FINAL REPORT

ON THE EXTERNAL REVIEW

of a cluster of study programmes:

«State and Municipal Management» (38.03.04),
«Business Informatics» (38.03.05),
«Economic Security» (38.05.01),
«Finance and Credit» (38.04.08),
further training   programs
«Property Evaluation»,
«Accounting in Business Entities»,
«State and Municipal Procurements Management»,
«Contract System Procurements»,

delivered at the Federal State Educational Institution of Higher Education "Stavropol State Agrarian University"

Stavropol, 2017

Final Report
on the External Review

of a cluster of study programmes:

«State and Municipal Management» (38.03.04),
«Business Informatics» (38.03.05),
«Economic Security» (38.05.01),
«Finance and Credit» (38.04.08),
further training   programs
«Property Evaluation»,
«Accounting in Business Entities»,
«State and Municipal Procurements Management»,
«Contract System Procurements»,

delivered at the Federal State Educational Institution of
Higher Education "Stavropol State Agrarian University"

External Review Chair   Marius Sorin Dinca

Stavropol, 2017

CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION

The external review of the cluster of study programmes «State and Municipal Management» (38.03.04), «Business Informatics» (38.03.05), «Economic Security» (38.05.01), «Finance and Credit» (38.04.08), further training programs «Property Evaluation», «Accounting in Business Entities», «State and Municipal Procurements Management», «Contract System Procurements» delivered at the Federal State Educational Institution of Higher Education "Stavropol State Agrarian University" (hereinafter referred to as SSAU) was held on March 28-30, 2017 and involved the analysis of the Self-Evaluation report, the site visit to the University by the External Review Panel and the preparation of the present report.

The main objective of the external review is to identify the compliance of cluster of study programmes «State and Municipal Management» (38.03.04), «Business Informatics» (38.03.05), «Economic Security» (38.05.01), «Finance and Credit» (38.04.08), further training programs «Property Evaluation», «Accounting in Business Entities», «State and Municipal Procurements Management», «Contract System Procurements» delivered at the Federal State Educational Institution of Higher Education "Stavropol State Agrarian University" with the standards and criteria of international public accreditation, developed by the National Centre for Public Accreditation (hereinafter NCPA), in accordance with the European standards for quality assurance in higher education ESG-ENQA.

The report on the results of the external review is the basis for the National Accreditation Board to make a decision on public accreditation of the educational programmes in compliance with the standards and criteria of NCPA.

1. CONTENTS AND MAIN STAGES OF THE EXTERNAL REVIEW

1.1 Grounds for the External Review

In accordance with Paragraph 1, Article 3 of 96 Federal Law of 29 December, 2012 № 273 - FL "On Education in the Russian Federation" institutions carrying out educational activities may undergo public accreditation in various Russian, foreign and international organizations; employers and their associations as well as their authorized organizations shall have the right to carry out professional public accreditation of professional educational programmes delivered by an educational institution.

For the purpose of public accreditation of a cluster of study programmes«State and Municipal Management» (38.03.04), «Business Informatics» (38.03.05), «Economic Security» (38.05.01), «Finance and Credit» (38.04.08), further training programs «Property Evaluation», «Accounting in Business Entities», «State and Municipal Procurements Management», «Contract System Procurements» Stavropol State Agrarian University submitted an application to the National Centre for Public Accreditation providing accreditation services on the national level and

recognised by the leading world organisations of quality assurance in higher education.

1.2 Composition of the External Review Panel

Foreign experts were nominated by foreign quality assurance agencies upon the request of NCPA.

Russian expert, representative of the academic community, was nominated by the Guild of Experts in the Sphere of Higher Education, Russia.

Expert representing the international professional community was nominated by the Ministry of Economic Development of the Stavropol Territory.

Expert representing the student community was recommended by Chair of All-Russia Student Association.

The Review Panel composition was approved by NCPA.

The Review Panel consisted of six national and international experts:

- **Marius Sorin Dinca** – Doctor of Economic Sciences, Associate Professor of the Faculty of Economic Sciences, Transilvania University of Brasov, accredited member of the Romanian Agency for Quality Assurance in Higher Education (ARACIS), member of the national University Research Council in Higher Education, member of International Economic Council in Atlanta (the USA), member of the European Association for Comparative Economic Studies – Review Chair, foreign expert;
- **Lukianova Anna Aleksandrovna** – Doctor of Economic Sciences, Professor, Head of the Department of Company Management, Director of the Institute of Further Education and Professional Training, Krasnoyarsk State Pedagogical University named after V.P. Astafyev, member of the Guild of Experts in the Sphere of Professional Education, Vice Review Chair, Russian expert;
- **Shindina Tatiana Aleksandrovna**- Doctor of Economic Sciences, Associate Professor, Head of the Department of Economics and Management in Construction and Land Development, South Ural State University (National Research University), member of the National Quality Assurance Expert Register for Education, member of the Guild of Experts in the Sphere of Professional Education- panel member, Russian Expert;
- **Kamenskaia Elena Borisovna –** Doctor of Philosophical Sciences, Professor, Visiting Professor of Philosophy of the University of Salzburg, University of Vienna,   Research Associate of the Institute of Scientific Theory of the International Centre for Research (Salzburg, Austria), Consultant for the Issues of Higher Education of the School of International Affairs and Projects (Austria), Consultant for the Issues of Higher School Modernization, International Expert of the European Association for Quality Assurance in Higher Education (ENQA)- panel member, international expert;
- **Pitsenko Galina Viktorovna -** Head of the Department of State Service and Personnel of the Ministry of Finances of the Stavropol Territory – panel member, representative of professional community;
- **Shipilov Savva Vadimovich** – Chair of the Altai Regional Youth Public Organization "League of the Altai State University Students", Chair of the Committee for Social issues of the Youth parliament of the Altai Territory- panel member, representative of student community;

Field-oriented expertise of the panel members, as well as their extensive, diverse and years-long experience in the system of higher education and profession, active position of students' and employers' representatives formed the basis for the effective work of the panel on reviewing the entire scope of issues and problems in the course of evaluation.

Involvement of representatives of the Russian system of higher education in the External Review panel provided an opportunity to analyze the delivery of the programmes undergoing accreditation both in line with global quality assurance trends in higher education and in the context of the national education system.

1.3 Purpose and objectives of the Review

Public accreditation is aimed at enhancing the quality of education, developing the quality culture in educational organizations, identifying the best practices for continuous improvement of the quality of education and informing the public about the organizations that deliver educational programmes in compliance with the European standards of quality.

The main objective of the external review is to identify the compliance of the cluster of study programmes «State and Municipal Management» (38.03.04), «Business Informatics» (38.03.05), «Economic Security» (38.05.01), «Finance and Credit» (38.04.08), further training programs «Property Evaluation», «Accounting in Business Entities», «State and Municipal Procurements Management», «Contract System Procurements» delivered at the Federal State Educational Institution of Higher Education "Stavropol State Agrarian University" with the standards and criteria of international public accreditation, developed by the National Centre for Public Accreditation (hereinafter NCPA), in accordance with the European standards for quality assurance in higher education ESG-ENQA, as well as the to make the recommendations for the enhancement of the content and organization of the educational process within the programmes undergoing accreditation.

1.4 Stages of the external review

The External Review consisted of three main stages:

1.4.1 The review of the Self-evaluation report

The Federal State Educational Institution of Higher Education "Stavropol State Agrarian University" was responsible for the self-evaluation procedure, preparation and timely submission to NCPA of the Self-Evaluation Report of the cluster of educational programmes «State and Municipal Management» (38.03.04), «Business Informatics» (38.03.05), «Economic Security» (38.05.01), «Finance and Credit» (38.04.08), further training programs «Property Evaluation», «Accounting in Business Entities», «State and Municipal Procurements Management», «Contract System Procurements».

In compliance with the "Guidelines for Self-Evaluation of the Educational Programmes", developed by NCPA the Self-Evaluation Report on 102 pages includes: introduction, results of the self-evaluation procedure, conclusions and a list of annexes. The self-evaluation procedure was carried out with regard to each NCPA standards based on the SWOT-analysis.

In compliance with the programme of the Review, the Self-Evaluation Report of the cluster of educational programmes «State and Municipal

Management» (38.03.04), «Business Informatics» (38.03.05), «Economic Security» (38.05.01), «Finance and Credit» (38.04.08), further training programs «Property Evaluation», «Accounting in Business Entities», «State and Municipal Procurements Management», «Contract System Procurements» was submitted to NCPA and to the Panel members 30 days prior to the site visit to the University.

When reviewing the Self-Evaluation Report, the External Review Panel had the opportunity to form a preliminary opinion on the educational programmes undergoing accreditation and to analyze the compliance of the programme with the standards and criteria, developed by NCPA, and with the European standards of education quality.

The External Review Panel members noted the high level of the Self-Evaluation Report in terms of the structure, compliance of the information with the sections, the quality of perception, sufficiency of the analytical data, availability of the references to supporting documents and completeness of the data, which provided the possibility of forming a preliminary expert judgment.

However, the panel members noted the following drawbacks of the Self-Evaluation report:
- the Report is lacking data on the educational programmes for further education;
- the Report should contain more concrete information on the quantitative data and references on the documents in their dynamics;
- There are no materials characterising Masters' programmes and their characteristics;
- The Report contains data and the description of operating procedures of the Accounting and Financial Department, however there are no relevant data on the Department of Economics;
- A large information block concerning the library resources is repeated in a number of sections.

Based on the preliminary work of the External Review panel the following conclusions were made:
-the specific character of training within the educational programmes is adequately disclosed for the expertise;
- the goals of the educational programmes are clearly formulated and comply with the mission of the University;
- the material, technical and resource bases of the University is aimed at long-term outcomes and comply with the requirements imposed to educational programmes implementation.

According to NCPA standards and criteria, the preliminary assessment of the cluster of educational programmes «State and Municipal Management» (38.03.04), «Business Informatics» (38.03.05), «Economic Security» (38.05.01), «Finance and Credit» (38.04.08), further training programs «Property Evaluation», «Accounting in Business Entities», «State and Municipal Procurements Management», «Contract System Procurements» can be formulated as "significant (substantial) compliance".

During the external review, the following issues required more detailed analysis:
- Policy (goals, strategies for development) and the procedures for quality assurance of the study programme.
- Efficiency of the procedure for development and approval of the study programme.

- Mechanism of implementing student-centred learning.
- Approaches to the development of systematic support of students' academic progress.

During the preliminary meeting the panel members formulated the proposals, which determined the general strategy of the site visit.

1.4.2 The site visit to SSAU

The Review Panel visited the Federal State Educational Institution of Higher Education "Stavropol State Agrarian University" on March 28-30, 2017 in order to confirm the reliability of the data of the Self-Evaluation Report, collect additional information with regard to the cluster of the educational programmes delivery and identify the compliance of the programmes with the standards and criteria developed by NCPA in compliance with the European standards of quality assurance in higher education.

The dates and the programme of the site visit were preliminary determined by NCPA and approved after coordination with the University administration and the Panel members.

During the site visit, the Panel held meetings and interviews with the University administration, with the people responsible for accreditation, the directors of the institutes, heads of departments, teaching staff, students, employers and SSAU alumni. During the review the External Review Panel studied the presented documents and requested for additional materials.

The Review Chair supervised the work of the Panel.

The Panel notes that the Self-Evaluation Report provided by the University allowed the experts to form a clear idea of the peculiarities of the cluster of study programmes «State and Municipal Management» (38.03.04), «Business Informatics» (38.03.05), «Economic Security» (38.05.01), «Finance and Credit» (38.04.08), further training programs «Property Evaluation», «Accounting in Business Entities», «State and Municipal Procurements Management», «Contract System Procurements».

During the site visit the Panel reviewed the documentation, held face-to-face meetings, inspected research and university laboratories, it allowed the experts to obtain more complete information, which turned to be sufficient for objective and integral evaluation of the quality on the study programmes undergoing accreditation.

The Review Panel considers it necessary to note the effective cooperation of experts with the NCPA staff during the preparation and site visit to SSAU.

The Panel notes high level of organization and efficient work.

For the purpose of conducting the site visit, the University administration provided the External Review Panel with administrative support, including organization of the meetings and interviews, facilities, computers with the Internet access and the necessary scientific, educational and methodological materials.

During the site visit to SSAU the members of the Review Panel requested additional documents for a better idea.

On the last day of the visit the Review Chair presented the oral report on the results of the visit to the University administration, directors of the Institutes, teachers and students.

The detailed programme of the Panel visit is available in the Annex to the present report.

1.4.3 Conclusion on the Results of the External Review

Following the results of the External Review of the the Federal State Educational Institution of Higher Education "Stavropol State Agrarian University" the External Review Panel presented to NCPA the Report on the Results of the External Review of the cluster of study programmes State and Municipal Management» (38.03.04), «Business Informatics» (38.03.05), «Economic Security» (38.05.01), «Finance and Credit» (38.04.08), further training programs «Property Evaluation», «Accounting in Business Entities», «State and Municipal Procurements Management», «Contract System Procurements» delivered by the University.

The working version of the Report on 36 pages without annexes was prepared by the Review Chair and submitted to NCPA after the coordination with other Review Panel members. After that the Report is to be submitted to the University administration to correct possible factual errors.

2.   DESCRIPTION OF THE EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMMES

Preparation of graduates for the cluster programs 080000 (38.00.00) Economics and Management - Bachelor - Master -Programs of further professional training is carried out at the University by the two faculties and the Institute of Further Professional Education. The number of students enrolled in intramural programmes is 5199 people. Twenty four doctors of sciences and professors (13% of the total teaching staff), 131 Candidate of Sciences, associate professors (71.2%) are involved in the delivery of the cluster of study programmes.

The Faculty of Economics was founded in 1961. In the structure of the Faculty there are 5 departments, 4 scientific and innovation subdivisions: Regional Office of Nationwide Centre of Monitoring of Social and Labor Sphere; Laboratory of Information and Communication Technologies; Laboratory of Marketing Research «MarkeTerra»; Centre of Simulation of Management Technologies. Faculty partners include the Financial Unoversity under the Government of the Russian Federation, Plekhanov Russian University of Economics, Lomonosov Moscow State University, P.G. Demidov Yaroslavl State University, 10 agricultural universities of the Russian Federation and others.

Accounting and Finance Faculty began its history of development since 1962, with the first admission on the specialty "Accountant Auditor for the agricultural and industrial complex". On the basis of the Faculty there are there following scientific and innovation laboratories: "Authorized certification authority center of the company "1C ","Training and methodical center for of professional accountants training", "Mini-Bank","Insurance Store", "Audit Expert & Project Expert","Stock Exchange"and others, where students receive professional skills under conditions close to reality.

Faculty strategic partners are leading domestic and foreign companies and organizations: JSC "Sberbank of Russia", JSC "Rosselkhozank", JSC "VTB", company Price Waterhouse Coopers (Moscow), KPMG International,

Investment Company "Finam", insurance company "Rosgosstrakh", Insurance House "VSK", IC "Yugoria", JSC "Financial Corporation URALSIB", agricultural enterprises (APC "Russia" Novoaleksandrovsky district, APC "Rodina" Novoalexandrovsky district, APC farm named after Voroshilov Trunovsky district and etc.). As well as enterprises of various organizational and legal forms. Cooperation with strategic partners provides opportunities for

students to have externship with subsequent employment in the leading organizations of the South of Russia and in the Russian Federation. Graduate employability is 94%.

The Institute of Further Education and Professional Training (hereinafter IAPE) is a new unit of the university, founded in 2010. On the basis of IAPE training programs for part-time and correspondence courses are implemented (reduced programs). IAPE contingent of the cluster of programs 080000 Economics and Management (38.00.00 Economics and Management) is 1255 people. Also on the basis IAPE implemented training programs for teachers of Russian universities under the state order of the Ministry of Agriculture of the Russian Federation. Each year, this program trained more than 50 people.

Students are actively involved in the management activities at the faculty in the form of weekly work eldership, monthly interim assessment, meetings of educational committees, organization of cultural and sporting events, in the organization of the maintenance of public order and sanitary conditions of the adjacent territory and the dormitory. In the framework of the student self-government there is a clear structure of interaction and collaboration between all the University subdivisions involved in academic activities.

As a result of analysis of the educational programmes: State and Municipal Management» (38.03.04), «Business Informatics» (38.03.05), «Economic Security» (38.05.01), «Finance and Credit» (38.04.08), further training programs «Property Evaluation», «Accounting in Business Entities», «State and Municipal Procurements Management», «Contract System Procurements» undergoing accreditation the Panel drew the following conclusions:

The concept of the study programmed delivery is founded on the competence-based approach aimed at attaining the intended learning outcomes and pursues the following objectives:
- Multilevel system of education;
- Selection of individual learning trajectories;
- Practice oriented learning enabling to combine fundamental knowledge and practical skills within the major;
- Development of students' active professional and social activity.

The educational programmes are developed in compliance with the Mission and Strategy of the University. There is also a Policy for Quality of Education developed and approved at the University. The University system of quality assurance is based on the regulatory documents developed at the University and governing the contents, organization and monitoring of the quality of the process of education. The monitoring of the quality of education is carried out in compliance with the Regulations on the University Quality Assurance of the educational process. Training of graduates within the programmes undergoing accreditation is carried out in compliance with the strategy of quality assurance of students' training at Stavropol State Agrarian University for 2015-2018.

The core educational programmes are developed in compliance with the Federal State Educational Standards of Higher Education and Professional Standards, the programmes of further training take into consideration the requirements of the professional standards. The requirements to the attained learning outcomes are defined by the competence-based approach. The learning outcomes are defined in the University methodological materials as competence levels: basic, intermediate and high. Thus the learning outcomes

are aligned with the Dublin descriptors and the European Qualifications framework (EQF).

The programmes have well-defined characteristics of the professional activity of graduates: professional field and object, kinds of professional activity and its objectives that should be pursued by the graduates.

The competencies of students completing the study programmes undergoing accreditation are clearly defined. All the general cultural, general professional and professional competencies referred to certain types of professional activities the educational programme focuses on, are included in the intended learning outcomes.

The contents and the structure of the study programme are defined by the requirements of the University Regulatory Act "Regulations on the educational programmes of the Bachelor, Specialist, Master and Postgraduate programmes at the Federal State Educational Institution of Higher Education "Stavropol State Agrarian University". The educational programme contains all the necessary documents regulating the contents and the organization of the learning process: general provisions, curriculum, academic calendar, matrix of competence development, teaching and learning materials, requirements for state final assessment, resources used for the educational programme delivery.

The contents of the educational programmes is maintained relevant by annual updates and corrections introduced in compliance with the changes in the Federal and Regional legislation, collaboration with employers, international experience and good practices. The programmes of further training are annually updated based on the employers' recommendations and feedback from programme participants.

The personnel involved in the study programme delivery include well-qualified teaching staff with background education in the course taught. The teaching staff carry out research and enhance their qualification on a regular basis. The share of the teaching staff with scientific degrees and titles is 89.8%.

In order to deliver the study programmes the University features sufficient material and technical resources in order to deliver courses stipulated in the Federal State Educational Standard and Curriculum including students' independent and research activities.

All the educational programmes are governed by the regulatory documents and teaching and learning materials in all the courses included into the curriculum.   The contents of every course is available from the university intranet. All the educational manuals and teaching and learning materials contain recommendations for students' individual work. Every programme contains methodological materials describing the quality of educational programmes acquisition and assessment resources for regular, interim and final assessment.

Based on the analysis of the educational programmes undergoing accreditation «State and Municipal Management» (38.03.04), «Business Informatics» (38.03.05), «Economic Security» (38.05.01), «Finance and Credit» (38.04.08), further training   programs «Property Evaluation», «Accounting in Business Entities», «State and Municipal Procurements Management», «Contract System Procurements» the Panel came to the following conclusion: the educational programmes undergoing accreditation in general comply with the standards and criteria for public accreditation.

3. RESULTS OF THE EXTERNAL REVIEW

3.1 Standard 1. Policy (objectives, development strategy) and procedures of the educational program quality guarantee

Compliance with the standard: ***Substantial (significant) compliance***

Table 1 – Criteria with regard to Standard 1

No	Aspect of Review	Assessment
1.	Availability of a documented inner quality assurance system providing continuous enhancement of quality in accordance with the developmental strategy of the educational institution.	A
2.	Participation of all stakeholders (administration, teaching staff, students, employers, employer associations, branch ministries and departments – key partners in employment of graduates) in developing and implementing a quality 6 assurance policy through relevant structures and processes.	B
3.	Participation of all structural units of an educational institution in quality assurance processes and procedures.	B

Analysis of compliance of the cluster of study programmes with the standard:

The Review Panel notes that the University has a documented Policy of quality assurance applicable to the study programme. The University features a developed and duly documented system of quality assurance, enabling continuous improvement of the quality of education in full compliance with the strategy of the University development involving all the stakeholders who take the responsibility for the quality in every level of educational and research activity. Quality assurance of the study programme is achieved due to internal self-evaluation system of student training, quality of resources, quality of teaching and learning, teaching staff qualification, quality of educational infrastructure, alumni competence.

The policy of quality assurance presumes continuity of goals, objectives and strategy for development of the University, its faculties and study programmes. The University has a well-developed mechanism for assessing the achievement of objectives. The educational process is well provided with internal regulatory documents. There is a feedback mechanism to communicate with all the stakeholders.

Achievements:

There is a system of quality management (EFQM) aimed at continuous improvement of the learning process;

There is a system of quality evaluation of the study programme implementation using "360 degrees" method;

Effective work of the Centre of Quality Management in education;

There is a regular comparative analysis of the educational practices from the leading national and international educational institutions meant to ensure and improve the quality of study programmes and overall activity of the University.

The criteria of the University activity enabling the continuous improvement of the quality of education are well-defined and documented.

Stakeholders are actively involved in implementing the parameters of the quality of education focused on the employer's demand.

Areas for improvement:

Involving students, alumni and other stakeholders into the policy and strategy making processes of the University development in general and study programme development in particular, as well as expertise of the study programmes meant to improve their quality.

Recommendations:

It is recommended to develop the mechanism involving students into the procedures of quality assurance in all the level of the University operation.

It is advisable to launch study programmes highly demanded by the society and interesting for students.

It is necessary to develop a system that would bring the public attention to introducing the policy of quality assurance and considering the opinions of all the stakeholders.

It is recommended to establish a Study Programme Panel including all the stakeholders (students, teachers, employers, alumni, etc.) in order to develop and implement the policy of quality assurance of study programmes. The panel will hold regular meetings (at least once a year).

It is necessary to intensify active involvement of the stakeholders (students, etc.) to the development and revision of study programmes in order to improve the quality of the learning process.

3.2 Standard 2. Design and approval of programmes

Compliance with the standard: ***Substantial (significant) compliance***

Table 2 - Criteria with regard to standard 2

No	Aspect of Review	Assessment
1.	Availability and accessibility of clearly defined, documented, approved and published goals and objectives of a study programme and expected learning outcomes and their correspondence to the mission and goals and objectives of the educational institution	B
2.	Availability of procedures for design, approval and revision of a study programme (including expected learning outcomes) with the account of the development of science and industry, and also with the consideration of stakeholder opinions (administration, teaching staff, students, employers)	B
3.	Consideration of the requirements of professional standards (if available), of labour market, of national qualification framework descriptors in the study programme.	B

Analysis of compliance of the cluster of study programmes with the standard:

The Review Panel emphasizes that the study programmes comply with the mission of the University, its goals and objectives. According to the Strategy of Development adopted at the University a study programme aims to develop students' general cultural, general professional and professional specific skills in compliance with the requirements of the Federal State Educational Standard of Higher Education and the target competencies pursued

as a result of completion of the study programme 38.00.00 "Economics and Management". The study programme also aims to develop students' personal qualities (ambition, organization, diligence, responsibility, citizenship, communication skills, tolerance, general culture) enabling to use the developed competencies in the professional activity. The mission and the objectives of the study programmes undergoing accreditation are incorporated into curriculum as study courses, different kinds of practical training sessions, assessment procedures. Credits are well distributed among the course modules with an indication of the share of interactive classes. The quality of a study programme mastery is assessed by routine monitoring of students' progress, interim monitoring, interim attestation of students and state final attestation of graduates. The expected learning outcomes are aligned with the Federal State Educational Standards of Higher Education in the Major 38.00.00 "Economics and Management" and incorporate in the working programmes of courses and practical training sessions. There are procedures for development, approval and introducing changes into the study programme based on the latest advancements in industry and science with due consideration of the stakeholders' opinion. The working plans are developed in compliance with the mission and objectives of the study programme and are adhered to the best national analogues. Students' and employers' opinion is taken into consideration when developing and introducing changes into working curricula, study programmes and other integral components of the methodological package.

Achievements:

Institution "Birzha idey" ("The market of ideas").

The goals and objectives of the study programme are clearly articulated and aligned with the mission, goals and objectives of the University.

The opinion of the stakeholders is taken into consideration when developing study programmes.

The procedures for design, approval and revision of the study programmes are well defined.

Interdisiplinary approach is implemented in the programme delivery.

There is a focus on the labour market demand: employers are involved in the study programme design in a number of courses and kinds of activities (educational and methodological).

The forms of student self-government are well developed.

Areas for improvement:

It might be useful to document additionally whether the learning outcomes comply with the requirements of professional standards integrated in the study programme.

Preparing joint study programmes is worth considering.

Recommendations:

It is recommended to keep aligning the requirements of the professional standards within the qualifications framework. The learning outcomes should be in line with the advancements in science and industry.

It is recommended to consider preparing joint double-degree study programmes. It is advisable to intensify the work on preparing a double-degree study programme, thus, extending cooperation with the foreign educational institution.

It is necessary to prepare regulations on launching new study programmes based on their assessment and prognosis of the implementation efficiency.

It is advisable to consider the university criteria of referring to the programme as the "elite".

It is recommended to enhance visibility and presentation of the study programmes developing a high level of competencies and clearly defined characteristic features.

It is necessary to intensify processing and putting into practice stakeholders' suggestions.

3.3 Standard 3. Student-centred learning, teaching and assessment

*Compliance with the standard: **Substantial (significant) compliance***

Table 3 - Criteria with regard to standard 3

No	Aspect of Review	Assessment
1.	Consideration of needs of diverse groups of students and a possibility to create individual learning paths.	B
2.	Use of methods encouraging students to take an active part in creating the learning process.	B
3.	Use of clearly defined criteria and objective assessment procedures of learning outcomes/ competences of students corresponding to the expected learning outcomes, goals of the study programme and their purpose (diagnostic, formative or summative assessment).	B
4.	Information about the study programme, criteria and procedures for assessment of learning outcomes/competencies, about examinations, tests and other types of control.	B
5.	Use of procedures of independent assessment of learning outcomes.	B
6.	Availability and effectiveness of appeals procedure and procedures for dealing with students complaints.	A

Analysis of compliance of the cluster of study programmes with the standard:

The assessment procedures used to evaluate the knowledge/competencies of enrolled or prospective students are regulated by the following documents: "On the point and ranking system of knowledge assessment of students enrolled in the study programmes of higher education at the Federal State Educational Institution" Stavropol State Agrarian University"; "Regulations on the study programmes of higher education – Bachelor's study programmes, Specialist's study programmes, Master's study programmes and post graduate study programmes delivered at Federal State Educational Institution" Stavropol State Agrarian University".

In order to deliver the accelerated study programme the Dean's office of the faculty designs and approves individually tailored curriculum based on the currently effective general professional full-term study programme with recognition of prior secondary vocational or higher education.

The teaching methods used in the study programme delivery are meant to boost students' active engagement in the learning process. Students take an active part in open lectures, workshops, role-playing games, research seminars organized by the teachers and representatives of the business community. Students' committee for the quality of education facilitates students' involvement in the enhancement of the quality of education.

In order to bring the system of competencies monitoring and assessment closer to the real-life professional environment, employers and teachers delivering related courses are included into the process as external experts. Students are eligible to address directly to the University administration by submitting their requests and suggestions to methodologists, the Dean's office of students' self-government unit, students' communities. The University website offers an option to ask questions that will be redirected to the representatives of structural subdivisions. In addition, students are regularly surveyed about the learning conditions and organization of education. Students are informed on their progress results, which are discussed at the meetings of the Educational Panel and the Faculty Academic Council on a monthly basis. The faculties regularly hold meetings with the parents of students.

The information on the assessment regulations, measures and forms of control is regularly brought down to the students at the beginning of every semester. In compliance with point and ranking system adopted at the University, the ranking of students' academic progress, exams and tests are assessed based on 100-point scale. The regulations for assessment include minimum and maximum number of points possible to gain as a result of the academic work during a semester; deadlines for assignment submission; formative assessment; final assessment. Formative assessment of students takes place every month. The faculties annually design and carry out corrective measures meant to foster students' progress. Interim students' assessment is carried out twice a year.

The information on the assessment procedures, evaluating of learning outcomes/competencies, data on the exams, tests and other kinds of students' knowledge monitoring and assessment is available from the University website. The faculty places the information on the dates of tests, exams and other forms of knowledge assessment on the announcement boards next to the Dean's office.

A high level of training is validated by the top places students win in national, regional and international contests.

The University has a working panel to resolve disagreements arising between the teachers and the students in relation to their right to education. There are a few associations at the University which protect students' rights: SSAU students' trade union, Centre of students' aesthetic education. Based on the Regulation on the State Final Assessment in Bachelor's, Specialist's and Master's programmes delivered by SSAU students have the right to appeal.

Achievements:

Students-centred learning processes are implemented;

There are procedures for students' appeal and response to complaints;

There is a point and ranking system at the University which provides an effective assessment of students' progress and allows monitoring the process of education;

There is a regular independent expert assessment of the learning outcomes. The expert panel includes representatives from the labour market.

Areas for improvement:

Learning trajectories and individual study plans.

Forms and methods of enhancing students' involvement in the process of education.

Forms and methods of organizing students' independent work.

Infrastructure for students with health restrictions, individual study plans for talented students.

Recommendations:

It is necessary to focus on the good practices of the national and foreign educational institutions in order to plan individual learning trajectories.

It is recommended to use good practices when organising students' individual work.

It is advisable to use good practices of national and foreign educational institutions in order to establish student-centred educational environment.

It is necessary to develop the methods actively involving students in the setting up of the educational process.

It is recommended to involve alumni and employers to students' assessment.

3.4 Standard 4. Student admission, support of academic achievements and graduation

*Compliance with the standard: **Substantial (significant) compliance** Table 4 - Criteria with regard to standard 4*

No	Aspect of Review	Assessment
1.	Systematic carrier guidance work targeted at the recruiting and selection of applicants should be in place.	A
2.	Availability and effectiveness of rules and regulations for admission, transfer of students from other educational institutions, recognition of qualifications, periods of study and prior learning	A
3.	Systematic work to support students' academic progress.	A
4.	Recognition of higher education qualifications obtained in the RF and abroad (Diploma Supplement).	B
5.	Students' involvement in academic mobility programmes.	C

Analysis of compliance of the cluster of study programmes with the standard:

The key forms of career guidance are the training programmes preparing secondary school leavers for state exams, professionally oriented testing, open house, consultancy services provided to prospective handicapped students and their parents regarding enrolment and education issues, taking part in University contests for school students, promotional and informational materials for people with disabilities, cooperation with special educational institutions of education. All the educational institutions of municipalities and cities in the Stavropol region are assigned to different faculties of the University. Career guidance work is carried out via face-to-face meetings and distant communication on the internet.

Enrolment procedures are governed by the Admission Regulations to the Bachelor's, Specialist's and Master's programmes. The procedure of student

transfer between educational institutions as well as credit transfer are provided in the Regulations on the transfer, expel and resume studies at the Federal State Educational Institution of Higher Education "Stavropol State Agrarian University".

Students' academic progress is strictly monitored by the academic group curators, deans of the faculties and the administering departments. Students' academic progress is evaluated based on the results of the regular assessment of learning outcomes attained by the students as a result of academic and practical training and interim assessment of learning outcomes acquired as a result of academic or practical training and doing coursework.

Achievements:

The University has properly developed enrolment rules and other documents regulating students' admission, transfer, etc.;

There is a systematic career guidance work aimed at preparing and selecting prospective students;

There is a systematic support work of students' academic progress with involvement of curators and teachers.

Areas for improvement:

There is no European Diploma Supplement.
Academic mobility of students is not properly developed.

Recommendations:

It is recommended to develop and offer a European Diploma Supplement to students.

Students should be given an opportunity to take part in academic mobility programmes both in Russia and abroad, therefore these opportunities should be carefully searched for on a regular basis.

3.5 Standard 5. Teaching staff

Compliance with the standard: ***Substantial (significant) compliance***

Table 5 - Criteria with regard to standard 5

No	Aspect of Review	Assessment
1.	Sufficient qualification of the teaching staff (scientific degrees and titles, rewards in the field, state prizes, published textbooks and students' guidance).	A
2.	Relevance of qualification, degrees and titles and /or practical experience to the profile of the study programme.	A
3.	Research activity of the teaching staff, implementation of research results in the academic process.	B
4.	Use of innovative teaching methods and advanced technologies.	B
5.	Involvement of visiting lecturers from other educational institutions including those from abroad to the educational process delivery.	B
6.	Participation of the teachers in joint international projects, internships abroad, academic mobility programmes.	B
7.	A system of financial and non-financial incentives for teachers.	A
8.	Availability and use of clear, transparent and objective criteria for: hiring staff including teachers from foreign educational institutions, assignment to positions, promotion, dismissal; dismissal of teachers with low level of professional competence.	A
9.	A system for career development and professional advancement for teachers.	B

Analysis of compliance of the cluster of study programmes with the standard:

Ninety percent of the teaching staff involved in the delivery of the programmes undergoing accreditation work on a full time basis. There is a positive dynamics in the age composition of highly qualified teaching staff: increase in the number of doctors of sciences under 50 years old, and the increase in the number of candidates of sciences under 40 years old. The basic education of almost all the teachers complies with the profile of the courses they teach. The teaching staff are regularly involved in the research and methodological activities and take further training courses in order to upgrade their professional skills.

The research results obtained by the teaching staff are regularly published in papers, monographs, students' manuals and confirmed with certificates. The faculties develop scientific schools and scientific trends. The average H-index of the teaching staff engaged in the delivery of the cluster of study programmes undergoing accreditation was 18.7 in Russian index of academic citing and 0.82 in SCOPUS and Web of Science databases. In addition to research and students' training the teaching staff of the University take an active part in the work of state and municipal authorities of the Stavropol Territory. They act as the members of public councils and independent experts in the contest committees and assessment panels of different levels.

State-of-the-art laboratories facilitate students' research work and the process of education. The teaching staff from the leading Russian and foreign educational institutions are involved in the programmes delivery based on Agreements on Academic Cooperation. The teaching staff delivering the courses within the study programmes undergoing accreditation take international internships and further training courses. The University offers workshops, lectures and seminars delivered by the leading national and international experts. Joint papers and students' manuals are published based on research results.

The University has a system of incentives for the teaching staff called "An effective contract". Full time teachers benefit from individual material incentives paid by the University for the high quality of research and students' training. There is also a ranking system which assesses the work of the Departments and point-and-ranking system which assesses the work of the teaching staff. There is also a non-monetary reward system: commendations and letters of appreciation of different levels.

Every department develops a plan of qualification upgrade where it defines institutions and terms of the teachers' further training. Every teacher is bound to undergo further training at least once in three years.

Achievements:

Highly-qualified and dedicated teaching staff.
Practice-oriented approach in education.
There is a well-developed system of rewards and incentives for the teaching staff and the students.

Areas for improvement:

Continuous improvement of the teaching and learning methods enabling to implement a student-centred approach in education in the most effective way.

Intensifying work on engaging more visiting lecturers from abroad.

Recommendations:

It is recommended to establish the association of alumni.

It is necessary to offer regular further training sessions for the teaching staff on the introduction and use of advanced training methods.

It is recommended to establish procedures of knowledge sharing regarding the teaching methods (at the University and beyond).

It is necessary to establish communities of practice at the University in order to disseminate knowledge and experience on educational and methodological issues elaborated at the University.

It is recommended to improve the level of teachers' foreign language skills.

It is advisable to develop a section on the University website with information on the opportunities for academic mobility of the teaching staff.

3.6 Standard 6. Learning resources and student support

*Compliance with the standard: **Full compliance***

Table 6 - Criteria with regard to standard 6

No	Aspect of Review	Assessment
1.	Provision of the study programme with material and technical recourses in accordance with the requirements of the curriculum (modern tools, equipment, computers, classrooms, laboratories).	A
2.	Availability of up-to-date library and information resources including those for independent study and research work.	A
3.	Availability of infrastructure to ensure access to quality education to students with different opportunities and of different age, and to provide the development of social and educational component of the academic process.	B
4.	The system of feedback on the satisfaction with conditions and organization of the study process should be in place.	A
5.	Availability of accessible information about opportunities for student academic mobility and its support system.	B

Analysis of compliance of the cluster of study programmes with the standard:

The University features sufficient material and technical facilities for all types of laboratory, practical, course and intercourse training including independent and research work of students and teachers. Lecture rooms and laboratories are equipped with multimedia (overhead) projector and computer for presentations, audio equipment, and screens. Students and teachers have access to the e-library system, a hard-copy library collection of the University, computerised classrooms and multimedia facilities to do their research and independent work. Teachers upload learning resources to the University website in order to facilitate students' independent and research work.

The University research library is equipped with the necessary telecommunication equipment, communication means, and electronic equipment. It offers the Internet access via Wi-Fi technology. Every student has unrestricted access to the recourses of the e-library. There is a well-developed system of references to the learning and research e-resources, access to e-catalogues of the leading libraries and universities, references to international collections of open-access journals.

The University has established favourable environment for students' social support, five dormitories, catering, sports and fitness centre. There are 21 interest clubs, over 26 sports clubs, 10 specialized students' communities working at the University.

Students are regularly surveyed in order to get feedback on the conditions and organization of the educational process. Surveys are held once a year. The Centre of Quality Management develops questionnaires, analyses the results of monitoring which are considered when making administrative decisions. Students and their parents actively write to University and Department emails.

Achievements:

Sufficient material and technical facilities.

Feedback mechanisms.

Access to contemporary library and information resources which facilitate students' independent and research work.

Areas for improvement:

Infrastructure for students with health restrictions;
Availability of academic mobility programmes.

Recommendations:

It is necessary to develop infrastructure for training students with health restrictions.

It is necessary to make the information on academic mobility programmes more available to students.

It is recommended to create a special bookmark on academic mobility programmes on the University website.

3.7 Standard 7. Collection, analysis and use of information for managing the study programme

Compliance with the standard: ***Substantial (significant) compliance***

Table 7 - Criteria with regard to standard 7

No	Aspect of Review	Assessment
1.	Availability and effectiveness of the system for collecting and monitoring information about the study programme.	B
2.	Participation of students and staff of the educational institution in collecting and analysing information for managing the study programme.	B
3.	Availability of a unified effective information system on the basis of modern information technologies for managing the study programme.	A

Analysis of compliance of the cluster of study programmes with the standard:

The basic study programme is supported with educational and methodological documents, sufficient number of students' manuals and teaching materials in all the courses. The contents of every course is available from SSAU intranet. Every student enrolled in the programme has an access to the databases and library resources in all the courses of the study programme.

Teaching and learning materials are allocated in personal cabinets of teachers. In addition every student has an access to e-library system.

Students graduating from the programme have an access to the Computerised Information System of employment facilitation.

There is a computerised information system for students' and teachers' workload calculation, enabling curriculum planning, taking into consideration a specific character of teaching and learning activities and a variety of their forms, monitoring of classroom and extracurricular workload, monitoring of compliance of the student groups with the working curricula, option of prognostication staff schedule for 3-5 years and the reports on the Department, Faculty and University overall workload.

Achievements:

The University has developed its own unified information system – intranet.

The University has a website which brings together students, teachers, and administration of the University.

Areas for improvement:

Staff and students are involved in collecting and analysis of information aimed at effective management of the quality of the study programmes.

There is a feedback from alumni on the quality of education obtained and their ideas to improve the study programme.

Recommendations:

It is necessary to intensify students' and teachers' involvement in the management of study programme quality.

It is recommended to systematize the feedback related to the issues of the study programme quality from all the stakeholders.

3.8 Standard 8. Public information

Compliance with the standard: ***Substantial (significant) compliance***

Table 8 - Criteria with regard to standard 8

No	Aspect of Review	Assessment
1.	Effective use of the official website of the study programme for its quality enhancement.	B
2.	Publication of complete and accurate information on the study programme and its achievements on the official website of the educational institution and mass media.	A
3.	Publication of objective data on the employability of graduates.	B
4.	Integration in the environment, interaction of the educational institution with 21 different professional associations and other organization including those from abroad.	B

Analysis of compliance of the cluster of study programmes with the standard:

Regulations and the basic study programmes are available from the University website. The University also publishes more detailed information on the contents of the study programme, intended learning outcomes, awarded qualifications, level of teaching, forms of education and assessment, academic opportunities available to students. There is a two-way on-going communication between the teachers and the students via the personal cabinets: all the remarks and suggestions are analysed in order to improve the quality of the study programmes.

Social networks also intensify and facilitate cooperation between the parties.

The public is informed on the programmes offered via the University printed media and open house days.

Objective data on the employment opportunities and labour market demands are published on the SSAU portal under the section "To the graduates", sub-section "Data on the graduates' employment". There is a regular monitoring research on the issue of graduates' employment and the labour market demand. The results of this analysis are considered at the meetings of the Academic Council and Departments.

Keeping the professional community informed is carried out via Stavropol Sectorial Interregional Resource Centre which maintains cooperation with the educational institutions of the primary and secondary agrarian educational institutions located in the North Caucasus and South Federal Districts. There is a Stavropol Regional Department of the Centre of Social monitoring and Agriculture operating at the University.

Achievements:

Sufficient information on the Programme is available from the University web-site.

There are published data on employment opportunities and labour market demand.

The University has a properly maintained and regularly updated website which meets all the requirements and regulations.

Areas for improvement:

Cooperation between the University and professional organisations and associations in Russian and abroad.

Work with alumni.

Recommendations:

It is necessary to enhance the University cooperation with professional associations and organisations.

It is recommended to develop online questionnaires and upload them on the University website in order to collect feedback.

It is advisable to establish alumni association.

3.9 Standard 9. On-going monitoring and periodic review of programmes

Compliance with the standard: ***Substantial (significant) compliance***

Table 9 - Criteria with regard to standard 9

No	Aspect of Review	Assessment
1.	Documented procedures of monitoring and periodic review of study programmes should be in place.	A
2.	Availability of a feedback mechanism for students, employers, branch ministries and departments (key stakeholders in employment) in the process of monitoring and periodic review of a study.	B
3.	Effectiveness of procedures for monitoring and periodic review of a study programme (enhancement of programmes).	B

Analysis of compliance of the cluster of study programmes with the standard:

The University has a well-developed Strategy ensuring the quality of students' training. Monitoring and assessment of the study programmes is carried out in compliance with the University regulatory legal acts governing the operation of the SSAU structural subdivisions, strategy, analysis and monitoring management. The contents of the study programmes is discussed

during the staff meetings of Departments taking into consideration the latest advancements in science, technology, culture, economics, social sphere, employers' opinion and new professional standards relevant to the profile of the study programme.

The extent to which the set goals and objectives are attained and the efficiency of the programme delivery are assessed by analysing the results of regular and formative attestations, results of practical trainings, results of the demand monitoring of the stakeholders (annual survey of employers, teachers, undergraduate and postgraduate students); finding out the opinion of the representatives of sectorial companies and organizations.

The monitoring of the programme mastering is carried out using the Computerised University information system "Continent". The University has well-developed and properly working system of assessing students' knowledge on various stages of the educational process. Students' knowledge is assessed during regular control procedures; formative and summative assessments; background knowledge checks; progress monitoring; analysis of students' research results. Students are assessed using innovative point and ranking assessment system.

The monitoring of the study programme efficiency is carried out on a regular basis and is discussed at the meetings of Departments and Academic councils.

Achievements:

There are regulated procedures of study programme monitoring.

There is a two-way communication mechanism between the teachers and the students.

Areas for improvement:

Feedback from the employers and field specific enterprises when carrying out a monitoring of the study programmes.

Efficiency of monitoring procedures aimed at improvements of the study programmes.

Recommendations:

It is necessary to improve feedback from employers and field-specific companies.

It is recommended to enhance efficiency of the monitoring procedures in order to improve the quality of the study programmes.

3.10 Standard 10. Cyclical external quality assurance of study programmes

*Compliance with the standard: **Substantial (significant) compliance** Table 10 – Criteria with regard to standard 10*

No	Aspect of Review	Assessment
1.	Periodic review of a study programme.	B
2.	Availability of a corrective actions programme to follow up the results of external evaluation of study programmes.	B
3.	Consideration of the results of previous procedures of external evaluation when conducting subsequent external procedures.	B

Analysis of compliance of the cluster of study programmes with the standard:

The University (SSAU) regularly undergoes quality assurance of the study programmes, stipulated in the national legislation and state accreditation. External evaluation validate high efficiency of the study programmes delivery, which is also confirmed in the reports of the State Examination Committee and from the employers' feedback.

A Students' Council on the quality of education at SSAU has completed the procedure of verification of units and organisations trained in the quality of education at higher educational institutions delivered by the Commission for the Quality of Education of the National Youth Council by the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation.

The results of the external review are considered at the meetings of the University subdivisions. Based on the results of these meetings there are corrective measures developed by establishing working groups and introduction of the progress issues in the meeting agenda. Any changes in the study programme or the working programme are discussed and adopted. Representatives of employers are involved in self-evaluation procedure of the working programme. The results of quality assurance are taken into consideration when introducing changes into the study programme and for planning further quality assurance procedures.

Achievements:

Regular assessment of study programmes.

Areas for improvement:

Corrective actions based on the external review results.

Recommendations:

It is necessary to improve the mechanisms of corrective actions following the external review of the study programmes.

4.   RECOMMENDATIONS FOR IMPROVEMENT

Thus, based on the analysis of documents submitted, meetings and interviews, which were held during the site visit to SSAU, the External Panel made a list recommendations, which would be useful for the improvement of the quality of the programmes' delivery:

- It is advisable to launch study programmes highly demanded by the society and interesting for students.
- It is recommended to establish a Study Programme Panel including all the stakeholders (students, teachers, employers, alumni, etc.) in order to develop and implement the policy of quality assurance of study programmes. The panel will hold regular meetings (at least once a year).
- It is recommended to consider preparing joint double-degree study programmes. It is advisable to intensify the work on preparing a double-degree study programme, thus, extending cooperation with the foreign educational institution.
- It is necessary to prepare regulations on launching new study programmes based on their assessment and prognosis of the implementation efficiency.
- It is recommended to develop and offer a European Diploma Supplement to students.
- Students and teachers should be given an opportunity to take part in academic mobility programmes both in Russia and abroad (inbound, outbound), therefore these opportunities should be carefully searched for on a regular basis.
- It is necessary to focus on the good practices of the national and foreign educational institutions in order to plan individual learning trajectories; organising students' individual work; establishing student-centred educational environment.
- It is advisable to establish alumni association.
- It is necessary to establish communities of practice at the University in order to disseminate knowledge and experience on educational and methodological issues elaborated at the University.
- It is recommended to improve the level of teachers' foreign language skills.
- It is recommended to systematize the feedback related to the issues of the study programme quality from all the stakeholders.
- It is necessary to enhance the University cooperation with professional associations and organisations.
- It is necessary to improve the mechanisms of corrective actions following the external review of the study programmes.

5. CONCLUSION OF THE EXTERNAL REVIEW PANEL

Based on the analysis of submitted documents, data and interviews, the External Review Panel made a conclusion that, the cluster of study programmes «State and Municipal Management» (38.03.04), «Business Informatics» (38.03.05), «Economic Security» (38.05.01), «Finance and Credit» (38.04.08), further training   programs «Property Evaluation», «Accounting in Business Entities», «State and Municipal Procurements Management», «Contract System Procurements», to a substantial (significant) degree complies with NCPA standards and criteria.

The External Review Panel recommends the National Accreditation Council to accredit the cluster of study programmes «State and Municipal Management» (38.03.04), «Business Informatics» (38.03.05), «Economic Security» (38.05.01), «Finance and Credit» (38.04.08), further training programs «Property Evaluation», «Accounting in Business Entities», «State and Municipal Procurements Management», «Contract System Procurements», delivered at the Federal State Educational Institution of Higher Education "Stavropol State Agrarian University" for the period of **six** years.

ANNEX A

SITE VISIT PROGRAMME

Time	Event	Participants	Venue
March 28th, Tuesday			
08.45	Experts' arrival to Stavropol State Agrarian University		12 Zootechnichecky per., Main building
09.00 — 11.00	The first meeting of the Panel members		12 Zootechnichecky per., Main building, room 50
11.00 — 12.00	**General meeting of the University heads, heads of departments and Review Panel**	Rector, Vice-rectors, Heads of the departments, Review Panel	12 Zootechnichecky per., Main building, room 53 (the White Hall)
12.00 — 13.00	A guided tour of the University (visiting classrooms, library, etc.)	Review Panel	12 Zootechnichecky per., Main building,
13.00 — 14.00	Lunch		12 Zootechnichecky per., Main building,
14.00 — 15.00	**Meeting with the Faculty deans and vice deans**	Faculty Deans, Vice Deans, Review Panel	12 Zootechnichecky per., laboratory building of the Institute of Economics, Room 143 (Insurance shop)
15.00 — 16.00	Document review	Review Panel	12 Zootechnichecky per., laboratory building of the Institute of Economics, Room 145 (Mini-bank)
16.00 — 17.00	**Meeting with heads of Departments**	Heads of Departments, Review Panel	12 Zootechnichecky per., laboratory building of the Institute of Economics, Room 143 (Insurance shop)
17.00 — 17.30	Internal meeting of the Review Panel	Review Panel	12 Zootechnichecky per., laboratory building of the Institute of Economics, Room 145 (Mini-bank)
17.30 — 18.30	**Meeting with alumni**	Alumni, Review Panel	12 Zootechnichecky per., laboratory building of the Institute of Economics, Room 143 (Insurance shop)
18.30 — 19.00	Internal Meeting of the Review Panel	Review Panel	12 Zootechnichecky per., laboratory building of the Institute of Economics, Room 145 (Mini-bank)
March 29th, Wednesday			
8.45	Arrival to SSAU		12 Zootechnichecky per., Main building
9.00 — 10.45	Document review/observing classes	Review Panel	12 Zootechnichecky per., Main building, room 50
10.45	Transfer to the laboratory building of the Institute of Economics		12 Zootechnichecky per., laboratory building of the Institute of Economics, Room 143 (Insurance shop)

11.00 — 12.00	**Meeting with the teaching staff**	Teaching staff, Review Panel	12 Zootechnichecky per., laboratory building of the Institute of Economics, Room 143 (Insurance shop)
12.00 — 12.30	Internal meeting of the Review Panel	Review Panel	12 Zootechnichecky per., laboratory building of the Institute of Economics, Room 145 (Mini-bank)
12.30 — 13.30	**Meeting with students**	Students, Review Panel	12 Zootechnichecky per., laboratory building of the Institute of Economics, Room 143 (Insurance shop)
13.30 — 14.30	Lunch		12 Zootechnichecky per., Main building
14.30 — 15.30	**Meeting with the participants of Further professional education**	Participants of further professional education, Review Panel	12 Zootechnichecky per., laboratory building of the Institute of Economics, Room 143 (Insurance shop)
15.30 — 16.30	Document review/observing classes(optional)	Review Panel	12 Zootechnichecky per., laboratory building of the Institute of Economics, Room 145 (Mini-bank)
16.30 — 17.30	**Meeting with the representatives of the professional community**	Employers, Review Panel	12 Zootechnichecky per., laboratory building of the Institute of Economics, Room 143 (Insurance shop)
17.30 — 18.00	Internal meeting of the Review Panel	Review Panel	12 Zootechnichecky per., laboratory building of the Institute of Economics, Room 145 (Mini-bank)

March 30th, Thursday

8.45	Arrival at SSAU		12 Zootechnichecky per., Main building
9.00 — 13.00	Internal meeting of the Review Panel: drawing preliminary conclusions of the site visit, preparing an oral report on the results of the site visit	Expert team	12 Zootechnichecky per., laboratory building of the Institute of Economics, Room 145 (Mini-bank)
13.00 — 14.00	**Final meeting of External Review Panel with the University representatives**	Expert team, representatives of the University administration, heads of departments, teaching staff, students	12 Zootechnichecky per., Main building, room 1
14.00 — 15.00	Lunch		12 Zootechnichecky per., Main building
	Departure		

ANNEX B

LIST OF PARTICIPANTS

The University administration, responsible for the accreditation process:

No	Name	Position	Contact
1.	Trukhachev Vladimir Ivanovich	Rector	inf@stgau.ru
2.	Atanov Ivan Viacheslavovich	Vice Rector for Education	atanovivan@mail.ru
3.	Morozov Vitalii Iurevich	Vice Rector for Scientific and Innovative Work	inf@stgau.ru
4.	Skliarov Igor Iurevich	Vice Rector for Social Problems and Complex Safety, Professor of the Department of the Economic Analysis and Audit	inf@stgau.ru
5.	Lisova Olga Mikhailovna	Director of the Institute of Further Professional Education	inf@stgau.ru
6.	Khokhlova Elena Vasilevna	Head of the Monitoring Centre of Quality Assurance in Education	kach-stgau@mail.ru
7.	Samoilenko Vladimir Valerevich	Head of Education Monitoring Centre, Associate Professor of Electrical Equipment, Automatic Equipment and Metrology	vvs_stv@mail.ru
8.	Ivashova Valentina Anatolevna	Head of the Department of Sociological Research and Marketing of the Monitoring Centre of Quality Assurance in Education	kach-stgau@mail.ru
9.	Galeev Evgenii Valerevich	Head of the Department of Inspection and Certification of the Teaching Staff of the Monitoring Centre of Quality Assurance in Education	kach-stgau@mail.ru
10.	Fedisko Olga Nikolaevna	Head of the Department of Development and Deployment of the Systems of Quality Management of the Monitoring Centre of Quality Assurance in Education	kach-stgau@mail.ru
11.	Tunina Nelli Aleksandrovna	Head of the Department of Organization and Control of Educational Process	tuninana@mail.ru
12.	Gunko Tatiana Ivanovna	Head of the Department of Educational Work and Social Problems	gunko57@mail.ru
13.	Serikov Sviatoslav Sergeevich	Manager of the Department of International Relations	iro.stavropolsau@mail.ru

Heads of Departments:

No	Name	Position	Contact
1.	Shlaev Dmitrii Valerevich	Acting Head of the Department of Information Systems of Economics Department	dmitrij@yandex.ru
2.	Miroshnichenko Nadezhda Viktorovna	Manager of Department of the Public and Municipal Administration and Law	n01071978@mail.ru
3.	Bannikova Natalia Vladimirovna	Manager of Department of Business and World Economy of Economics Department	nbannikova@mail.ru
4.	Baidakov Andrei Nikolaevich	Head of the Department of Management of Economics Department	baid21@mail.ru
5.	Litvin Dmitrii Borisovich	Head of the Department of Mathematics of Finance and Accounting Faculty	litvin-372@yandex.ru

6.	Gerasimov Aleksei Nikolaevich	Head of the Department of Statistics and Econometrics of Finance and Accounting Faculty	gerasimov_77_77@mail.ru
7.	Leshcheva Marina Genrikhovna	Manager of department of the economic analysis and audit	marina_lesheva60@mail.ru
8.	Skliarova Iuliia Mikhailovna	Manager of Department of Financial Management and Banking	isklyarov@yandex.ru
9.	Glotova Irina Ivanovna	Manager of Department of Finance, Credit and Insurance of Finance and Accounting Faculty	glotova@yandex.ru
10.	Kulish Natalia Valentinovna	Manager of Department of the Accounting and Finance of Finance and Accounting Faculty	kulichn@yandex.ru

Teaching Staff:

No	Name	Position	Contact
1.	Kuzmenko Irina Petrovna	Associate Professor of Information Systems of Economics Faculty	11kip11@mail.ru
2.	Rachkov Valerii Evgenevich	Associate Professor of Information Systems of Economics Faculty	rw6hlg@mail.ru
3.	SHevchenko Evgenii Aleksandrovich	Associate Professor of Public and Municipal Administration and Law of the Economics Faculty	sheff20052005@yandex.ru
4.	Lugovskoi Sergei Ivanovich	Associate Professor of the Public and Municipal Administration and Law of Economics Faculty	sergio-1982@rambler.ru
5.	Ermakova Natalia IUrevna	Professor of the Department of Business and World Economics of Economics Faculty	naterma53@mail.ru
6.	Zaitseva Irina Vladimirovna	Associate Professor of Information Systems of Economics Faculty	zirinazirina2015@yandex.ru
7.	Batishcheva Elena Alekseevna	Associate Professor of Economic Analysis and Audit of Finance and Accounting Faculty	lbatisheva@mail.ru
8.	Tomilina Elena Petrovna	Associate Professor of Finance, Credit and Insurance of Finance and Accounting Faculty	e.tomilina@mail.ru
9.	Latysheva Liudmila Anatolevna	Associate Professor of Financial Management and Banking of Finance and Accounting Faculty	latisheva-la@yandex.ru
10.	Sytnik Olga Egorovna	Associate Professor of Accounting of Finance and Accounting Faculty	sitnikoe@yandex.ru
11.	Manzhosova Inna Borisovna	Associate Professor of Accounting Management of Finance and Accounting Faculty	i.manzhosova@yandex.ru
12.	Bobryshev Aleksei Nikolaevich	Associate professor of accounting management of Finance and Accounting Faculty	bobrishevaleksey@yandex.ru

Students:

No	Name	Major	Year	Contact
1.	Mailova Aleksandra Vasilevna	38.04.08 Finance and Credit (Master's Programme "Bank management", extramural studies)	1	+7(961) 477-83-49
2.	Osychenko Viktoriia Aleksandrovna	38.04.08 Finance and Credit (Master's Programme "Bank management", extramural studies)	1	+7(928) 823-52-12

3.	Semkin Aleksandr Ivanovich	38.04.08 Finance and Credit (Master's Programme "Bank management", extramural studies)	1	+7(906) 477-26-36
4.	Liashenko Anton Viktorovich	38.04.08 Finance and Credit (Master's Programme "Insurance business", intramural studies)	2	lyash.anton@yandex.ru +7(962) 494-29-75
5.	Chernenko Artem Grigorevich	38.04.08 Finance and Credit (Master's Programme "Corporate Finance", Intramural studies)	2	milikis@yandex.ru +7(962) 441-87-26
6.	Adzhakhmetova Iuliia Gadylbekovna	38.04.08 Finance and Credit (Master's Programme "Corporate Finances", extramural studies)	1	18_04_95@mail.ru +7(968) 271-68-19
7.	Egorova Kseniia Andreevna	38.05.01 Economic Safety (intramural studies)	1	ksenia.spring@mail.ru +7(963) 461-89-13
8.	Putrina Viktoriia Vladimirovna	38.05.01 Economic Safety (intramural studies)	1	putrina.vika@mail.ru +7(961) 458-26-63
9.	Kabachaia Aleksandra Viktorovna	38.05.01 Economic Safety (Intramural Studies)	2	kabachaya2015@mail.ru +7(962) 018-40-27
10.	Ovdienko Veronika Andreevna	38.05.01 Economic Safety (Intramural Studies)	2	vera3197@mail.ru +7(928) 821-23-85
11.	Sivkova Anzhela Sergeevna	38.03.05 Business Informatics (Intramural Studies)	1	sivrova317@yandex.ru +7(919) 746-73-17
12.	Sliadnev Vladimir Sergeevich	38.03.05 Business Informatics (Intramural Studies)	2	sld97@mail.ru +7(962) 402-76-61
13.	Rezenkova Kristina Vladimirovna	38.03.05 Business Informatics (Intramural Studies)	3	kris@inbox.ru +7(909) 762-83-15
14.	Kirnozova Irina Romanovna	38.03.05 Business Informatics (Intramural Studies)	4	kirnozova.irina@mail.ru +7(961) 452-40-67
15.	Lukianchenko Ekaterina Mikhailovna	38.03.04 State and Municipal Management (Intramural Studies)	4	maksolina@yandex.ru +7(988) 735-07-00
16.	Zurman Anastasiia Sergeevna	38.03.04 State and Municipal Management (Intramural Studies)	3	asatida@yandex.ru +7(905) 447-37-11
17.	Iudina Olga Sergeevna	38.03.04 State and Municipal Management (Intramural Studies)	1	yudinaolga2597@yandex.ru +7(928) 360-90-26
18.	Ishchenko Veronika Sergeevna	38.03.04 State and Municipal Management (Intramural Studies)	2	Ishchenko-veronika97@mail.ru +7(961) 479-45-42

Representatives of the Professional Community:

No	Name	Position	Contact
1.	Stetsiuk Liubov Petrovna	Financial Consultant of JSC MetLife Insurance Company	89880875889@mail.ru
2.	Doronin Anton Borisovich	Head of Department of Investment Policy and Modernization of Economy of the Ministry of Economic Development of Stavropol Territory	boris_doronin@mail.ru
3.	Vlasenko Andrei Aleksandrovich	Consulting Managing Director of LLC Soyuzinvest	stavropol@corp.finam.ru
4.	Lang Vitalii Valerevich	The Head of the Sales Department of Retail Products of Gazprombank (JSC) Branch in Stavropol	

5.	Zolotorev Aleksandr Nikolaevich	Head of Department of the Economic Analysis and Forecasting of the Ministry of Agriculture of Stavropol Territory	
6.	Gerasimenko Nadezhda Ivanovna		n.gerasimenko.frp @gmail.com
7.	Skogarev Aleksandr Vasilevich	CEO of LLC Media-technics Stavropol	trafic@sssr26.ru
8.	Ivakhnikov Sergei Pavlovich	Head of Information Technology of LLC Streukom Stavropol	naugrim2020@mail.ru
9.	Kurilenko Aleksandr Ivanovich	Vice Head of administration of the Shpakovsky Municipal District of Stavropol Territory	ka9939@yandex.ru
10.	Turchenko Anneta Viktorovna	Deputy minister of the property relations of Stavropol Territory	Turchenko @stavreion.ru
11.	Leonteva Irina Aleksandrovna	Chief Specialist of Department of Personnel and Documentary Ministry of Economic Development of Stavropol Territory	plyakina1987@mail.ru
12.	Artiukhova Svetlana Sergeevna	Chief Accountant of SMUP of "FAUNAE" Stavropol	
13.	SHCHetinkin Igor Fedorovich	Senior Procurement Specialist SUE SK Stavropolkrayvodokanal	info617@yandex.ru
14.	Podlesnaia Olesia Valentinovna	Head of Department of Holding Competitive Procedures of Committee of Stavropol Territory of Government Procurement	Podlesnaya @stavregion.ru

Alumni:

No	Name	Place of work	Position	Contact information
1.	Selivanova Mariia Vladimirovna 38 04 08 Finance and Credit	SSAU	Associate Professor of the Department of Production and Processing of food from vegetable materials	seliwanowa86@mail.ru
2.	Babenko Elena Borisovna 38 04 08 Finance and Credit	LLC КБ "IMoneyBank" Stavropol	Manager	stv_elena@bk.ru
3.	Nikogosian Irina Evgenevna 38 04 08 Finance and Credit	LLC "Evrostroy", Stavropol	Finance Director	irina-nikogosjan@rambler.ru
4.	Ostapenko Elena Anatolevna 38 04 08 Finance and Credit	SSAUm Stavropol	Associate Professor of the Financial and Banking Management Department	helen_07-84@mail.ru
5.	Vasilev Mikhail Gennadevich 38 04 08 Finance and Credit	South-West Bank of the Central Bank	HR	
6.	Bagdasarian Vitalii Alekseevich 38 03 05 – Business Informatics	LLC "Fobos", Stavropol	Analytic	bagdasaryan.vitalij@yandex.ru
7.	Narseeva Kseniia Iurevna 38 03 05 Business Informatics	LLC "Korvettelekom", vil. Solnechnodolsk, of the Stavropol territory	Specialist	ksenechka_narseeva 1993@mail.ru

8.	Shalin Petr Fedorovich 38 03 05 Business Informatics	SSAU, Stavropol	Technician of the IT System Department	sakrat26@mail.ru
9.	Shiianova Tamara Akhmedovna 38 03 04 State and Municipal Management	Ministry of Economic Development of Stavropol Territory	HR and Documentary Senior Specialist of the 1st rank	toma.veber@yandex.ru
10.	Pismennaia Kristina Olegovna 38 03 04 State and Municipal Management	Federal Treasury in Stavropol Territory	HR specialist of the 1st rank	kristinkolegovna@mail.ru
11.	Bondarenko Anastasiia Aleksandrovna 38 03 04 State and Municipal Management	Construction and accommodation Monitoring in Stavropol Territory	State Inspector of the Entrepreneur-ship Licensing Department of the Apartment Block Management	anastaxiybonda@yandex.ru
12.	Smirnova Olga Nikolaevna	Centre of Business sypport	Head of the Department	smirnova_o82@mail.ru
13.	Podporina Irina Anatolevna	LLC "Ideal 2000"	Director	lss217288@mail.ru
14.	Danilov Aleksandr Alekseevich	MUP "Gorzelenstroy"	Procurement Specialist	danilov.a-r@mail.ru

Participants of the Further Training Programme:

No	Name	Position	Contact
1.	Bagdasarova Elizaveta Arutiunovna	Branch Director "Credit — Trust PDA"	liza2782@list.ru
2.	Brovina Oksana Vladimirovna	Chief Accountant, Assistant Estimator of LLC Profekspert	scno3@mail.ru
3.	Malkov Denis Evgenevich	Leading Expert of LLC Cadastral Center of St. George	ki_malkov@mail.ru
4.	Omelchenko Anastasiia IUrevna	Temporarily unemployed	amel4enko-hast9 @mail.ru
5.	Pavlova Viktoriia Igorevna	Temporarily unemployed	vikchonsic@inbox.ru
6.	Surkova Tatiana Sergeevna	Leading SK engineer of the Federal State Budgetary Institution PCF of the Federal Registration Service branch	stssurk11@mail.ru
7.	Udovichenko Anatolii Aleksandrovich	Temporarily unemployed	ydovichenko7@mail.ru
8.	Khatukaev Anzor Aleksandrovich	Temporarily unemployed	Invictus09@yandex.ru
9.	Khubieva Margarita Mekerovna	Appraiser of LLC Ekspert	rita09my@mail.ru
10.	Khurtaeva Elena Iurevna	Senior Specialist of the Client Service GU Management of the Pension Fund of the Russian Federation in the region of Georgievsky, Department of PFRF of Sovetsky district of SK	ignatkova.elena.90 @mail.ru
11.	Shek Kristina Vasilevna	Temporarily unemployed	kristinasheck2016 @hotmail.com
12.	Erkenova Aksana Karchaevna	Temporarily unemployed	Aksana_erkenova@ mail.ru

Director of the Institute/Faculty Deans and their Deputies:

No	Name	Position	Contact
1.	Kusakina Olga Nikolaevna	Dean of the Faculty of Economics	kusolga@list.ru
2.	Kostiukova Elena Ivanovna	Dean of the Accounting and Finance Faculty, Head of the Department of Accounting and Management	elena-kostyukova@yandex.ru
3.	Tatarinova Mariia Nikolaevna	Vice-Dean for Education of the Accounting and Finance Faculty	vetrovamn@yandex.ru
4.	Neshchadimova Tatiana Aleksandrovna	Vice-Dean for Science of the Accounting and Finance Faculty	bashkatovata@ya.ru
5.	Ostapenko Elena Anatolevna	Vice-Dean for Guidance and Counselling of the Accounting and Finance Faculty	helen_07-84@mail.ru
6.	Nesterenko Aleksei Viktorovich	Vice-Dean for Vocational Guidance Work and General Issues of the Accounting and Finance Faculty	alnesterenko1@yandex.ru
7.	Ermakova Anna Nikolaevna	Vice-Dean for Education of the Economics Faculty, Associate Professor of IT Department	dannar@list.ru
8.	Tokareva Galina Viktorovna	Vice-Dean for Science of the Economics Faculty	tokarewagalia@yandex.ru
9.	Kosinova Elena Aleksandrovna	Vice-Dean of Guidance and Counselling of the Economics Faculty	kosinova5@rambler.ru

FINAL ASSESSMENT FORM

No	Standards	Full compliance	Significant (substantial) compliance	Requires improvement (partial compliance)	Non-compliance
			Assessment parameter scale		
1.	Policy (mission, vision) and procedures for quality assurance		*		
2.	Design and approval of programmes		*		
3.	Student-centred learning, teaching and assessment		*		
4.	Student admission, support of academic achievements and graduation		*		
5.	Teaching staff		*		
6.	Learning resources and student support	*			
7.	Collection, analysis and use of information for managing the study programme		*		
8.	Public information		*		
9.	On-going monitoring and periodic review of programmes		*		
10.	Cyclical external quality assurance of study programmes		*		