ВЛАДИВОСТОКСКИЙ
ГОСУДАРСТВЕННЫЙ
УНИВЕРСИТЕТ
ВГУЭС ЭКОНОМИКИ И СЕРВИСА

National Centre for
Public Accreditation

Final Report

on external evaluation of

the cluster of educational programmes

«Economics» (38.03.01),
«Management» (38.03.02),
«Business-Informatics» (38.03.05),

Delivered by Vladivostok State University of Economics and Service

Vladivostok
2019

Final Report
on external evaluation of
the cluster of educational programmes

«Economics» (38.03.01),
«Management» (38.03.02),
«Business-Informatics» (38.03.05)

Delivered by Vladivostok State University of Economics and Service

Chair of the External Review Panel   Wang Shaoyuan

Vladivostok

2019

Contents

INTRODUCTION

The external evaluation of the cluster of educational programmes in «Economics» (38.03.01), «Management» (38.03.02), «Business Informatics» (38.03.05) delivered by Vladivostok State University of Economics and Service (VSUES) took place on May 21 – 23, 2019 and included the analysis of Self Evaluation Report, a site visit to VSUES and preparation of the Final Report.

The goal of the external evaluation is to establish the level of compliance of the quality of the graduates' education and training in the cluster of degree programmes in Economics (38.03.01), Management (38.03.02), Business Informatics (38.03.05) with the standards and criteria of international public accreditation developed by the National Center for Public Accreditation (NCPA) and with the European standards and guidelines (ESG) for quality assurance in higher education (ENQA). The Final Report on the outcomes of the external evaluation is the basis for decision making by the National Accreditation Board on professional public accreditation of the study programmes in compliance with the standards and criteria of NCPA.

1. CONTEXT AND MAIN STAGES OF THE EXTERNAL EVALUATION

1.1 Terms of Reference

According to item 1, 3 article 96 of the Federal Law of the Russian Federation of December 29, 2012 No.273-FZ "On education in the Russian Federation" organizations, which implement educational activities, may apply for public accreditation in various national, foreign and international institutions; employers, employer associations and designated organizations have the right to conduct public accreditation of professional educational programmes, which are delivered by an educational institution. In order to obtain professional public accreditation of the cluster of study programmes in «Economics» (38.03.01), «Management» (38.03.02) and «Business Informatics» (38.03.05) VSUES applied to NCPA which carries out its activity at the national level and is recognized by leading international organizations of quality assurance in higher education.

1.2 External Review Panel

The international experts were nominated by the Higher Education Evaluation Centre of the Ministry of Education (China) upon NCPA's request. The Russian expert was nominated by the Guild of Experts in Higher Education. The employer representative was nominated by Interfax. The representative of the students' community was suggested by the Russian Student Union. The composition of the External Review Panel was approved by NCPA. The Review Panel included five international and national experts:

- **Wang Shaoyuan,** Doctor, Professor, former Dean of the School of International Trade and Economics, Dongbei University of Finance and Economics, Deputy Secretary General of the China American Economic Association — foreign expert, Review Chair;
- **Irina Borisova,** Candidate of Economic Sciences, Associate Professor, Head of the Centre for Education Quality, Lobachevsky State University of Nizhni Novgorod, member of the Guild of Experts in Higher Education — Russian expert, Deputy Review Chair;

- **Lu Jing,** Doctor, Professor, Department of International Economics, Zhejiang University, Council Member of Zhejiang International Economic Association — foreign expert, Panel member;
- **Tatiana Vicenec,** Key advisor of the Division of Projection, Monitoring and Analysis of Social and Economic Development, Department of Economy and Development of Entrepreneurship of Primorsky Krai — representative of professional community, Panel member;
- **Maria Sharaia,** 4th year student, field of study «Economics», School of Economics and Management, Far Eastern Federal University — representative of students, Panel member;

The focused expert knowledge of the Panel members, long-term experience of working in the system of higher education and profession, active position of students and employers became the basis for effective consideration of issues within the framework of evaluation. The participation of the Russian representatives of the higher education system gave an opportunity to analyze the activity of the programmes under evaluation in the context of the world trends in quality assurance and within the scope of the national educational system.

1.3   Goals and objectives of the review

The purpose of the public accreditation is to improve the quality of education and form quality culture in educational institutions, discovering best practices in continuous enhancing the educational quality and public information on educational institutions in accordance with the European educational quality standards. The main goal of the peer review is to determine the correspondence of the reviewed study programme programmes in «Economics» (38.03.01), «Management» (38.03.02) and «Business Informatics» (38.03.05) delivered by VSUES to standards and criteria of public accreditation, which are developed by NCPA in compliance with the European Standards of Quality Assurance in Education ESG-ENQA; and to develop recommendations for the study programme with the purpose of improving the contents and structure of the educational process.

1.4   Stages of the review

The review included three main stages:

1.4.1 Study of the Self-Evaluation report

Vladivostok State University of Economics and Service was responsible for conducting the self-evaluation procedure, developing and timely submitting the Self–Evaluation Report of the cluster of educational programmes in «Economics» (38.03.01), «Management» (38.03.02) and «Business Informatics» (38.03.05) to NCPA.

According to the *Guidelines on Self-evaluation of Educational Programmes*, which were developed by NCPA. The Self-Evaluation Report is written on 41 pages and includes: introduction, findings, conclusions, and annexes. The self-evaluation procedure was conducted on the basis of SWOT analysis according to every standard of NCPA.   According to the review schedule the Self-Evaluation report of the study programmes «Economics» (38.03.01), «Management» (38.03.02) and «Business Informatics» (38.03.05)

was submitted to NCPA and mailed to the members of the review panel 30 days before the site-visit.

While studying the Self-Evaluation Report the panel members formed a preliminary opinion about the reviewed educational programmes on compliance with the standards of NCPA and HEEC and criteria on accreditation and with the European standards of education quality.

The members of the review panel assessed the quality of preparation of the Self-Evaluation Report with regards to its text structuring, compliance of information with the Report's sections; quality of perception; sufficiency of analytical data; availability of references to supporting documents; completeness of information. All of these made it possible for the members of the Review Panel to formulate a preliminary opinion. The review panel members pointed out some weaknesses of the Self-Evaluation Report: the content of some sections of the SER don't always correspond to the relevant standards of NCPA; very often the SER contains information on the higher educational institution as a whole instead of the evaluated cluster; the information about the compliance with the standards as far as the programmes under accreditation are concerned is not sufficient; the section about documenting the internal quality assurance system is superficial.

On the outcomes of the preliminary analysis the ERP made the following conclusions:

During the site visit the Panel should pay special attention to the documented internal quality assurance system and the QA policy; scrutinize the strategy and developmental programme of the University; focus on the mechanism for providing academic mobility of the staff and students.

According to the standards and criteria of accreditation of NCPA the preliminary assessment of the study programmes «Economics» (38.03.01), «Management» (38.03.02) and «Business Informatics» (38.03.05) may be defined as partial compliance.

The following lines of inquiry have been formulated:

1.   How are the goals of the quality assurance policy reflected in the developmental strategy of VSUES?

2.   Who and how determines whether the goals and objectives of the quality assurance policy have been reached?

3.   How is the panel of auditors for regular internal audits is formed from the representatives of departments and students?

4.   Is the labour market analyzed from the point of view of the needs of the region in economic and managerial human resources?

5.   How actively do the students participate in competitions, championships (examinations) of WorldSkills?

6.   How effective is the point ranking system of assessing the performance of the teaching staff? How effective was its implementation in improving the financial situation of the teaching staff?

7.   Are conditions in place for the first year students to get adjusted to the student life at the University?

8.   How appealing and accessible to students are double degree programmes?

9.   What kind of competences included in the Professional Standards should be fo rmed by the study programmes under accreditation?

10.   Which professional skills are not adequately acquired by the programmes' graduates?

11.   Do representatives of the professional community believe that the goals and structure of the programmes should be corrected?

During the preliminary meeting the members of ERP came up with suggestions which determined the main strategy of the site visit.

1.4.2 Site visit to VSUES

The review panel visited Vladivostok State University of Economics and Service on May 21-23, 2019 with the purpose of confirming the authenticity of the information, which was presented in the Self-Evaluation Report, collecting extra information on the implementation of the accredited programmes and checking their compliance with the standards and criteria of NCPA. The time line and the agenda of the site-visit were determined by NCPA approved by the administration of Vladivostok State University of Economics and Service and the members of the Review Panel. During the site-visit the Review Panel members conducted a number of meetings and interviews with the University administration, people responsible for accreditation, members of the staff, students and representatives of professional community.

The Chair of the Review Panel managed the Panel's work. The Panel considers that the Self-Evaluation Report, which was presented by VSUES, provided the experts with an opportunity to form an integral view on specific features of implementation of the reviewed study programmes «Economics» (38.03.01), «Management» (38.03.02) and «Business Informatics» (38.03.05). The studied documents and the interviewed persons, visits to the Department, library of the University and laboratories provided the Review Panel members with sufficient information about reviewed study programme.

The studied documents and the interviewed persons, visits to the Museum, the University library, the sports facilities and classrooms provided the Review Panel members with sufficient information about the reviewed study programme and specific features of the practice-based method of organizing the academic process.

The Review Panel considers it necessary to highlight the effective cooperation of the experts and NCPA employees during the site-visit and its preparation.

The Review Panel notes the highest level of organizational provision and constructive work. The executive staff of VSUES provided the administrative support, which included arrangement of meetings and interviews, provision with working space, computers with access to the Internet, necessary research, academic and methodological documents.

During the site-visit to VSUES the Review Panel members requested additional documents.

On the last day of the site-visit the Chair of the Review Panel presented an oral report on the general conclusions to the administrative staff of the University, Heads of the Institutes and Departments, teachers and students. The agenda of the site-visit can be found in the Annex.

1.4.3 Conclusion on the findings of the external review

Based on the results of the external review of Vladivostok State University of Economics and Service the Review Panel submitted the Report on the results of the external review of the study programmes «Economics» (38.03.01), «Management» (38.03.02) and «Business Informatics» (38.03.05) delivered by the educational institution. The draft report of 31 pages excluding Annexes was developed by the Chair of the Review Panel, approved by the

other Review panel members and submitted to the National Centre for Public Accreditation. Then the Report was mailed to the University's administration for making factual amendments.

2. DESCRIPTION OF THE STUDY PROGRAMMES

Vladivostok State University of Economics and Service was founded on 13 September 1967 in order to promote sustainable socio-economic development of the region by way of training qualified personnel on the basis of integration of education, research and practice; generation and commercialization of new knowledge; creating environment which facilitates innovation, entrepreneurial initiative and harmonious development of personality.

Study programmes 38.03.01 Economics and 38.03.02 Management are delivered at the Department of Economics and Management headed by Tatyana Varkulevich, Candidate of Economic Sciences, Associate Professor, Member of the Institute of Professional Accountants of Russia, full member of the International Federation of Accountants, honorary Professor of Heilujjan University of Foreign Languages, Director of LLC "Profbughalter". The number of staff is 84.

Study programme 38.03.05 Business Informatics is delivered at the Department of Mathematics and Modeling headed by Lev Mazelis, Doctor of Economics, Associate Professor, Honorary Worker of Professional Education of RF, Deputy Chair of the United Dissertation Council Д 999.192.02 of the Far Eastern Federal University and Vladivostok State University of Economics and Service. The number of the staff is 21.

The number of students studying the programmes is presented in Table 1.

Field of study		38.03.02	38.03.01	38.03.02	38.03.01	38.03.02	38.03.01	Total	38.03.05	Total
	code									
	Name	Management	Management	Economics	Menagement	Economics			Business-Informatics	
Department		EM	EM	EM	EM	EM	EM	**EM**	MM	**MM**
FT/PT		FT	FT	PT	PT	PT	PT		FT	
1 year	State-funded	17	30	0	0	0	0	**47**	6	**6**
	Contract	67	136	54	41	62	121	**481**	32	**32**
	total	**84**	**166**	**54**	**41**	**62**	**121**	**528**	**38**	**38**
2 year	State-funded	18	53	0	0	0	0	**71**	11	**11**
	Contract	55	99	25	35	49	93	**356**	11	**11**
	total	**73**	**152**	**25**	**35**	**49**	**93**	**427**	**22**	**22**
3 year	State-funded	28	97	1	13	0	0	**139**	14	**14**
	Contract	31	140	26	42	0	129	**368**	8	**8**
	total	**59**	**237**	**27**	**55**	**0**	**129**	**507**	**22**	**22**
4 year	State-funded	34	84	7	5	0	0	**130**	22	**22**
	Contract	34	57	17	19	28	82	**237**	2	**2**
	total	**68**	**141**	**24**	**24**	**28**	**82**	**367**	**24**	**24**
5 year	State-funded	0	0	0	0	0	0	**0**	0	**0**
	Contract	0	0	1	0	7	5	**13**	0	**0**
	total	**0**	**0**	**1**	**0**	**7**	**5**	**13**	**0**	**0**
Total	State-funded	97	265	8	18	0	0	**388**	53	**53**
	Contract	187	434	124	137	146	430	**1458**	53	**53**
	total	**284**	**696**	**131**	**155**	**146**	**430**	**1842**	**106**	**106**

Workplacement:

JSCB «Primotye», «Sberbank of Russia» «Primorskoye Otdelenie, №8635», Primorsky Krai Administration, LLC «Coca-Cola HBC Eurasia», «Investment Agency of Primorsky Krai», PJSC «Rostelcom», LLC «Vladivostok Marine Container Terminal» №10296, LLC «ACK Computers», PJSC «MTC», LLC «TimeLeasing»,LLC «DHC Retail», PJSC «Eastern Shipyard», FE Agency for Human Resource Development, etc.

Graduates are employed in LLC «World of Packaging», LLC «Tsentr Kamnya», LLC «Status-FE», PJSC «Rostelcom», LLC «Primtender», LLC «FarPost», Vladivostok Municipal Palace of Children's Creativity, PJSC «MTC – Far East», LLC «TFM», LLC «TimeLeasing», LLC «Far-Eastern Trade Company», JSC «Dalzavod», ITC of Primorsky Krai, etc.

3.   FINDINGS

3.1   Standard 1. Policy (goals, development strategy) and quality assurance procedures of a study programme

*Compliance with the standard: **substantial compliance***

Table 1 - Criteria to Standard 1

№	Subject of Evaluation	Mark
1.	Availability of a documented inner quality assurance system providing continuous enhancement of quality in accordance with the developmental strategy of the educational institution	B
2.	Participation of all stakeholders (administration, teaching staff, students, employers, employer associations, branch ministries and departments – key partners in employment of graduates) in developing and implementing a quality assurance policy through relevant structures and processes	B
3.	Participation of all structural units of an educational institution in quality assurance processes and procedures	B

Analysis of the educational programmes' compliance with the standard:

Generally, the study programmes under accreditation correspond to the requirements of the standard. The set of the local regulatory documents is developed; the quality assurance policy of 2011 is published on the University website. The rules and procedures for development and approval of VSUES internal standards are determined by the procedural instruction «Identification, Structure and Development of VSUES Internal Standards (SK-STO-MI-28-001-2012)».

Annual self-evaluation procedures are carried out to effectively implement and monitor quality assurance policy applied to the educational programme.

According to the quality assurance policy, stakeholders take part in design of the educational programmes by participating in the discussion of the project of the study programme at the meetings of the Department, peer review of the study programme by representatives of employers, approval of the programme at the Academic Council of the University.

According to the standard SK-STO-DP-21-001-2012, the University carries out regular audits to develop corrective and preventive measures and monitor the quality assurance policy. Representatives of the Departments and administration, students and external experts who work in terms of contractual relations with the University are involved in carrying out the audits.

Achievements:

The educational programmes are regularly discussed and coordinated with representatives of the regional professional community and large enterprises.

Key employability partners are involved in the development of the educational programmes. Almost all stakeholders participate in the development and introduction of the system of quality assurance.

Recommendations:

- The quality assurance policy should be updated and published with the account of the strategic objectives of the University.
- The procedures for correction of the educational programmes with the account of opinions of all stakeholders should be developed.
- The mechanism of participation of employers and executive authorities of the Primorsky Krai in the procedures of quality evaluation of the educational programmes should be defined in detail.
- The mechanism of students' participation in development and correction of the educational programmes should be developed.

3.2   Standard 2. Design and approval of programmes

*Compliance with the standard: **full compliance***

Table 2 - Criteria to Standard 2

№	Subject of Evaluation	Mark
1.	Availability and accessibility of clearly defined, documented, approved and published goals and objectives of a study programme and expected learning outcomes and their correspondence to the mission and goals and objectives of the educational institution	B
2.	Availability of procedures for design, approval and revision of a study programme (including expected learning outcomes) with the account of the development of science and industry, and also with the consideration of stakeholder opinions (administration, teaching staff, students, employers)	A
3.	Consideration of the requirements of professional standards (if available), of labour market, of national qualification framework descriptors in the study programme	A

Analysis of the educational programmes' compliance with the standard:

The procedure of the programmes design, review and approval has been clearly defined by VSUES internal standard SK-STO-PO-04.1.118-2017. The educational programmes contain clearly defined goals and expected learning outcomes that are in line with the VSUES development strategy and goals. The educational programmes, their goals and curricula are designed in line with up-to-date requirements set by labour market and professional (industry) standards. While the elective component of the programme curriculum is being designed, and the techniques of practice-based teaching are being incorporated, recommendations from the professional community (employers) are examined and taken into account.

Students are also involved in the curricula review as they are encouraged to choose from the list of elective courses currently available and to advise on new courses (modules). Annual meetings with student groups with elective and extracurricular courses on the agenda are held. The outcomes are documented in the minutes of the meetings and are included in the curricula. The educational programmes contain the requirements of the available professional standards («Accountant», «Auditor», «Risk Manager», «Financial Analyst»).

The students have an opportunity to create an individual learning path. They can choose facilities for practical training and do course and graduation works on the topics suggested by the representatives of professional community.

Achievements:

The educational programmes under accreditation are distinguished by the practice-oriented approach. Regional employers are actively involved in design and delivery of the educational programmes and evaluation of students' training.

Students are involved in the curricula review as they are encouraged to choose from the list of elective courses currently available and to advise on new courses (modules). VSUES Vice-rector for Academic Affairs sets dates for annual meetings with student groups with elective and extracurricular courses on the agenda. The outcomes are documented in the minutes of the meetings and are included in the curricula.

Recommendations:

- The mechanism for the account of employers' opinions during the discussion of the educational programme and its updating (during round tables, meetings with invited speakers, etc.) should be developed and reflected in the regulatory documents of the University.
- The methodology of teaching foreign languages in the basic part of the educational programme should be improved with the aim of in-depth study of the professional vocabulary and a foreign language for business purposes.
- The audit of subject-specific disciplines of the educational programmes should be carried out to include compulsory study and acquisition of skills for working with specialized software.
- The mechanism of using distance educational environments should be developed, for example, the educational platform LMS BlackBoard.

3.3 Standard 3. Student-centred learning, teaching and assessment

*Compliance with the standard: **substantial compliance***

Table 3 - Criteria to Standard 3

№	Subject of Evaluation	Mark
1.	Consideration of needs of diverse groups of students and a possibility to create individual learning paths	A
2.	Use of methods encouraging students to take an active part in creating the learning process	B
3.	Use of clearly defined criteria and objective assessment procedures of learning outcomes/ competences of students corresponding to the expected learning outcomes, goals of the study programme and their purpose (diagnostic, formative or summative assessment)	B
4.	Information about the study programme, criteria and procedures for assessment of learning outcomes/competencies, about examinations, tests and other types of control.	B
5.	Use of procedures of independent assessment of learning outcomes	B
6.	Availability and effectiveness of appeals procedure and procedures for dealing with students complaints	B

Analysis of the educational programmes' compliance with the standard:

The students have an opportunity to choose an individual learning path based on the Unified procedure for students to choose the disciplines during the educational process. The working programmes of disciplines provide students with an opportunity to use the electronic information and educational environment (ЭИОС) by learning a course in Moodle. It allows students to study at their own pace. The students can choose not to attend classes but master their skills remotely, choosing courses from the list of recommended online courses presented on the National platform «Open Education».

In 2013, VSUES adopted a new model of students' training - practice-based approach to education (PBA) that provides senior students with an opportunity to combine theoretical training with work. It allows them to gain practical experience and start their professional career before receiving a degree. PBA helps students decide on the range of their professional interests and gives an additional source of personal income.

Recent years saw a wider application of integrated learning technologies by VSUES staff that employ active and interactive learning methods and "face-to-face" techniques. The students can attend consultation hours remotely (communicating with their teachers via Skype), take part in webinars. Each student has an access to his/her personal account – VSUES Student Network Account - that provides details about his/her curriculum, textbooks and e-resources, schedule, attendance reports, academic progress, etc.

Student E-portfolio allows students to keep track of their individual learning paths and their progress. The students are suggested filling out questionnaires to give their feedback on the quality of the courses, methods and materials used in teaching. It helps the university administration to identify strengths and weaknesses and see whether students are satisfied with teaching and learning.

Achievements:

The University actively uses different procedures of external evaluation of learning outcomes: independent procedure of evaluation of learning outcomes in the form of the Federal Internet Exam for Bachelors; participation of students and their achievements in subject-specific Olympiads and competitions; public accreditation; feedback from employers.

The University has a credit system of evaluation of students' learning outcomes.

The students are actively involved in project activities aimed at receiving professional skills; they also participate in the competition WorldSkills Russia.

The representatives of professional community are involved in setting a topic of graduation theses.

An effective system of students' motivation with the help of scholarship programmes is created.

Recommendations:

- The current credit system should include marks from employers based on the results of internships.
- Taking into account close relations of the University with regional enterprises and opinions of employers, representatives of the professional community should also review graduation theses of Bachelor students.

- The programmes of student mobility with the countries of the European Union and the Commonwealth of Independent States should be actively developed.
- The University website should include a section of students' opinions on the quality of the educational process with an opportunity to fill in a questionnaire online.

3.4   Standard 4. Student admission, support of academic achievements and graduation

*Compliance with the standard: **substantial compliance***

Table 4 - Criteria to Standard 4

№	Subject of Evaluation	Mark
1.	Systematic carrier guidance work targeted at the recruiting and selection of applicants should be in place	A
2.	Availability and effectiveness of rules and regulations for admission, transfer of students from other educational institutions, recognition of qualifications, periods of study and prior learning	A
3.	Systematic work to support students' progression	B
4.	Recognition of higher education qualifications obtained in the RF and abroad (Diploma Supplement)	C
5.	Participation of students in mobility programmes	B

Analysis of the educational programmes' compliance with the standard:

In order to find and attract the most talented students to enroll in the University the Abiturient Center was set up. The Center promotes career guidance, plans and arranges recruitment of students at all academic levels, and collaborates with educational institutions of Vladivostok and the Primorsky Krai.

As part of the University's admission campaign, the academic departments together with the Abiturient Center annually hold regional Build Your Own Business competition, The Best Private Investor competition, the Management competition. Regulations on the admission are regularly revised and updated.

The University has in place a set of documents regulating policies and procedures of student admission and transfer. The transfer of students from other educational institutions to VSUES is determined by SK-STO-PL-04-1.129-2017. In accordance with the internal standard, the VSUES Admission Committee is to examine student's documents confirming previous education and to decide if the transfer to the chosen field of study is possible.

Students are encouraged to receive non-formal education and are provided with such an opportunity as they are offered to take further educational programmes (courses) and seminars. The VSUES International Club has been created for students to help them communicate and improve their language skills in an informal setting. Within the framework of the Youth Policy Management Department, the VSUES Volunteer Training Center has been established to help those willing to engage in volunteering receive special training confirmed by the certificates that allow them to participate in various national and international events.

VSUES rating system of students' academic progress evaluation was developed in order to monitor and support the dynamics of students' academic progress and achievements.

The VSUES Students Office and Academic Advisors Body are in charge of students' academic progress support. They continuously monitor students' academic progress, attendance statistics, set meeting hours for teachers and students to inform about deadlines, how to deal with students who fail to complete the academic programme or face difficulties with completing it.

In order to enhance students' proficiency in foreign languages, the university provides them with the opportunity to take a professional retraining programme to qualify as an interpreter/translator.

VSUES has been developing international student exchange programmes aimed at enhancing of student academic mobility since 2010. The university offers 23 exchange and joint programmes, and 6 double-degree programmes.

Achievements:

The University has in place an effective system of recruiting prospective students: there are a lot of offsite and onsite workshops, role playing games, model lessons organized at secondary schools of the region. The organized events include *I am the future manager, Choosing My Profession, Tendencies of the Global Labour Market, Development of Entrepreneurship and Team Management Skills, Development of Negotiations and Making Managerial Decisions, Basics of the Stock Market, Securities Trading*.

VSUES Student Office and group curators regularly (on a monthly basis) monitor students' academic progress, check attendance statistics, inform students on the terms and rules of dealing with unfulfilled programme requirements and mitigate the consequences of academic failures. The teachers of the Departments provide consultancy services to students in the courses delivered.

Students of the Management, Economics and Business Informatics are actively involved in research work and win in academic contests and conferences.

The university offers 23 exchange and joint programmes, and 6 double-degree programmes. Students take part in academic mobility:
- Short-term programmes (less than a trimester);
- Summer schools programmes;
- Exchange education programmes (more than a trimester/semester).

Recommendations:

- It is recommended to analyze the market of educational services in order to sign agreements on networking programmes with HEIs in Russia and abroad.
- It is advisable to make students aware of the Diploma Supplement. This is particularly important for international students.
- It is recommended to develop a set of activities aimed at supporting low achievers.
- It is advisable to develop measures aimed at establishment of research competencies and abilities of students.

3.5   Standard 5. Teaching staff

*Compliance with the standard: **substantial compliance***

Table 5 - Criteria to Standard 5

№	Subject of Evaluation	Mark
1.	Qualification and competence of the teaching staff : − Academic degrees and titles; − Industry and state awards and prizes; − Practical experience; − Published text books, handbooks and methodological guidebooks	A
2.	Relevance of specialists, degrees and titles and /or practical experience to the profile of the study programme	A
3.	Research activity of the teaching staff, implementation of research results in the academic process	B
4.	Use of innovative teaching methods and advanced technologies	B
5.	Visiting lecturers from other educational institutions including those from abroad	B
6.	Participation of the teachers in joint international projects, internships abroad, academic mobility programmes	B
7.	A system of financial and non-financial incentives for teachers	A
8.	Availability and use of clear, transparent and objective criteria for: − Hiring staff including teachers from foreign educational institutions, assignment to positions, promotion, dismissal; − Dismissal of teachers with low level of professional competency	A
9.	A system for career development and professional advancement for teachers	B

Analysis of the educational programmes' compliance with the standard:

The teaching staff involved in the study programme delivery meets all the necessary requirements and has the capacity to provide quality training to students: 68 % of the teaching staff involved in the programme delivery hold the degree of the Candidate of Sciences or an academic title of the Associate Professor. 10% of the teaching staff hold Doctorate Degrees and 8 staff members have been granted the titles of the Honored Worker of Education of the Russian Federation or the Honored Worker of the Higher School of the Russian Federation. 38 teachers have been awarded various Certificates of Merit by national and regional authorities.

The members of the teaching staff are actively involved in research, they take part in grant programmes. The University cooperates with the leading national research centres and HEIs.

From 2015 to 2018 the academic staff of the two departments received 21 state registration certificates of software and databases, patented 3 intellectual property rights.

In order to boost the use of innovative methods and advanced technologies in teaching and learning, the university has introduced the Faculty Performance Rating System. The rating results are used to calculate the benefits of the staff members.

Representatives from the industry are involved in the programme delivery. In the framework of the project *Visiting Lecturer* students and

employers interact during training sessions, workshops, practical classes, discussions and role playing games. Representatives of the regional business sector (heads of enterprises, corporate business trainers, personnel managers and leading specialists) regularly come to meet students.

The teaching staff of the Department are involved in implementing joint projects with HEIs abroad.

VSUES and Heilongjiang Bayi Agricultural University (China) have signed an agreement enabling the teaching staff of VSUES together with the teaching staff of Heilongjiang University to train Chinese students. Every year VSUES teachers from the Department of Economics and Management give lectures at Chinese universities. VSUES also closely cooperates with Heilongjiang Institute of Foreign Languages.

Clear, fair and transparent procedures are carried out to evaluate the performance of the teaching staff. In order to boost professional development and high performance of its teaching staff VSUES implements a number of projects. These include the annual contest *Teacher as Viewed by Students.* This competition provides public recognition of teachers with high professional achievements, who regularly advance their professional skills, disseminate their teaching expertise and promote the corporate culture of the University.

Achievements:

The teaching staff of the University are actively involved in research: over the last three years the academic staff have produced 20 monographs, over 770 articles, including 551 articles published in academic journals listed in the Russian Science Citation Index (RSCI) (eLIBRARY.RU) database and academic journals included in WoS (apps.webofknowledge.com) and Scopus (apps.webofknowledge.com) databases.

Over the last three years the faculty members have engaged in 11 research projects supported by Russian research foundations. They were also involved in 3 collaborative projects carried out for local authorities and overseas customers.

Representatives from the industry are also involved in the programme delivery in order to develop students' professional competencies and practical skills.

Members of the teaching staff undergo internships at partner universities.

VSUES teachers have good practice of teaching at HEIs abroad.

The University uses Faculty Performance Rating System designed to evaluate the performance of the faculty. The Performance Rating System contributes to the quality management system.

Recommendations:

- It is recommended to develop measures to recruit teachers from foreign HEIs to deliver programmes.
- It is advisable to have the members of the teaching staff undergo internships in municipal and federal authorities in Russia and abroad.
- It is recommended to develop the mechanism of introducing innovative teaching and learning methods and research results in the academic process.

3.6 Standard 6. Learning resources and student support

*Compliance with the standard: **substantial compliance***

Table 6 - Criteria to Standard 6

№	Subject of Evaluation	Mark
1.	Provision of the study programme with material and technical recourses in accordance with the requirements of the curriculum (modern tools, equipment, computers, classrooms, laboratories)	B
2.	Availability of up-to-date library and information resources including those for independent study and research work	B
3.	Availability of infrastructure to ensure access to quality education to students with different opportunities and of different age, and to provide the development of social and educational component of the academic process	B
4.	The system of feedback on the satisfaction with conditions and organization of the study process should be in place	B
5.	Availability of accessible information about opportunities for student mobility and its support system	A

Analysis of the educational programmes' compliance with the standard:

The available educational resources meet the requirements of the standard. The system of student support helps deliver the required information to all the students.

All classrooms are equipped with up-to-date multimedia that allow academic staff to employ effective teaching techniques and take advantage of VSUES internal corporate resources. Most lecture halls and laboratories are equipped with over-head projectors and fold away screens for projection, document cameras and LCD displays.

A number of classrooms is equipped with videoconferencing facilities, which allow teachers and students to work together from remote locations. Video conferencing enhances the educational experience in many ways as lectures and tutorials can be broadcast online, recorded and stored on the university servers.

VSUES library (or Resource Information and Analytical Center (RIAC)) is one of the leading university libraries in the Far East.

In order to accomplish the task of supporting research and education process with information that meets up-to-date requirements, the library combines the functions of a traditional library and an e-library providing all its users with information on various types of media.

The library holds (if its branches taken into account) over 600 thousand items of which about 188 thousand are e-documents, including full-text items. All students can access the educational resources of the e-library systems such as University Library Online, ZNANIUM, YURAYT, RUKONT, Lan.

The library contains more than 140 thousand electronic full-text items which support bachelor degree programmes of the university. It also provides access to the electronic resources of the e-Library (Russia), the Digital Dissertations Library (DDL) of the Russian State Library, the Sberbank Library, to the periodicals of the Grebennikon publishing house, and resources of the Springer publishing house.

Vladivostok State University of Economics and Service is a rapidly developing university with well-developed infrastructure and various facilities. VSUES has 3 campuses and academic buildings located in Vladivostok that are under operative management of the university. VSUES premises account for 85,805 square meters. The total area of the university buildings is 61,701 square meters, of the land near them is of 33,14 hectares.

A special policy has been implemented to ensure safe and convenient access of students with disabilities to the university buildings, classrooms and other facilities: parking spaces for vehicles of disabled persons have been arranged, university entrances have been equipped with ramps and a wireless help-call system; the Sherpa stair climber has been purchased for people with disabilities who need to navigate stairs in buildings. VSUES is also providing medical and recreational support of students with disabilities aimed at improving their health and developing their adaptive potential.

In 2014, an agreement was concluded between the VSUES and the Educational Testing Service (ETS), USA, to open a TOEFL IBT Center authorized to run the international TOEFL IBT exam.

Achievements:

The advantage of the University is its unique campus, which represents closed academic space encompassing academic buildings, dormitories, sports facilities and other infrastructure, which makes it very comfortable for students.

The University has all the necessary classrooms and state-of-the-art laboratories equipped with modern information and communication, facilities. The University has safe and comfortable environment. Staff and students' health is supported by the University's medical and diagnostic center, unique sports facilities and modern safety system.

Recommendations:

- It is recommended to expand wi-fi coverage at the University.
- It is recommended to use learning management systems to inform students of the academic mobility opportunities.
- It is advisable to establish the mechanism of making students aware regular on academic mobility opportunities on a regular basis.
- It is recommended to increase the budget for information technologies and digital resources.

3.7 Standard 7. Collection, analysis and use of information for managing the educational institution

*Compliance with the standard: **substantial compliance***

Table 7 - Criteria to Standard 7

№	Subject of Evaluation	Mark
1.	Availability and effectiveness of the system for collecting and monitoring information about the study programme	B
2.	Participation of students and staff of the educational institution in collecting and analyzing information for managing the study programme	A
3.	The educational institution should have in place a unified effective information system on the basis of modern information technologies for managing the study programme	B

Analysis of the educational programmes' compliance with the standard:

VSUES has been operating an effective automatized system for collecting information on all areas of the educational process.

The students' access to the learning resources is provided by 24/7 accessible "Learning Resources" service.

Feedback on students' satisfaction with the implementation of study programmes is obtained and evaluated through an annual survey, which is conducted through the University's electronic document management system.

VSUES regularly collects and monitors the statistics relating to employability of graduates through getting in touch with them on behalf of the major departments and the *Start-Career Regional Centre*. Twice a year the University holds recruitment fairs with the involvement of municipal and regional entities and businesses. The Start-Career Regional Centre has the list of vacancies posted on its website and on the Alumni page of the VSUES website.

To make information about the university Degrees Programmes easily accessible, it is posted and updated in the 'Education' section on the home page of the VSUES site as well as on the sites of VSUES major academic departments.

Achievements:

The University is developing the information system "E-Campus", which integrates the information infrastructure and corporative information environment. The Student's Personal Account is incorporated in this system, which allows all the participants of the academic process to have a better access to information.

Recommendations:

- It is advisable that a web-page should be developed for partners – representatives of authorities and business community in order to make them familiar with the contents of the educational programme and to give their suggestions on updating and reviewing the educational programmes.
- A mechanism for regular monitoring of the graduates' career development should be implemented in order to define the key indicators of the professional model of the graduate.

3.8 Standard 8. Public information

*Compliance with the standard: **full compliance***

Table 8 - Criteria to Standard 8

№	Subject of Evaluation	Mark
1.	Effective use of the official website of the study programme for its quality enhancement	A
2.	Publication of complete and accurate information on the study programme and its achievements on the official website of the educational institution and mass media	B
3.	Publication of objective data on the employability of graduates	B
4.	Integration in the environment, interaction of the educational institution with different professional associations and other organization including those from abroad	A

Analysis of the educational programmes' compliance with the standard:

The official website of the university is the main source of information about VSUES degree programmes for all stakeholders. The official site of the university provides prospective students with an access to complete and accurate information about university degree programmes and an opportunity to submit an application to enroll in VSUES.

The students can obtain relevant information about education process (such as class schedules, student consultation hours, syllabi, contacts of teachers and university departments). Moreover, the website allows for an effective feedback.

Parents can access information about their student progress and attendance, keep in touch with the university staff and teachers. This contributes to students' overall performance.

The official site has its versions in English and Chinese.

VSUES website posts general information about VSUES degree programmes, teachers (disciplines, publications, etc.), regulatory documents, information on employment.

Achievements:

The university has a Chinese version of the official web site.

The Start-Career Regional Centre publishes the annual 'Handbook on University Graduates' Employment'.

Recommendations:

- The information on the employment of foreign students-graduates of the programme should be included in the published list of graduates' employment.
- The information content about the university and study programmes in English should be enhanced.
- It is recommended that the number of information channels should be increased by using social networks, Youtube, etc. to inform about different events taking place at the university, departments, study programmes and lectures of leading teachers.

3.9   Standard 9. On-going monitoring and periodic review of programmes

*Compliance with the standard: **full compliance***

Table 9 - Criteria to Standard 9

№	Subject of Evaluation	Mark
1.	Documented procedures of monitoring and periodic review of study programmes should be in place	B
2.	Availability of a feedback mechanism for students, employers, branch ministries and departments (key stakeholders in employment) in the process of monitoring and periodic review of a study programme	A
3.	Effectiveness of procedures for monitoring and periodic review of a study programme (enhancement of programmes)	B

Analysis of the educational programmes' compliance with the standard:

VSUES has been implementing the procedures designed to review the contents of university degree programmes with the view to account for the latest developments in science and to keep the programmes up-to-date. Changes and amendments are made in the text of the programmes, in curricula design, academic schedules, workloads, syllabi, procedures for internships and final certification. The list of companies that offer student work placement is updated in accordance with the partnership agreements. WorldSkills standards are employed to enhance the quality of a number of courses.

An annual student survey (questionnaire) is carried out to determine students' expectations, needs and satisfaction with their university experiences. The student feedback is taken into account to ensure improved quality of the programmes.

In order to obtain feedback from VSUES graduates, a graduate database has been created which is updated annually.

Following the results of monitoring and periodic review, the degree programmes (their content, curricula, syllabi) are updated to account for the requirements of employers and regional labor market to enhance the quality of graduates' degrees.

Achievements:

The work on reviewing and updating the study programmes is conducted regularly in accordance with the requirements of the labour market and the tendencies of economic development.

At the working meetings of the University's management with representatives of the professional community the analyses of study programmes' implementation, identifying trends, strengths and weaknesses are carried out.

VSUES' engagement with stakeholders is regulated by approved mechanisms: involving prospective employers in development and updating study programmes, lecturing, supervising students' work placement, participating in the state examining board, defining the themes of graduation qualification papers, participating in research and practice conferences organized by the u niversity.

Recommendations:

- The practice of reviewing the study programmes by representatives of national and, if possible, international partner HEIs should be introduced.
- Regular surveying of recent graduates in order to receive their feedback on the quality of training should be put into practice. The results of such feedback should be made public.

3.10 Standard 10. Cyclical external quality assurance of study programmes

*Compliance with the standard: **substantial compliance***

Table 10 - Criteria to Standard 10

№	Subject of Evaluation	Mark
1.	Periodic review of a study programme	A
2.	Availability of a corrective actions programme to follow up the results of external evaluation of study programmes	B
3.	Consideration of the results of previous procedures of external evaluation when conducting subsequent external procedures	B

Analysis of the educational programmes' compliance with the standard:

In VSUES, the cyclical external quality assurance of degree programmes in carried out mainly by means of:
- state accreditation of degree programmes;
- public accreditation of selected degree programmes;
- participation in the All-Russian competition of departments and educational programmes in Economics and Management (organized by the Free Economic Society of Russia in cooperation with the State Duma of the Federal Assembly of the Russian Federation and the International Academy of Management);
- taking part in national, international, and scientific rankings.

However the Panel was not able to find any corrective action plans to follow up on the results of external evaluation of the degree programmes.

Achievements:

VSUES is effectively implementing the available tools of external quality assurance of the study programmes.

In the last few years based on the results of the international Academic Ranking of World Universities-European Standard (ARES) VSUES is placed among 100 best Russian Universities in the European Quality Standards and has steadily maintained its position: 86 (2 positions up compared to 2017) and category BB – «Reliable quality of teaching, research and employability of graduates (Good quality performance)».

Recommendations:

- A system for entering national and international subject-based rankings should be developed.
- A pool of external experts of national and international levels should be compiled for conducting regular external peer reviewing and updating the study programme: participating in the State Examining Board, assessing work placement and themes of graduation qualification papers.
- The action plan for corrective actions to follow up the results of external evaluation of the study programme should be developed.

4.   Recommendations for improvement

Thus, based on the analyses of the presented documents, meetings and interviews, conducted during the site-visit, with the purpose of enhancing the quality of implementing the educational programme under accreditation the Review Panel recommends that:

- The quality assurance policy should be updated and published with the account of the strategic objectives of the University.
- The mechanism of participation of executive authorities of the Primorsky Krai in the procedures of quality evaluation of the educational programmes should be defined.
- It is advisable to make students aware of the Diploma Supplement. This is particularly important for international students.
- The networking programmes should be introduced to enhance academic mobility of students and teachers.
- It is recommended to develop measures to recruit teachers from foreign HEIs to deliver programmes.
- The measures on promotion of the activities of the Graduates Association should be developed.
- The audit of subject-specific disciplines of the educational programmes should be carried out to include compulsory study and acquisition of skills for working with specialized software.
- Taking into account close relations of the University with regional enterprises and opinions of employers, representatives of the professional community should also review graduation theses of Bachelor students.
- It is recommended to analyze the market of educational services in order to sign agreements on networking programmes with HEIs in Russia and abroad.
- A mechanism for regular monitoring of the graduates' career development should be implemented in order to define the key indicators of the professional model of the graduate.

5. CONCLUSION

Based on the self-evaluation report analysis, documents and data submitted the External Review Panel has come to the conclusion that the cluster of educational programmes in «Economics» (38.03.01), «Management» (38.03.02), «Business Informatics» (38.03.05) **substantially** comply with the standards and criteria of public accreditation of the National Centre for Public Accreditation.

The Panel recommends that the National Accreditation Board accredit the cluster of educational programmes in «Economics» (38.03.01), «Management» (38.03.02), «Business Informatics» (38.03.05) delivered by Vladivostok State University of Economics and Service for the period of **6** years.

Annex A

External review of the cluster of educational programmes in the fields of study:

«Economics» (38.03.01),
«Management» (38.03.02),
«Business Informatics» (38.03.05)

delivered by Vladivostok State University of Economics and Service

SCHEDULE OF THE SITE VISIT OF THE EXTERNAL REVIEW PANEL

Time	Activity	Participants	Venue
May 21, Tuesday			
8.45	Arrival at the University		Building 1, 41, Gogolya Str.
09.00 — 11.00	First meeting of the External Review Panel		Small Hall, Rector's Office, Building 1
11.00 — 12.00	**Meeting of the ERP with the University administration and people responsible for accreditation**	Rector, Vice-Rectors, people responsible for accreditation, ERP	Biriuzovy Zal, Rector's Office, Building 1
12.00 — 13.30	Tour of the University (visiting classrooms, library, etc.)	ERP	Buildings 1, 2, 3, 8
13.30 — 14.30	Lunch		Restaurant «Avanta»
14.30 — 15.00	Internal meeting of the Panel	ERP	Room 1525, Building 1
15.00 — 16.00	**Meeting with Heads of Department, Deputy Heads**	Heads of Departments, Deputy Heads, ERP	Room 1335, Building 1
16.00 — 17.00	Work with documents	ERP	Room 1525, Building 1
17.00 — 18.00	**Meeting with representatives of professional community**	Employers, ERP	Room 1335, Building 1
18.00 — 18.30	Internal meeting of the Panel	ERP	Room 1525, Building 1

Time	Activity	Participants	Venue
May 22, Wednesday			
9.45	Arrival at the University		Building 1, 41, Gogolya Str.
10.00 — 11.00	**Meeting with teachers**	Teachers, ERP	Room 1335, Building 1
11.00 — 11.30	Internal meeting of the Panel	ERP	Room 1525, Building 1
11.30 — 12.30	**Meeting with students**	Students, ERP	Room 1335, Building 1
12.30 — 13.00	Internal meeting of the Panel/attending classes (optional)	ERP	Room 1525, Building 1
13.00 — 14.00	Lunch		Restaurant «Avanta»
14.00 — 15.00	Work with documents, assessment forms / attending classes (optional)	ERP	Room 1525, Building 1
15.00 — 16.00	**Meeting with graduates**	Graduates, ERP	Room 1335, Building 1
16.00 — 18.30	Work with documents, assessment forms	ERP	Room 1525, Building 1
May 23, Thursday			
08.45	Arrival at the University		Building 1, 41, Gogolya Str.
09.00 — 12.00	Internal meeting of the Panel: discussion of preliminary results of the site visit, preparation of the oral report of the panel	ERP	Room 1525, Building 1
12.00 — 13.00	**Closing meeting of the External Review Panel with the representatives of the University**	ERP, University administration, Heads of the Graduate Departments, teachers, students	Hall of the Academic Council, Rector's Office, Building 1
13.00 — 14.00	Lunch		Restaurant «Avanta»
	Departure		

Annex B

REVIEW SCALE FOR EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMMES

№ п/п	Standards	Assessment of the study programme			
		Full compliance	Substantial (significant) compliance	Partial compliance (improvements needed)	Non-compliance
1.	Policy (goals, development strategy) and quality assurance procedures of the educational programme		√		
2.	Design and approval of programmes	√			
3.	Student-centered learning and assessment		√		
4.	Student admission, support of academic achievements and graduation		√		
5.	Teaching staff		√		
6.	Learning resources and student support		√		
7.	Collection, analysis and use of information for managing the educational institution		√		
8.	Public information	√			
9.	On-going monitoring and periodic assessment of the educational programmes	√			
10.	Cyclical external quality assurance of the educational programmes		√		