Челябинский
государственный
университет

National Centre for
Public Accreditation

REPORT

ON EXTERNAL REVIEW

of the cluster of educational programmes in:

«Foreign Regional Studies» (41.03.01),
«Politology» (41.03.04, 41.04.04),
«International Relations» (41.03.05, 41.04.05),
«History» (46.03.01, 46.04.01),
«Historical Studies and Archeology» (46.06.01),

delivered by Chelyabinsk State University

Chelyabinsk, 2018

REPORT
ON EXTERNAL REVIEW

of the cluster of educational programmes in:

«Foreign Regional Studies» (41.03.01),
«Politology» (41.03.04, 41.04.04),
«International Relations» (41.03.05, 41.04.05),
«History» (46.03.01, 46.04.01),
«Historical Studies and Archeology» (46.06.01),

delivered by Chelyabinsk State University

The Chair of the Review Panel　　　　　　　　　Shulan Zhang

Chelyabinsk, 2018

CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION

External review of the cluster of educational programmes in «Foreign Regional Studies» (41.03.01), «Politology» (41.03.04, 41.04.04), «International Relations» (41.03.05, 41.04.05), «History» (46.03.01, 46.04.01), «Historical Studies and Archeology» (46.06.01) delivered by Chelyabinsk State University was conducted on September 26-28, 2018 and included the analyses of self-evaluation report, site visit and preparation of the present report.

The main goal of the external review is to determine the correspondence of the reviewed cluster of educational programmes in «Foreign Regional Studies» (41.03.01), «Politology» (41.03.04, 41.04.04), «International Relations» (41.03.05, 41.04.05), «History» (46.03.01, 46.04.01), «Historical Studies and Archeology» (46.06.01) delivered by Chelyabinsk State University to standards and criteria of public accreditation, which are developed by the National Centre for Public Accreditation (hereinafter - NCPA) and determined in compliance with the European Standards of Quality Assurance in Education ESG-ENQA.

The Final Report is the reason for decision of the National Accreditation Board on public accreditation of the study programmes in compliance with standards and criteria of NCPA.

1.   CONTEXT AND MAIN STAGES OF THE REVIEW

1.1   Terms of Reference

According to item 1, 3 article 96 of the Federal Law of the Russian Federation of December 29, 2012 N.273-FZ "On education in the Russian Federation" organizations, which implement educational activities, may apply for public accreditation in various national, foreign and international institutions; employers, employer associations and designated organizations have the right to conduct public accreditation of professional educational programmes, which are delivered by an educational institution.

In order to conduct public accreditation of the cluster of educational programmes in «Foreign Regional Studies» (41.03.01), «Politology» (41.03.04, 41.04.04), «International Relations» (41.03.05, 41.04.05), «History» (46.03.01, 46.04.01), «Historical Studies and Archeology» (46.06.01) Chelyabinsk State University applied to NCPA, which operates on the national level and is recognized by leading international organizations of quality assurance in higher education.

1.2   Composition of the Review Panel

The international experts were nominated by foreign quality assurance agencies upon NCPA's request.

The Russian expert was nominated by the Guild of Experts in Higher Education.

The employer representative was nominated by the Head of the Regional Executive Committee of the All-Russian Political Party «United Russia».

The representative of the students' community was suggested by the administration of South Ural State University (National Research University).

The composition of the International Review Panel was approved by NCPA.

The Review Panel included five international and national experts:

- **Shulan Zhang** - PhD, Director of the Center for South Asian Studies, professor of the School of Political Science and Public Administration, Shandong University, member of Chinese Federation of South Asian Studies, member of the International Association of Asian Scholars — foreign expert, Review Chair;

- **Evgeniya Demchik** - Doctor of Historical Sciences, professor, Dean of the Historical Faculty, Head of the Department for Russian History at Altai State University — Russian Expert, Deputy Review Chair;

- **Pero Maldini** - PhD, Head of the Department of Mass Communication at University of Dubrovnik, Head of the Department of Interdisciplinary Sciences at Edward Bernays College of Communication Management (Zagreb), Head of Interdisciplinary Doctoral Study of Communication Science at the University of Osijek, Member of Croatian Political Science Association Executive Board (HPD), Member of Institute for European and Globalization Studies (IEGIS), Member of Croatian Public Relations Association (HUOJ) — foreign expert, panel member;

- **Aleksei Krivokora** - Deputy Head of the Regional Executive Committee, Head of the Chelyabinsk Party Building Department of the All-Russian Political Party "United Russia" — representative of professional community, panel member;

- **Evgeniy Petrov** - 2nd year postgraduate student, Historical Faculty, Institute of Social and Humanitarian Sciences, South Ural State University (national research university) — representative of student community, panel member.

The focused expert knowledge of the Panel members, long-term experience of working in the system of higher education and profession, active position of students and employers became the basis for effective consideration of issues within the framework of evaluation.

The participation of the Russian representatives of the higher education system gave an opportunity to analyze the activity of the programmes under evaluation in the context of the world trends in quality assurance and within the scope of the national educational system.

1.3 Purposes and objectives of the review

The purpose of the public accreditation is improving quality of education and forming quality culture in educational institutions, discovering best practices in continuous enhancing the educational quality and public information on educational institutions in accordance with the European educational quality standards.

The main goal of the peer review is to determine the correspondence of the reviewed cluster of the educational programmes in «Foreign Regional Studies» (41.03.01), «Politology» (41.03.04, 41.04.04), «International Relations» (41.03.05, 41.04.05), «History» (46.03.01, 46.04.01), «Historical Studies and Archeology» (46.06.01) delivered by Chelyabinsk State University to standards and criteria of public accreditation, which are developed by NCPA

and determined in compliance with the European Standards of Quality Assurance in Education ESG-ENQA; and to develop recommendations for the study programme with the purpose of improving the contents and structure of the study process.

1.4 Stages of the review

The review included three main stages:

1.4.1 Study of the self-evaluation report

Chelyabinsk State University was responsible for conducting the self-evaluation procedure, developing and timely submitting of the self-evaluation report to NCPA.

According to the "Guidelines on Self-evaluation of Educational Programmes", which were developed by NCPA, the self-evaluation report is written on **45** pages and includes: introduction, findings, conclusions, annexes. The self-evaluation procedure was conducted on the basis of SWOT-analysis according to every standard of NCPA.

According to the review schedule the self-evaluation report of the cluster of educational programmes in «Foreign Regional Studies» (41.03.01), «Politology» (41.03.04, 41.04.04), «International Relations» (41.03.05, 41.04.05), «History» (46.03.01, 46.04.01), «Historical Studies and Archeology» (46.06.01) was submitted to NCPA and mailed to the members of the review panel 30 days before the site-visit.

While studying the self-evaluation report the panel members formed a preliminary opinion about the reviewed educational programmes on compliance with the NCPA standards and criteria on accreditation and with the European standards of education quality.

The members of the review panel assessed the quality of preparation of the self-evaluation report with regards to its text structuring, compliance of information with the report's sections; quality of perception; sufficiency of analytical data; availability of references to supporting documents; completeness of information.

According to NCPA's standards and criteria of accreditation the preliminary assessment of the cluster of educational programmes in «Foreign Regional Studies» (41.03.01), «Politology» (41.03.04, 41.04.04), «International Relations» (41.03.05, 41.04.05), «History» (46.03.01, 46.04.01), «Historical Studies and Archeology» (46.06.01) may be defined as substantial compliance.

At the preliminary meeting members of the review panel formulated the lines of inquiry, which defined the main strategy of the site-visit.

1.4.2 Site-visit

The review panel visited Chelyabinsk State University on September 26-28, 2018 with the purpose of confirming the authenticity of the information, which was presented in the self-evaluation report, collecting extra information on the implementation of the accredited programme and checking its compliance with the standards and criteria of NCPA developed in accordance with the European standards of education quality assurance.

The time line and the agenda of the site-visit were determined by NCPA, and approved by the administration of Chelyabinsk State University and the members of the review panel.

During the site-visit the review board members conducted a number of meetings and interviews with the University administration, Deans, Deputy Deans, Heads of Departments, graduates, teachers, students, postgraduate students of Chelyabinsk State University, and representatives of the professional community.

The Chair of the review panel managed the panel's work.

The panel considers that the self-evaluation report, which was presented by Chelyabinsk state University, provided the experts with an opportunity to form an integral view on specific features of implementation of the reviewed cluster of educational programmes in «Foreign Regional Studies» (41.03.01), «Politology» (41.03.04, 41.04.04), «International Relations» (41.03.05, 41.04.05), «History» (46.03.01, 46.04.01), «Historical Studies and Archeology» (46.06.01).

The studied documents and the interviewed persons, visits to the library in the main building and specialized library of humanitarian faculties (collection of rare books, collection of books in foreign languages), Museum of Archeology and Ethnography, Museum of the Faculty of Eurasia and East, language rooms, classrooms of simultaneous interpretation (including classrooms for disabled people), the Centre of Language Training and Testing, and recreation areas provided the review panel members with sufficient information about reviewed educational programmes, their contents and organization, infrastructure, resources and management.

The review panel considers it necessary to highlight the effective cooperation of the experts and NCPA employees during the site-visit and its preparation.

The review panel notes the highest level of organizational provision and constructive work.

The executive staff of Chelyabinsk State University provided the administrative support, which included arrangement of meetings and interviews, provision with working space, computers with access to the Internet, necessary research, academic and methodological documents.

During the site-visit the review panel members requested additional documents for scrutiny, in particular, information about staff and graduates' employability.

On the last day of the site-visit the Chair of the review panel presented an oral report on the general conclusions to the executive staff of the University.

The agenda of the site-visit can be found in the Annex.

1.4.3 Conclusion on the findings of the external review

Based on the results of the external review of Chelyabinsk State University the review panel submitted the Report on the results of the external review of the cluster of the educational programmes in «Foreign Regional Studies» (41.03.01), «Politology» (41.03.04, 41.04.04), «International Relations» (41.03.05, 41.04.05), «History» (46.03.01, 46.04.01), «Historical Studies and Archeology» (46.06.01) delivered by the educational institution.

The draft report of **28** pages excluding Annexes was developed by the Chair of the Review Panel, approved by other Review panel members and submitted to the National Centre for Public Accreditation. Then the Report was mailed to the University's administration for making factual amendments.

2. DESCRIPTION OF THE STUDY PROGRAMMES

Chelyabinsk State University is a multidisciplinary educational institution founded in 1976. There are 14 Faculties and 5 Institutes. The University has three branches, one of which is located in the Republic of Kazakhstan.

Two faculties and six departments are responsible for implementation of the educational programmes under accreditation:
– Faculty of History and Philology (Sergei Bakanov, acting Dean, Doctor of Historical Sciences, Associate Professor);
– Faculty of Eurasia and East (Elvina Yagnakova, Dean, Candidate of Pedagogic Sciences);
– Department of Russian and Foreign History (Sergei Bakanov, Head of the Department, Doctor of Historical Sciences, Associate Professor);
– Department of Political Science and International Relations (Artiom Skvortsov, acting Head of the Department, Candidate of Historical Sciences);
– Department of Foreign Regional Studies, Political Science, and Oriental Philosophy (Maksim Georgiyevich Smirnov, Candidate of Philosophical Sciences, Associate Professor);
– Department of Oriental and Romano-Germanic Languages (Irina Glukhova, acting Head of the Department, Candidate of Pedagogic Sciences).

All these educational programmes are developed on the basis of federal state educational standards of higher education approved by the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation. Documents that regulate implementation of the educational programmes are presented on the official web-site. Every educational programme is oriented at specific area of knowledge. Kinds of activities, contents of the educational programmes, expected learning outcomes, conditions of programmes' implementation are defined in accordance with the programme specialization.

High quality of students' training is provided by a highly-qualified teaching staff. Teachers have basic education that correspond to their specialization and provides efficient research and methodological activity.

There is monitoring research on students' employability. Graduate are in demand on the regional labour market.

3. FINDINGS

3.1 Standard 1. Policy (goals, development strategy) and quality assurance procedures of the study programmes

*Compliance with the standard: **Full compliance***

Table 1 – Criteria to Standard 1

№	Subject of Evaluation	Mark
1.	Availability of a documented inner quality assurance system providing continuous enhancement of quality in accordance with the developmental strategy of the educational institution	A
2.	Participation of all stakeholders (administration, teaching staff, students, employers, employer associations, branch ministries and departments – key partners in employment of graduates) in developing and implementing a quality assurance policy through relevant structures and processes	A
3.	Participation of all structural units of an educational institution in quality assurance processes and procedures	A

Analysis of the educational programmes' compliance with the standard:

Members of the External Review Panel concluded that the internal quality assurance system of the University provides continuous improvement of quality in accordance with the development strategy of the University. Educational quality policy at Chelyabinsk State University is based on the Concept of Strategic Development of the University for 2014-2020 as well as on the Development Programme of the University for 2017-2021 approved by the Conference of Employees and Students on December 23, 2016.

There is a system of internal efficiency monitoring of the University subdivisions. Teachers' salaries are based on their research-related achievements. There are Educational Policy Department and Research Department at the University that supervise evaluation of training quality.

All stakeholders (administration, teaching staff, students, employers, representatives of subject-specific ministries and departments, the Board of Trustees and Association of Graduates of Chelyabinsk State University) participate in development and implementation of quality assurance policy at the University.

Achievements:

- development strategies at the Faculty of History and Philology and the Faculty of Eurasia and East correspond to the mission and development strategy of the University;

- all University subdivisions participate in the processes and procedures of the internal quality assurance system;

- the Department of Education Quality implements quality assurance policy and cooperates with faculties and supervisors of educational programmes to improve the study programmes.

Additional recommendations:

It is recommended for the Heads of Departments (supervisors of educational programmes) to participate more actively in the processes and procedures of the internal quality assurance system.

3.2 Standard 2. Design and approval of programmes

Compliance with the standard: ***Full compliance***

Table 2 – Criteria to Standard 2

№	Subject of Evaluation	Mark
1.	Availability and accessibility of clearly defined, documented, approved and published goals and objectives of a study programme and expected learning outcomes and their correspondence to the mission and goals and objectives of the educational institution	A
2.	Availability of procedures for design, approval and revision of a study programme (including expected learning outcomes) with the account of the development of science and industry, and also with the consideration of stakeholder opinions (administration, teaching staff, students, employers)	A
3.	Consideration of the requirements of professional standards (if available), of labour market, of national qualification framework descriptors in the study programme	A

Analysis of the educational programmes' compliance with the standard:

During the interviews with the administration of the Faculty of History and Philology and the Faculty of Eurasia and East, with the Heads of Departments, students and employers it has been found that there are local normative acts at the University that regulate development and approval of educational programmes – «Regulations on the Development and Approval of Study Programmes».

The programmes have clearly defined purposes and objectives that correspond to the mission and development strategy of the University.

Achievements:

- educational programmes on the faculties correspond to the mission and Development Programme of the University;

- representatives of the faculties participate in the Tempus Project for the Development of Qualifications Framework for the Higher Education in the Ural Region that gave an opportunity to improve quality of graduates training.

Recommendations:

1. It is recommended to involve employers, federal and municipal authorities in discussion of goals, expected learning outcomes and contents of educational programmes.

2. It is advisable to extend variety of master's degree programmes in accordance with modern requirements of the labour market.

3.3 Standard 3. Student-centered learning, teaching and assessment

*Compliance with the standard: **Full compliance***

Table 3 – Criteria to Standard 3

№	Subject of Evaluation	Mark
1.	Consideration of needs of diverse groups of students and a possibility to create individual learning paths	A
2.	Use of methods encouraging students to take an active part in creating the learning process	B
3.	Use of clearly defined criteria and objective assessment procedures of learning outcomes/ competences of students corresponding to the expected learning outcomes, goals of the study programme and their purpose (diagnostic, formative or summative assessment)	A
4.	Information about the study programme, criteria and procedures for assessment of learning outcomes/competencies, about examinations, tests and other types of control.	A
5.	Use of procedures of independent assessment of learning outcomes	A
6.	Availability and effectiveness of appeals procedure and procedures for dealing with students complaints	A

Analysis of the educational programmes' compliance with the standard:

Students can have an individual curriculum. The University uses a Point Scoring System of evaluation of students' academic progress. Criteria, requirements and results of evaluation are presented in students' personal accounts in the Moodle system. Pools of assessment tools for each educational programme are renewed every year.

Students are well informed about criteria and evaluation of learning outcomes / competences, exams, credits and other forms of control. There are local normative acts that regulate interim and final attestation of students.

An effective feedback system via students' surveys «Students' View of the Learning Process» and «Students' View of the Professor», personal appeals to the University administration, meetings with teachers, the Deans' Office and the Student Government helps to analyze efficiency of the educational process.

Achievements:

- the University is a platform that hosts the Federal Online Examination for Bachelor Graduates. Students regularly participate in regional and international Olympiads and become prize winners;

- the University has created a good environment for students to pass international exams;

- students and professors respect each other, as must be in a classical university environment. The Commission for the Settlement of Disputes Between Parties in Education works at the University.

Additional recommendations:

1. It is necessary to inform students about the opportunities to file an appeal in case of claims concerning the educational process.

2. It is advisable to provide students with the opportunity to express their opinion about the educational process anonymously as the element of quality control system.

3.4 Standard 4. Student admission, support of academic achievements and graduation

Compliance with the standard: ***Full compliance***

Table 4 - Criteria to Standard 4

№	Subject of Evaluation	Mark
1.	Systematic carrier guidance work targeted at the recruiting and selection of applicants should be in place	A
2.	Availability and effectiveness of rules and regulations for admission, transfer of students from other educational institutions, recognition of qualifications, periods of study and prior learning	A
3.	Systematic work to support students' progression	A
4.	Recognition of higher education qualifications obtained in the RF and abroad (Diploma Supplement)	A
5.	Participation of students in mobility programmes	B

Analysis of the educational programmes' compliance with the standard:

There is a two-level career-guidance system (University, Faculty). The University approves its Special Program to attract well-qualified and competent applicants.

The Minister of Education and Science of Chelyabinsk Oblast, the CSU Rector, the Head of the Chelyabinsk Office of Academic Affairs, and the Chairman of the Chelyabinsk Regional Organization of Trade Unions in Public Education and Science signed a quadruple agreement to establish the Chelyabinsk University Educational District, in the frames of which various activities for pupils are held.

There is a system of first-year students' acquaintance with the University. Support of the educational process and academic mobility of students complies with the European standards.

The University offers academic-exchange programs with short-term (for less than a term) or long-term (for one or two terms) studies at foreign partner universities. Subjects and internships taken during such exchange are recognized at Chelyabinsk State University.

91 students from the University took part in academic exchanges, including programmes that are implemented in terms of cooperation agreements. 53 students studied at partner universities in China (the University of Liaocheng and Shenyang Normal University), Spain (Nebrija University), Germany (Kiel University of Applied Arts and Catholic University of Eichstätt-Ingolstadt), France (Campus La Salle Saint Christophe), and other countries. Students actively participate in grant programmes financed in terms of intergovernmental agreements. In 2017 21 students of the University studied in China and Hungary under governmental scholarships.

Chelyabinsk State University takes an active part in implementing the state project on development of export potential of Russian education, especially in attraction and enrollment of foreign students. On January 1 –

December 31, 2017 students from 16 countries studied at the University. As a part of interuniversity cooperation and exchange agreements, the educational institutioh organized studies, research training, and internships for 40 students from Kazakhstan.

Achievements:

- the Faculty of History and Philology and the Faculty of Eurasia and East have the highest grade point average on unified state exam that represents efficiency of career-guidance work;

- an effective support system of students' academic achievements is in place;

- conditions for international mobility are created.

Recommendations:

1. It is recommended to intensify inbound student mobility, to sign agreements with foreign universities, and to implement double degree programmes.

2. It is advisable to develop the educational programmes in English and to include modules in foreign languages in existing educational programmes.

Additional recommendations:

It is recommended to use selection testing to improve effectiveness and transparency of student enrollment for master degree programmes.

3.5 Standard 5. Teaching staff

Compliance with the standard: ***Full compliance***

Table 5 - Criteria to Standard 5

№	Subject of Evaluation	Mark
1.	Qualification and competence of the teaching staff : − Academic degrees and titles; − Industry and state awards and prizes; − Practical experience; − Published text books, handbooks and methodological guidebooks	A
2.	Relevance of specialists, degrees and titles and /or practical experience to the profile of the study programme	A
3.	Research activity of the teaching staff, implementation of research results in the academic process	B
4.	Use of innovative teaching methods and advanced technologies	A
5.	Visiting lecturers from other educational institutions including those from abroad	A
6.	Participation of the teachers in joint international projects, internships abroad, academic mobility programmes	B
7.	A system of financial and non-financial incentives for teachers	B
8.	Availability and use of clear, transparent and objective criteria for: − Hiring staff including teachers from foreign educational institutions, assignment to positions, promotion, dismissal; − Dismissal of teachers with low level of professional competency	A
9.	A system for career development and professional advancement for teachers	A

Analysis of the educational programmes' compliance with the standard:

Highly qualified teachers work at the Faclties. Academic degree holders rate is generally more than 80%. The competence of the teaching staff is well-appreciated on both regional and national levels. Professors hold honorary titles.

Teachers' qualification and work experience correspond to educational programmes; they do research, implement interactive training methods and participate in international projects and programmes.

Professors from other national and foreign educational institutions gave a number of lectures and taught several modules at the University (Patrick Hanks (the UK) worked in 2016; Thomas Sniegon (Sweden), Anatoly Pinsky (United States), Ilya Kukulin (National Research University Higher School of Economics, Russia), A. Klotz (St. Petersburg), A. Savin (Institute of History, Novosibirsk Branch of the Russian Academy of Sciences), and Dr. Frank Liedke (Germany) worked in 2017; Majid Abbasi from Iran worked in 2018. In addition, in 2015 and 2017 students attended lectures given by Ambassadors Extraordinary and Plenipotentiary of Iran and the Republic of Korea in Russia – Mr. Mehdi Sanaei and Mr. Park Ro-byug correspondingly.

Teachers and students do research and implement the results in the educational process. On an annual basis, the Faculties approve their research plans, adjust the research efforts of departments and student research associations, and discuss research reports. Basic research is carried out within the framework of theses, grants, and state-provided Statements of Work. In 2017 Research and Development spending was 57.972.4 thousand rubles, or 90.92 thousand rubles per faculty member.

The Faculties carried out two projects under Statements of Work by the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation, 1 grant of the Russian Science Foundation, 1 project supported by the Russian Presidential Council for Grants, 4 projects supported by the grants of the Russian Humanitarian Science Foundation, 1 project supported by the Russian Foundation for Basic Research. Over 5 years, teachers of the Faculty of History and Philology and the Faculty of Eurasia and East have won multiple grants of the University's Young Scientists Foundation and Advanced Research Foundation.

From 2014 to 2018 teachers of the Graduate Departments published 3 coursebooks, 1 study guide, 4 training and methodological books and prepared more that 10 study guides.

In 2017 teachers published 24 articles in the journals of Web of Science and 28 articles in the journals of Scopus in terms of Statements of Work.

Clear, transparent, and objective criteria are used for recruitment of teachers. Conditions for their professional development are created.

Achievements:

- increase in the number of Doctors of Sciences under 50 years of age and Candidates of Sciences under 40 years of age is in place;
- an effective system of financial and non-financial incentives for teachers that includes incentive payments, performance-based contracts of employment, and annual competition «Faces of Chelyabinsk State University» is in place.

Recommendations:

1. It is recommended to improve research activities and international mobility of teachers (to take into account publication activities in selection for a position; to participate in filing an application for grants, to support learning of a foreign language, etc.).

2. It is advisable to expand the system of financial and non-financial support of teachers to promote their professional development.

3.6 Standard 6. Learning resources and student support

Compliance with the standard: ***Full compliance***

Table 6 - Criteria to Standard 6

№	Subject of Evaluation	Mark
1.	Provision of the study programme with material and technical recourses in accordance with the requirements of the curriculum (modern tools, equipment, computers, classrooms, laboratories)	A
2.	Availability of up-to-date library and information resources including those for independent study and research work	A
3.	Availability of infrastructure to ensure access to quality education to students with different opportunities and of different age, and to provide the development of social and educational component of the academic process	A
4.	The system of feedback on the satisfaction with conditions and organization of the study process should be in place	A
5.	Availability of accessible information about opportunities for student mobility and its support system	B

Analysis of the educational programmes' compliance with the standard:

Implementation of the educational programmes is carried out in compliance with all the requirements of the educational standards: there are multimedia classrooms, language room, rooms for course project design, university laboratories and curriculum office, library, dining hall, gym, botanic garden, student dormitories.

The library stock contains more than 700 thousand items. There are collections of rare books and collection of books in foreign languages. Students have an access to e-library systems. The University has a system of accessible higher education for disabled and impaired people.

Chelyabinsk State University has educational programmes for pupils, their parents and foreign applicants ("Small University", "Small Academy", "Children's University", "Sunday University").

Student feedback is provided by means of internship diaries and anonymous surveys that are held every term. It helps to improve work of teachers and quality of the educational process.

Achievements:

- material and technical resources of the educational process make it possible to use modern methods of training;

- barrier-free environment that is a model platform for inclusive training of people with disabilities is in place;

- a feedback system is in place.

Recommendations:

It is recommended to raise awareness of students about the possibilities of academic mobility by publishing information on the web-sites of the University and faculties.

3.7 Standard 7. Collection, analysis and use of information for managing the study programme

Compliance with the standard: ***Full compliance***

Table 7 - Criteria to Standard 7

№	Subject of Evaluation	Mark
1.	Availability and effectiveness of the system for collecting and monitoring information about the study programme	A
2.	Participation of students and staff of the educational institution in collecting and analyzing information for managing the study programme	A
3.	The educational institution should have in place a unified effective information system on the basis of modern information technologies for managing the study programme	A

Analysis of the educational programmes' compliance with the standard:

The University uses a university management system based on the platform «1C: University». Electronic document flow is actively used. Educational programmes are provided with teaching materials. Contents of all disciplines are represented in the local network of the University.

Students have an access to the Internet, unlimited access to several e-library systems (electronic libraries) and to electronic information educational environment of the educational institution.

Monitoring of quality of educational activities is carried out by means of the assessment system (current, interim, final), opinion polls of students, employers, staff, graduates, the internal audit system (students' academic progress, training quality, work of departments for a specific period, etc.), and department/faculty ratings based on the results of internal monitoring.

Monitoring outcomes are discussed at the extended meetings of the Rector's Office, at Departments meetings, Academic Councils of the University and faculties, meetings of the teaching commission, meetings of students with the administration of the University and faculties, and meetings of the educational commissions.

Training materials are represented in the personal accounts of teachers in the Moodle system. Students have an access to the electronic library system that contains materials and publications on the primary subjects. Access is provided under agreements with copyright holders.

Achievements:

- a unique and extensive information system that ensures efficient implementation of the educational programmes is in place;
- there is a system of management and complex administration "Electronic Dean's Office" that contains database of students and graduates.

Recommendations:

It is recommended to provide active participation of the Heads of Departments (supervisors of the educational programmes) in regular monitoring of achievements of the educational programmes in comparison with similar programmes in other educational institutions.

3.8 Standard 8. Public information

Compliance with the standard: ***Substantial compliance***

Table 8 - Criteria to Standard 8

№	Subject of Evaluation	Mark
1.	Effective use of the official website of the study programme for its quality enhancement	A
2.	Publication of complete and accurate information on the study programme and its achievements on the official website of the educational institution and mass media	B
3.	Publication of objective data on the employability of graduates	B
4.	Integration in the environment, interaction of the educational institution with different professional associations and other organization including those from abroad	B

Analysis of the educational programmes' compliance with the standard:

Complete and accurate information about the educational programmes under accreditation is published on the official web-site of the Faculty of History and Philology and the Faculty of Eurasia and East. The web-site is available for visually impaired people as well as in the English language.

Information about the educational programmes is published in the University's newspaper «Universitetskaya Naberezhnaya», in social networks and is broadcasted via video channel of the University.

The University has established an efficient system to help its graduates find jobs. The educational institution signs agreements with employers to prepare students for future professions.

Chelyabinsk State University is a regional Centre of Graduate Employment and Labor Market Adaptation. It actively cooperates with regional and municipal authorities on staff training and employment issues. Graduates are in demand not only in the Chelyabinsk Region but in other Russian regions and in foreign countries.

Academic support on the international market is carried out with the help of Diploma Supplement due to which countries mutually recognize documents about higher education.

There are Supervisory Board of Employers and Association of Graduates at the University to support graduates' employability.

Teachers of the Graduate Departments are members of regional non-governmental organizations and professional communities - Russian Historical Society, Russian Association of Political Science, Civic Chamber of Chelyabinsk Oblast, Chelyabinsk Branch of the Association of Japonologists, Chelyabinsk Administration's Coordinating Council for Cooperation with Ethno-Cultural and

Religious Non-Profit Organizations, Russian Society of Russian Language and Literature Teachers.

Since 1998 joint educational programmes with foreign educational institutions from China, Japan, Kazakhstan, Iran, Poland, etc. are implemented as part of international activities. Chelyabinsk State University is the first university in Russia to give Diploma Supplement.

The following international conferences and competitions were organized:
- International Research Conference «Destiny of National Cultures in the Conditions of Globalization»;
- International Congress «Russia in International Dialogue»;
- IV International Scientific Conference «Human Life: Problems of Unity in Diversity of the Modern World»;
- International Round Table «Prospects of Cooperation of Russia and Kazakhstan in the Sphere of Higher Education» in the frames of the Forum of Russian-Kazakhstani Cooperation.

The main international projects are the following: intellectual competition «International Political Games», International Congress «Russia in the International Dialogue», International Models of summits of the Shanghai Cooperation Organization and BRICS, G20, International School «Russia and China: Cultural Bridge», International School «East in Your Life and Your Future», Academic Programme «Academic Workshop».

Chelyabinsk State University is a member of the International Association of Teachers of the Russian Language and Literature and the Association of Classical Universities of Russia and China.

Achievements:

- the University participates in international research on future career of graduates (European online survey «Education and Career», Career Test);
- representatives of various companies, language schools, regional Chamber of Commerce and Industry, embassies of the Russian Federation in different countries (China, Japan, Korea, USA, UAE, etc.) are graduates of the Faculty of Eurasia and East.

Recommendations:

1. It is recommended to publish accurate and brief information about the educational programme (staff, subjects, forms of training– remote, contact), including information in the English language, on the official web-site of the University to inform the public about the educational programmes.

2. It is advisable to publish objective information about graduates' employability on the official web-site of the University.

3. It is necessary to continue work on development of international cooperation (membership in international organizations, filing an application to foreign funds, development of academic mobility, cooperation agreements with top-rated universities that provide mutual mobility of students and teachers).

3.9 Standard 9. On-going monitoring and periodic review of programmes

Compliance with the standard: ***Full compliance***

Table 9 - Criteria to Standard 9

№	Subject of Evaluation	Mark
1.	Documented procedures of monitoring and periodic review of study programmes should be in place	A
2.	Availability of a feedback mechanism for students, employers, branch ministries and departments (key stakeholders in employment) in the process of monitoring and periodic review of a study programme	A
3.	Effectiveness of procedures for monitoring and periodic review of a study programme (enhancement of programmes)	A

Analysis of the educational programmes' compliance with the standard:

The University has an Internal Education Quality Assurance System that considers monitoring and assessment of the educational programmes in accordance with local normative acts that regulate activities of the University's subdivisions. Contents of the educational programmes are discussed and corrected at the meetings of the Departments.

Students have the possibility to make an individual learning path by choosing subjects from a variable part of the curriculum.

The educational programmes are improved on the basis of consideration of opinions of students, teachers, employers, analysis of feedback and marketing research of the labour market.

Achievements:

- there is an Internal Education Quality Assurance System at the University;
- educational programmes are regularly improved.

Recommendations:

1. It is recommended to provide students with a wider range of choice of individual learning paths, including accelerated education.

2. It is advisable to involve practitioners in the educational process and improve conditions and contents of internships and practical studies.

3.10 Standard 10. Cyclical external quality assurance of study programmes

Compliance with the standard: ***Full compliance***

Table 10 - Criteria to Standard 10

№	Subject of Evaluation	Mark
1.	Periodic review of a study programme	A
2.	Availability of a corrective actions programme to follow up the results of external evaluation of study programmes	A
3.	Consideration of the results of previous procedures of external evaluation when conducting subsequent external procedures	A

Analysis of the educational programmes' compliance with the standard:

External evaluation of the educational programmes is carried out regularly on the basis of expert opinions of employers, state and public accreditation, various forms of independent assessment of students and graduates knowledge, and participation of the University in efficiency monitoring of higher education institutions of the Russian Federation, National University Ranking, and international rankings.

In the National University Ranking (by brand), the University was ranked 69th in 2016, 58th in 2017, and 61st in 2018. The Vladimir Potanin Foundation ranked the educational institution 20th in 2014, 58th in 2015, 30th in 2016, and 22nd-23rd in 2017. University Library ONLINE ranked the University 2nd in 2014. Rossiya Segodnya's Social Navigator Project ranked the University 24th in 2015, 27th in 2016, and 20th in 2017 among classical universities. In Webometrics Top Universites by Google Scholar Citations, the educational institution was ranked 25th in 2015 and 26th in 2016.

Assessment of students' knowledge is an indicator of quality of the educational programmes. Students pass the tests in the Unified Portal of Internet Testing in the Sphere of Education. Quality control of students' knowledge was carried out with the help of the system of internal quality control of students' knowledge (University testing).

Corrective measures based on the results of external review are taken in accordance with local normative acts.

Results of external review and reports of the work groups are discussed at the meetings of the University subdivisions. Working programmes and educational programmes are changed due to the results of discussion.

Results of quality assessment of the educational programmes are taken into account in planning of further quality evaluation procedures.

Achievements:

- the University regularly participates in external evaluation of the educational programmes;
- there is a system of corrective measures that is based on the results of external evaluation of the educational programmes.

Recommendations:

The Dean and supervisor of the educational programme (Head of the Department) should be collectively responsible for corrective measures on improvement of the educational programmes.

4. RECOMMENDATIONS FOR IMPROVEMENT

Thus, based on the analyses of the presented documents, meetings and interviews, conducted during the site-visit, with the purpose of enhancing the quality of implementing the educational programme under accreditation the Review Panel recommends:

1. It is recommended for the Heads of Departments (supervisors of educational programmes) to participate more actively in the processes and procedures of the internal quality assurance system.

2. It is recommended to involve employers, federal and municipal authorities in discussion of goals, expected learning outcomes and contents of educational programmes.

3. It is advisable to extend variety of master's degree programmes in accordance with modern requirements of the labour market.

4. It is necessary to inform students about the opportunities to file an appeal in case of claims concerning the educational process.

5. It is advisable to provide students with the opportunity to express their opinion about the educational process anonymously as the element of quality control system.

6. It is recommended to intensify inbound student mobility, to sign agreements with foreign universities, and to implement double degree programmes.

7. It is advisable to develop the educational programmes in English and to include modules in foreign languages in existing educational programmes.

8. It is recommended to use selection testing to improve effectiveness and transparency of student enrollment for master degree programmes.

9. It is recommended to improve research activities and international mobility of teachers (to take into account publication activities in selection for a position; to participate in filing an application for grants, to support learning of a foreign language, etc.).

10. It is advisable to expand the system of financial and non-financial support of teachers to promote their professional development.

11. It is recommended to raise awareness of students about the possibilities of academic mobility by publishing information on the web-sites of the University and faculties.

12. It is recommended to provide active participation of the Heads of Departments (supervisors of the educational programmes) in regular monitoring of achievements of the educational programmes in comparison with similar programmes in other educational institutions.

13. It is recommended to publish accurate and brief information about the educational programme (staff, subjects, forms of training– remote, contact), including information in the English language, on the official web-site of the University to inform the public about the educational programmes.

14.   It is advisable to publish objective information about graduates' employability on the official web-site of the University.

15.   It is necessary to continue work on development of international cooperation (membership in international organizations, filing an application to foreign funds, development of academic mobility, cooperation agreements with top-rated universities that provide mutual mobility of students and teachers).

16.   It is recommended to provide students with a wider range of choice of individual learning paths, including accelerated education.

17.   It is advisable to involve practitioners in the educational process and improve conditions and contents of internships and practical studies.

18.   It is necessary to take special organizational measures when arranging admission quotas to form complete academic groups (25 people for bachelor's degree programmes, 15 people for master's degree programmes), as well as to attract applicants with full compensation of training costs and to sign more agreements with employers on training of experts.

19.   It is advisable to attract winners and prize winners of Russian Olympiads for pupils to study at Chelyabinsk State University.

20.   The Dean and supervisor of the educational programme (Head of the Department) should be collectively responsible for corrective measures on improvement of the educational programmes.

5. CONCLUSION

Based on the self-evaluation report analysis, documents and data submitted the External Review Panel has come to the conclusion that the cluster of educational programmes in «Foreign Regional Studies» (41.03.01), «Politology» (41.03.04, 41.04.04), «International Relations» (41.03.05, 41.04.05), «History» (46.03.01, 46.04.01), «Historical Studies and Archeology» (46.06.01) **substantially** comply with the standards and criteria of public accreditation of the National Centre for Public Accreditation.

The Panel recommends that the National Accreditation Board accredit the cluster of educational programmes in «Foreign Regional Studies» (41.03.01), «Politology» (41.03.04, 41.04.04), «International Relations» (41.03.05, 41.04.05), «History» (46.03.01, 46.04.01), «Historical Studies and Archeology» (46.06.01) delivered by Chelyabinsk State University for the period of **6** years.

ANNEX A

SCHEDULE OF THE SITE VISIT OF THE EXTERNAL REVIEW PANEL

Time	Event	Participants	Venue
September 26, Wednesday			
8.30	Transfer from Hotel to ChelSU		Building 1, 129, Kashirin Brothers Str.
09.00 — 11.00	First meeting of the Panel		3d floor, Conference hall
11.00 — 12.00	**Meeting of the ERP with the University administration and people responsible for accreditation**	Rector, Vice-Rectors, people responsible for accreditation, ERP (External Review Panel)	Conference hall
12.00 — 13.00	Tour of the University (visiting classrooms, library, etc.)	ERP	
13.00 — 14.00	Lunch		Cafeteria
14.00 — 14.30	Internal meeting of the Panel	ERP	Room 232 (1)
14.30 — 15.30	**Meeting with Deans and Deputy Deans**	Deans, Deputy Deans, ERP	Room 232 (2)
15.30 — 16.00	Work with documents	ERP	Room 232 (1)
16.00 — 17.00	**Meeting with Heads of Departments**	Heads of Departments, ERP	Room 232 (2)
17.00 — 17.30	Internal meeting of the Panel	ERP	Room 232 (1)
17.30 — 18.30	**Meeting with Graduates**	Graduates, ERP	Room 232 (2)
18.30 — 19.00	Internal meeting of the Panel	ERP	Room 232 (1)
September 27, Thursday			
8.15	Transfer from Hotel to ChelSU		Building 3, ChelSU, 162B Prospekt Pobedy
8.45 — 9.15	Tour of Building 3	ERP	
09.15 — 10.15	**Meeting with teachers**	Teachers, ERP	Room 215
10.15 — 10.30	Break		
10.30 — 11.30	**Meeting with students**	Students, ERP	Room 215
11.30 — 12.00	Internal meeting of the Panel	ERP	Room 307
12.00 — 13.00	Lunch		
13.00 — 14.00	**Meeting with postgraduate students**	Postgraduate students, ERP	Room 215
14.00 — 17.00	Work with documents/ attending classes (optional)	ERP	Room 307

17.00 — 18.00	**Meeting with employers**	Employers, ERP	Room 215
18.00 — 18.15	Internal meeting of the Panel	ERP	Room 307
September 28, Friday			
9.45	Transfer to ChelSU		129, Kashirin Brothers Str.
10.00 — 13.00	Internal meeting of the Panel: discussion of preliminary results of the site visit, preparation of the oral report of the panel	ERP	Room 232 (1)
13.00 — 14.00	**Closing meeting of the External Review Panel with the representatives of the University**	ERP, University administration, Heads of the Graduate Departments, teachers, students	Conference hall
14.00 — 15.00	Lunch		Cafeteria
15.00	Guided tour of the city		
	Departure		

ANNEX B

PARTICIPANTS OF THE MEETINGS

Administration of the HEI, persons responsible for accreditation:

№	Name	Position	Contact Information
1.	Diana Tsiring	Rector	rector@csu.ru 8(351) 799-71-01
2.	Andrey Petrov	First Vice Rector	petrov@csu.ru 8(351)799-71-06
3.	Evgeny Birukov	Vice Rector for Academic Affairs	uchrabota@csu.ru 8(351)799-72-78
4.	Irina Trushina	Vice Rector for Students' Affairs	trushina_ia@mail.ru 8(351)-799-71-10
5.	Julia Mamonova	Head of the Educational Policy Department	kalina5771@mail.ru 8(351)799-71-91
6.	Vasilyi Buchelnikov	Vice Rector for Research Work	pletnev@csu.ru 8(351) 799-70-52
7.	Galina Vorobyeva	Head of Quality Assurance Office	vgn@csu.ru 8(351)799-72-45
8.	Nadezhda Bochkareva	Head of Postgraduate Education Office	bnv@csu.ru 8(351)799-73-12
9.	Kseniya Yakovets	Director of Institute for International relations	yakovetcksenia@mail.ru 8(351)799-71-25
10.	Liliya Nefedova	Dean of Faculty of Linguistics and Translation, Professor of the Department of Roman-Germanic Languages and Intercultural Communication	lan2@mail.ru +79028600326
11.	Sergey Bakanov	Acting Dean, Faculty of History and Philology; Head of the Department of History of Russia and Foreign Countries	bakanov-s@mail.ru 8(351)7997015
12.	Elvina Yagnakova	Dean, Faculty of Eurasia and East	elvina21@yandex.ru +7(351)7997137

Heads of departments:

№	Name	Position	Contact Information
1.	Artem Skvortsov	Acting Head of the Department of Political Science and International Relations, Associate Professor, Department of History of Russia and Foreign Countries	artyom-skvorcov@yandex.ru 8(351)7997020
2.	Irina Glukhova	Acting Head of the Department of the Department of Oriental and Roman-Germanic languages	irenevl@mail.ru +7(351)7997128
3.	Maxim Smirnov	Head of the Department of Foreign Regional Studies, Political Science and Eastern Philosophy	smirnov771977 @mail.ru +7(351)7997138
4.	Georgyi Goncharov	Acting Head of Department of History of Russia and Foreign Countries	chelhist@mail.ru +7(351)7997008

Postgraduate students:

№	Name	Position	Contact Information
1.	Yelizaveta Saukova	3d year student, Department of Political Science and International Relations	esaukova@yandex.ru
2.	Olga Ilyina	4th year student, Department of Political Science and International Relations	

Deans, Deputy Deans:

№	Name	Position	Contact Information
1.	Sergey Bakanov	Acting Dean, Faculty of History and Philology; Head of the Department of History of Russia and Foreign Countries	bakanov-s@mail.ru 8(351)7997015
2.	Ivan Nokhrin	Deputy Dean for Research Work; Associate Professor at the Department of Political Science and International Relations	ivan-nokhrin@yandex.ru
3.	Elvina Yagnakova	Dean, Faculty of Eurasia and East	elvina21@yandex.ru +7(351)7997137

Teachers:

№	Name	Position	Contact Information
1.	Oleg Vydrin	Senior lecturer, Department of Political Science and International Relations	vydrin.oleg@gmail.com
2.	Alexander Fokin	Associate Professor, Department of History of Russia and Foreign Countries	aafokin@yandex.ru
3.	Alexey Popov	Associate Professor, Department of History of Russia and Foreign Countries	
4.	Vasily Zorin	Associate Professor, Department of Political Science and International Relations	vaszorin@gmail.com
5.	Andrey Pass	Professor, Department of Political Science and International Relations	pass_andrey@mail.ru
6.	Nikita Yalmanov	Senior lecturer, Department of Oriental and Roman-Germanic Languages	nikita-ya55@yandex.ru +7(351)7997138
7.	Nadezhda Ivanchenko	Senior lecturer, Department of Oriental and Roman-Germanic Languages	nadezhda_ivanchenko@mail.ru +7(351)7997128
8.	Alexander Razhev	Associate Professor, Department of Political Science and International Relations	guibert@mail.ru
9.	Ekaterina Shadrina	Teacher, Department of Oriental and Roman-Germanic Languages	semeika174@mail.ru 8(351)7997128
10.	Olga Sorokina	Associate Professor, Department of Oriental and Roman-Germanic Languages	eastlang@csu.ru 8(351)7997138

Representatives of employers:

№	Name	Position	Contact Information
1.	Yulia Krasnova	Director, Center for Cultural Heritage of the City of Chelyabinsk	jukki72@mail.ru
2.	Nikolay Antipin	Deputy Director, the State Archive of Chelyabinsk Oblast	antipin87@mail.ru
3.	Alexander Khorin	Head of the Department for Interactive Projects at the Office for Public Relations under the Chelyabinsk Oblast Administration	89123004643
4.	Ilya Anosov	Head of National Politics Office, Administration of public relations of the Government of the Chelyabinsk region	relcomitet@yandex.ru 8(351)2632967

Graduates:

№	Name	Place of Work	Position	Contact Information
1.	Svetlana Ptitsyna	"Obl- TV" (Mediaholding OTV)	Head of the Secretariat	sv_ptitsyna@mail.ru 89194047000
2.	Evgeny Ochkalas	The State Duma of the Russian Fderation	Deputy's Aid	89823689096
3.	Yury Makurov	Chelyabinsk State Conservation Area "Arkaim"	Head of the Department	ymakurov@yandex.ru 89088158583
4.	Nikolay Rogach	South Ural State University	Inspector, Department for Advertising Technologies	89995831311
5.	Vyacheslav Kuznetsov	Chelyabinsk Institute of Advanced Training for Educators	Head of the Department of Humanities and Arts	kraeved_74@mail.ru
6.	Asko Aloi	Ezidskyi National Culture Centre	Head	+79127750774
7.	Anastasiya Kovaleva	Southern Ural Chamber of Commerce and Industry	Head of the Department of Translation	89630862091

Students:

№	Name	Field of Study	Year	Contact Information
1.	Kamilya Khamitova	BA "History"	4	istfak@csu.ru 89028688318
2.	Ivan Medvedev	BA "History"	4	istfak@csu.ru 89630829728
3.	Alyona Sukhanova	MA "History"	2	istfak@csu.ru 89128021245
4.	Temur Dzhuraev	BA "International Relations"	3	istfak@csu.ru 89630924542
5.	Pavel Levin	BA "International Relations"	3	istfak@csu.ru 89517787248
6.	Arslan Khaerzmanov	BA "International Relations"	4	eastlang@csu.ru +7(351)7997128
7.	Ekaterina Menshikova	BA "International Relations"	4	eastlang@csu.ru +7(351)7997128
8.	Azat Kireev	BA "Foreign Regional Studies"	4	region@csu.ru +7(351)7997138
9.	Daria Akhmedova	BA "Foreign Regional Studies"	2	region@csu.ru 8(351)7997138
10.	Olga Shurchkova	BA "Foreign Regional Studies"	4	region@csu.ru (351) 799 71 38
11.	Ivan Nebesikhin	BA "International Relations"	4	region@csu.ru (351)7997128
12.	Aleksandr Verevchenko	BA "Politology"	2	тел. 89511284475
13.	Ivan Kuzmin	BA "Politology"	2	тел. 89193059469

ANNEX B

THE SCALE OF ASSESSMENT PARAMETERS OF A STUDY PROGRAMME

№	Standards	Assessment of the study programme			
		Full compliance	Substantial compliance	Partial compliance (needs improvement)	Non-compliance
1.	Policy (goals, development strategy) and quality assurance procedures of a study programme	*			
2.	Design and approval of programmes	*			
3.	Student-centred learning, teaching and assessment	*			
4.	Student admission, support of academic achievements and graduation	*			
5.	Teaching staff	*			
6.	Learning resources and student support	*			
7.	Collection, analysis and use of information for managing the study programme	*			
8.	Public information		*		
9.	On-going monitoring and periodic review of programmes	*			
10.	Cyclical external quality assurance of study programmes	*			