	LLC «Apteka25.RF»	System administrator	+79146606440
3.	Ekaterina Diachek	LLC «Unilab- Vladivostok»	Expert on Analytics of Business Processes	+79242657375
4.	Andrei Ivashinnikov	LLC «Farpost Development»	Web-Programmer	+79990571846
5.	Aleksandr Krupianko	PC «Dalzavod – Terminal»	Software Engineer	+79502932619
6.	Denis Lukiantsev	LLC «Amaiama Auto»	Programmer	+79147183506
7.	Andrei Moskalenko	LLC «CardPay»	Programmer	+79149795643
8.	Andrei Novoselov	PJSC «MTC»	Senior expert	+79146839121
9.	Marina Penchuk	LLC «Unilab- Vladivostok»	Expert on Process Management	+79140760273
10.	Anton Petraschuk	LLC «ASU- Consulting»	Programmer	+79996174108
11.	Grigorii Silidis	LLC «Farpost»	Programmer	+79990588063
12.	Sergei Snopko	VSUES	Leading Programmer	+79089849022

Institute Director/Dean of the Faculty and Deputy Deans:

N⁰	Name	Position	Contact Information
1.	Vladimir Kriukov		vladimir.kryukov@vvsu.ru 8(423)2404040

ANNEX B

THE SCALE OF ASSESSMENT PARAMETERS OF A STUDY PROGRAMME

		A	ssessment of the	e study program	nme
Nº	Standards	Full compliance	Substantial compliance	Partial compliance (needs improvement)	Non-compliance
1.	Policy (goals, development strategy) and quality assurance procedures of a study programme		В		
2.	Design and approval of programmes		В		
3.	Student-centred learning, teaching and assessment		В		
4.	Student admission, support of academic achievements and graduation		В		
5.	Teaching staff	А			
6.	Learning resources and student support	А			
7.	Collection, analysis and use of information for managing the educational institution		В		
8.	Public information		В		
9.	On-going monitoring and periodic review of programmes		В		
10.	Cyclical external quality assurance of study programmes	А			