



Immanuel Kant Baltic federal university



National Centre of
Public Accreditation

FINAL REPORT

EXTERNAL REVIEW OF THE STUDY PROGRAMMES IN

Jurisprudence (Law)

delivered by the Immanuel Kant
Baltic Federal University



Kaliningrad, 2012

REPORT ON EXTERNAL REVIEW
of study programmes
in “Jurisprudence (Law)”
delivered by the Immanuel Kant
Baltic Federal University

Chair of expert panel
Professor

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to be 'Anatoly Kustov', written in a cursive style.

Anatoly Kustov

Kaliningrad
2012

C O N T E N T S

INTRODUCTION.....	3
1. CONTEXT AND MAIN STAGES OF THE REVIEW	3
1.1 Reasons for the commissioning of the review.....	3
1.2 Composition of the review panel	3
1.3 Goals and objectives of the review	4
1.4 Stages of review	4
2. DESCRIPTION OF THE STUDY PROGRAMMES IN "JURISPRUDENCE (LAW)".....	5
3. FINDINGS OF THE EXTERNAL REVIEW OF STUDY PROGRAMMES IN "JURISPRUDENCE (LAW)".....	6
3.1 Standard 1. Policy (mission, vision) and procedures for quality assurance.....	6
3.2 Standard 2. Approval, monitoring and periodic review of study programmes	8
3.3 Standard 3. Assessment of student learning outcomes (competencies)	11
3.4 Standard 4. Quality assurance of teaching staff	13
3.5 Standard 5. Learning resources and student support	15
3.6 Standard 6. Information system providing effective implementation of the study programme.....	17
3.7 Standard 7. Public information.....	18
4. RECOMMENDATIONS FOR IMPROVEMENT:	20
5. CONCLUSION.....	21
ANNEX	22

INTRODUCTION

The external evaluation of study programmes of the Federal State Autonomous Higher Professional Education Institution the "Immanuel Kant Baltic Federal University" was carried out since 1 October till 7 December 2012 and included the self-evaluation procedure and further preparation of the report on the outcomes of this self-evaluation, site-visit by the external review panel and preparation of the present report

The present report has been prepared basing on the outcomes of self-evaluation and its verification during the site-visit, when the following study programmes, delivered by the University were reviewed: Specialist Diploma study programme 030501.65 "Jurisprudence (Law)"; Bachelor's Degree study programme 030900.62 "Jurisprudence (Law)"; Master's Degree study programmes 030900.68 "Jurisprudence (Law)".

According to the European standards the present report on the outcomes of the external review is the basis for the final decision-making concerning public accreditation of the study programmes in "Jurisprudence (Law)".

1. CONTEXT AND MAIN STAGES OF THE REVIEW

1.1 Reasons for the commissioning of the review

The Rector of the Immanuel Kant Baltic Federal University applied to the National Center of Public Accreditation (NCPA) for public accreditation of study programmes, including those in "Jurisprudence (Law)".

The legal basis for external evaluation is made of the following regulatory acts: Law of the Russian Federation dated 10 July 1992 № 3266-1 «On education»; Federal law dated 22 August 1996 № 125-ФЗ «On higher and post-graduate professional education»; Federal law dated 24 October 2007 № 232-ФЗ "On amendments to some legislative acts of the Russian Federation (for setting levels of higher professional education)"; Standard regulation on educational institutions of higher professional education (higher educational institution), adopted by the decision of the government of the Russian Federation dated the 14 February 2008 № 71; State Educational Standard of the Higher Professional Education for the Specialist Diploma programme 030501.65 – "Jurisprudence", adopted by the Order of the Ministry of Education of the Russian Federation dated 27 March 2000; Federal State Educational Standard of the Higher Professional Education for 030900 Jurisprudence (Bachelor's Degree programme), adopted by the order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation dated 4 May 2010 №464; Federal State Educational Standard of the Higher Professional Education for 030900 Jurisprudence (Master's Degree programme), adopted by the order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation dated 14 December 2010 №1763 and others.

1.2 Composition of the review panel

- **Anatoly Kustov** - Doctor of Juridical Sciences, Professor, Head of the Chair of Judicial System and Law Enforcement Activities, Academy of Prosecutor General of the Russian Federation - (Moscow, Russia) - Review Chair - e-mail: amkustov@bk.ru;
- **Sanita Osipova** - Doctor of Juridical Sciences, Professor, Faculty of Law, Latvian University, Constitutional Court judge of the Republic of Latvia, Expert of

the Latvian Higher Education Quality Evaluation Center (HEQEC), Partner of the Faculty of Law, J. W. Goethe University Frankfurt am Main (Riga, Latvia) - Panel member - e-mail: sanita@lanet.lv;

- **Andreu Olesti Rayo** - Doctor of Juridical Sciences, Professor in Public International Law (European Law), Department of International Law and Economics, Faculty of Law, University of Barcelona, Director of the Public Law Institute of the University of Barcelona (Barcelona, Spain) - Panel member - e-mail: olesti@ub.edu;
- **Jukka Tapio Mähönen** - Doctor of Juridical Sciences, Professor of Civil Law (chair in Commercial Law), Dean, Faculty of Law, University of Turku, Chairman of the Audit Board of the State (Turku, Finland) - Panel member - e-mail: jukmah@utu.fi;
- **Alexander Rolbinov** - 4th year student, Faculty of Economics, specialty "Finance and Credit", Institute of Management, Economics and Entrepreneurship, Kaliningrad State Technical University (Kaliningrad, Russia) - Student member - e-mail: rolbinov@mail.ru.

1.3 Goals and objectives of the review

Goals of public accreditation are evaluation of efficiency of the study programmes and assessment of the level of their compliance with the NCPA Standards, provision of recommendations on enhancement of quality of higher education and establishment of quality culture in higher education institutions, identification of best practices of continuous development of higher education quality and wider public overview of the higher education institutions, delivering study programmes in compliance with the European standards of quality assurance

The following objectives were in focus during the analysis of the self-evaluation report and review of the Faculty (Institute) of Law of the Immanuel Kant Baltic Federal University: reception of true information on education processes in major study programmes in "Jurisprudence (Law)"; identification of main strength and weaknesses, positive and negative tendencies in education activities of the Faculty (Institute) of Law; evaluation of sufficiency of resources and identification of constraining factors; identification of reasons and solutions of problems, discovered during the review.

1.4 Stages of review

The review included 3 main stages, which were:

1.4.1 Self-evaluation

According to the schedule of evaluation procedures the Immanuel Kant Baltic Federal University conducted self-evaluation of the study programmes in "Jurisprudence (Law)" and timely submitted the self-evaluation report to NCPA and the panel members. The self-evaluation report included introduction, results of self-evaluation and conclusion.

1.4.2 Site visit to the Immanuel Kant Baltic Federal University

Dates and the schedule of the site-visit were determined by NCPA and approved by the Administration of the Immanuel Kant Baltic Federal University and the External Panel members.

The review panel was working at the Immanuel Kant Baltic Federal University from 29 to 31 October 2012. Professor Anatoly Kustov, the Chair of the Panel, coordinated the work of the Panel.

The Panel checked the information, contained in the self-evaluation report, held meetings with students, graduates, teaching staff and employers, as well as collected additional information on the study programmes in "Jurisprudence (Law)" and their compliance with NCPA Standards and European standards of quality assurance.

During the site visit the Immanuel Kant Baltic Federal University provided administrative support to the Review Panel, including organisation of meetings and interviews, provision of rooms, computers with access to the Internet

In the end of the visit the Panel Chair presented a short oral overview report to the staff of the Immanuel Kant Baltic Federal University, which contained major conclusions made basing on the results of the visit to the higher education institution.

1.4.3 External evaluation report

The evaluation report (21 pages), was prepared by the Panel basing on the findings of the review of the study programmes delivered by the Immanuel Kant Baltic Federal University, which was submitted to the National Center of Public Accreditation.

2. DESCRIPTION OF THE STUDY PROGRAMMES IN "JURISPRUDENCE (LAW)"

The Immanuel Kant Baltic Federal University (founded in 1947) obtained the University status and received its present name in 2012. The Rector of the University is Andrey Klemeshev, Candidate of Juridical Sciences; the Dean of the Faculty, now the Director of the Institute of Law, is Oleg Zaychkovsky, Candidate of Juridical Sciences.

License № AAA 002625 registration № 2506 dated 22.02.2012

Accreditation № BB 000976 registration № 0966 dated 24.05.2011

The educational services of the University are aimed at the local and international levels and are based on the system of knowledge management, information and communication technologies, Russian State educational and international ISO standards, IMS and decisions of the Bologna process.

Since 2009 the Immanuel Kant Baltic Federal University has been delivering two-level education system of Bachelor's Degree programmes and Master's Degree programmes, alongside with Specialist's diploma programmes for training lawyers. The University uses the competency approach when making study programmes, the University uses grade and rating system for knowledge assessment; the University keeps track of courses taken by the student in credits.

3. FINDINGS OF THE EXTERNAL REVIEW OF STUDY PROGRAMMES IN "JURISPRUDENCE (LAW)"

3.1 Standard 1. Policy (mission, vision) and procedures for quality assurance

The University's mission is to train competitive human resources who will contribute to social and economic development of the exclave Kaliningrad region and the North West Federal District in the Baltic Sea region.

The main aim of the study programmes under review is to train professionals in the area of jurisprudence in order to facilitate innovative, social and economic development of the Kaliningrad region – highly-qualified lawyers who have relevant level and profile of training and degrees, fundamental knowledge and practical skills, that are enough to be competitive at the labour market, who are able to perform their duties in relevant fields in line with international standards and strive for professional growth, social and professional mobility.

The principal objectives of development of the Faculty of Law of the University the following: training human resources for the region with regard to the requirements of the European labour market; promotion of incoming mobility of highly-qualified specialists in the Kaliningrad region in order to introduce and disseminate best practices in research and education aimed at training experts in the priority areas; modernization of the University's infrastructure for a better involvement of students into innovative research and academic activities; establishment of the innovative and problem-oriented Faculty of Law for training individuals and teams, who would develop new activities and assure transformation of existing corporations, branches and territories.

The Immanuel Kant Baltic Federal University has a strategy for the continuous enhancement of quality which is stipulated in the Programme for Development of the Federal State Autonomous Educational Institution of Higher Professional Education "Immanuel Kant Baltic Federal University" for 2011-2020" approved by the decree of the Government of the Russian Federation No. 967-p dated 3 June 2011.

The strategy for development of study programmes adhere to the mission and strategy for development of the Baltic Federal University. Methods for accomplishment and modification of goals of the study programmes, assuring participation of administrative units, teaching staff and students of the University in quality assurance processes, meet the requirements of NCPA standards and criteria.

Goals and objectives of study programmes of the Faculty (Institute) of Law are reviewed in general on a regular basis taking into consideration stakeholders' recommendations. This is done by means of modernization of the content and organization of the process of studies, updating basic study programmes, course reference materials and discipline working programmes

Opinions and suggestions of stakeholders (Administration of the University, methodological councils of the University, teaching staff, students and employers) are taken into account in the process of development of every study programme in "Jurisprudence (Law)".

In the course of delivering study programmes in "Jurisprudence (Law)" the Faculty considers regional and national requirements to quality assurance of training students in jurisprudence in the process of developing objective procedures of assessment of student learning outcomes (graduate competencies) on the basis of legislative acts, conducting regular self-evaluation in compliance with an agreed set of cri-

teria for assessment of the implemented activities (strategy) and comparing the outcomes with other educational institutions, professional practice representatives involved in these procedures, monitoring and periodic review of study programmes.

The University focuses on fundamental and applied scientific researches, creation and development of study programmes for top important spheres of development of the Baltic Federal University, connected with legal information support for the society, development of legal sciences, formation of law-governed state and society.

Findings:

- 1) Definition of goals and strategy for development of the study programmes should be more clearly outlined, and methods of accomplishment of goals should be more clearly articulated.
- 2) The existing mission of the higher education institution is aimed at the region and the European Union, but does not find its realization in general. At the same time the mission itself is not clearly outlined. It is mostly set for training specialists for Kaliningrad region.
- 3) It is not clear why the mission does not include the Russian level and its other regions. De facto, best graduates are already employed in such Russian cities as Moscow and Saint-Petersburg.
- 4) In the process of training specialists for particular countries of the European Union, as one of aspects of the mission, there is no clear study of branches of law of the chosen country from the original sources and in the original language. This has a negative impact on employability of students in the chosen country.
- 5) Strategy for development of the higher education institution does not clearly outline implementation of innovative technologies and processes. There is no evidence, that the programme offers innovative approach.
- 6) The goals of a particular higher education institution (the Baltic Federal University) should not be vague or general or applicable to any HEI. A particular education institution must determine its own goals. It is not clear how the innovative methods, technologies and processes will be available for the students of law.
- 7) The amount of knowledge, offered to Bachelor's Degree programme students, from the point of view of professional practice representatives, is not sufficient for their work as prosecutors, judges, investigation officers, etc.
- 8) Heads of Chairs and teaching staff of the Faculty (Institute) do not take into account opinions or suggestions of employers in the process of making curricula and plans of classes.
- 9) Influence of student community on modification and review of study programmes is weak.
- 10) Participation of representatives of student community in internal government of the Faculty (institute) is not sufficient.
- 11) Not in all cases students and employers are able to determine and articulate goals and a strategy for development of the study programmes, or to understand the necessity of changing to the two-level training of lawyers.

Recommendations:

- The mission must be aimed at Russian level as well (Kaliningrad region and other regions of the Russian Federation). Training of specialists for foreign countries must not be emphasized on in the strategy of the University.

- For development of the study programmes (for the part of Comparative Law) the volume of class work on International Law and laws of foreign jurisdictions (especially those of the Baltic Sea Region) must be increased.
- The mission and the strategy of the Faculty (Institute) of Law must be reviewed; those of the HEI must be specified and customized; influence of the student community in defining mission, goal and strategy for development of the Faculty should be more active.
- Raise awareness among employers and students of goals and strategy for development of the study programmes in “Jurisprudence (Law)”, and of changing to the two-level system of training of lawyers.
- It is important to introduce the representatives of professional practice (employers) in work of research and methodological councils of the Faculty (Institute) of Law for the purpose of consideration of their recommendations on development of the study programmes.
- Main regulatory documents of the study process in the Faculty and those that are important for international cooperation must be available in English.
- A proposal should be introduced in the work plan of the Academic Council for consideration of creation of Further Education Faculty as a part of the Institute of Law for extension of qualifications of Bachelor’s Degree programme graduates.
- Descriptions of study programmes in “Jurisprudence (Law)” must contain exact list of knowledge and skills, necessary for a lawyer. Lists of competences and skills of graduates must be clearly stated.
- Polls and surveys among students concerning specification and modification of curricula and study programmes must be carried out systematically.
- Invite representatives of student academic groups and employers to the Chair meetings for discussion of particular issues (curricula and theme plans, field practice, themes of diploma projects and papers, and some other issues).
- Increase the volume of studies in Comparative Law (in cooperation with European partners) for the graduates to be more prepared for European realities.
- It is recommended to involve systematically outside professors from other Russian higher education institutions (from other regions: Saint-Petersburg, Moscow, and others)

The Panel members consider the study programmes are substantially compliant with the requirements of Standard 1 (Policy (mission, vision) and procedures for quality assurance). The indicators are determined clearly enough and correlate with the mission and users’ requirements.

3.2 Standard 2. Approval, monitoring and periodic review of study programmes

Objectives of the study programmes in “Jurisprudence (Law)” are reflected in curricula, elaborated basing on Federal Standards for Higher Professional Education and contain the list of academic disciplines and corresponding competences acquired by students in the course of studies. Competences and recommendations suggested by employers were taken into account while drawing up first curricula.

Study programmes fully cover components of federal educational standards, areas of study, stipulate optional disciplines, which allow a more flexible approach to students’ interests, demands of labour market and modern society.

Subject specific contents of disciplines and discipline programmes are revised annually to update the list of disciplines, studied issues, sources of professional literature referred to in the course of studies, statutory regulations, case materials, all this taking into account opinions of students and employers collected via social surveys and interviews.

Curricula are based on three level education principle, which allows for continuity and sequence of the Bachelor-Master-Post-graduate programmes. Each subsequent level stipulates more detailed study of professional and special study disciplines, particular units of general studies courses.

Competency based approach and requirements to study process outcomes are the basis of the curricula. Employers' opinions, collected by means of surveys, interviews, participation in teaching process and in the Final State Attestation Committee, are taken into consideration when making a curriculum. Students have opportunities of participation in discussion of curricula and expressing their opinions at meetings of the council of the Faculty.

The system of interaction with employers includes: contracts with companies for field practice; participation of administration of state authorities in work of State Attestation Committees; teaching of some disciplines by specialists having practical experience in the field; recurrent surveys among employers; employers' feedback on work of graduates; graduate reunion events.

Competency-based approach is used for basic Bachelor and Master's Degree study programmes. This approach stipulates wide range use of active and interactive forms of classes. These classes include: participatory, summary or problem solving lectures, business and role plays, modeling legal trials, small-group classes. The share of practical classes and seminars is 70% of all the volume of in-class work for most disciplines. Practical courses in Public Law, Private Law, International Law, Criminalistics and Criminal Law have been elaborated, taking into account experience of leading foreign universities.

The following forms of self-study work of students are most widely used: preparation for seminars and practical classes (problem solving); preparation of conclusions on draft laws, legal acts, documents; comments on laws; writing abstracts of authentic sources of information, scholarly works; compilation of legal documents; compilation of bibliographic lists; preparation of reports, subject-specific computer-based presentations. Written assignments are also widely used (tests, scheme and table making, drafting legal documents, etc.), written assessments in course of summative control.

Study programmes stipulate field practice, helping students to enhance knowledge and skills, acquired by students during theoretical studies and encouraging general and professional competencies of students. The Faculty has elaborated field practice programmes for all basic study programmes, provided with guidelines on methods of implementation of these programmes. Field practices are carried out basing on contract with employer companies.

Facilities and resources, used in course of study process are appropriate and available for programme implementation. For all disciplines, including optional courses, students are supplied with study materials, available at the University web-page.

Students are supplied with course books in accordance with established standards. The University and the Faculty libraries are supplied on a regular basis with new modern study and research and scholarly works, periodicals. The overall stock of books on law is 55 500 exemplars: 30 000 exemplars (400 entitlements) of course

books on law, 17 500 exemplars of scholarly works, 8000 exemplars (158 entitlements) of periodicals.

There are two reading halls having all necessary information resources (study, methodological, monograph, reference literature, periodicals): the overall stock of the reading hall contains 11300 exemplars, which includes 3500 exemplars of course books (2900 entitlements), 3800 exemplars of research and scholarly works, 4000 exemplars of periodicals (158 entitlements). The Faculty allows access to external sources of information and uses appropriate software and databases.

The Faculty has created favourable conditions for students to develop and demonstrate their talents and accomplishments. They include a possibility of choice of specialist field, field of studies; theme of course and final projects; participation in academic societies, annual disciplinary competitions in law, competitions of student academic research projects, conferences, national and international competitions.

International cooperation at the Faculty is aimed at study programme quality and academic mobility enhancement. The following international programmes are implemented at the Faculty: "Law in Europe" programme, programme for establishment of a regional centre of "EU4U", ErasmusMundusIII programme for academic mobility, "ErasmusMULTIC" programme.

The partnership and cooperation agreement was signed with Wroclaw University (Poland) in 2011.

As a part of the "Eurofaculty" project of the Council of the Baltic Sea States the tradition of holding Summer Schools in International and Comparative Law was established in 2001. Last Summer School took place at the Immanuel Kant BFU 18 July to 5 August 2011. 44 students of the Immanuel Kant BFU and 22 students from other Russian (Saint-Petersburg State University, Kutafin Moscow State Law Academy, D.F.Ustinov Baltic State Technical University) and foreign universities (Ukraine, Poland, Latvia, Lithuania and Moldova) were participants of this Summer School.

Formative control and interim and final attestation are carried out at the Faculty of Law in compliance with the Federal State Standard in Professional Education. The following sets of assessment tools are formed for summative control: testing questions and standard tasks for practical classes, tests, questions for colloquia and examinations, testing software; themes for papers, etc. and other forms of control, allowing assessment of knowledge, skills and competences of students. Types and forms of formative control and interim attestation include: discussions; written assignments; technical aids and IT-based control; colloquia; tests; essays; course projects; examinations (written form); reporting (on field practice, research work of students).

Final State Attestation of graduates includes Final State Examinations and presentation of the Final Qualifying Paper for Bachelor's Degree programme and Specialist Diploma programme; and Master's Degree thesis for Master's Degree programme. Examination questions and tasks are complex and correspond to different disciplines, which helps to assure impartial assessment of competencies of graduates.

Findings:

- 1) Giving positive assessment to systematic review and detailed elaboration of methodological complexes (teaching materials) and subject specific programmes, it should be pointed out that some chairs do not assure timely review of recommended literature in some courses, the newest literature with indication of legal doctrine and authentic literature in the original language are not always present in the list of recommended literature

- 2) Students and employers are not granted an opportunity to influence establishment and development of study programmes (this is done only formally and students are not aware of their rights in this issue).
- 3) The appeal procedure for not taking into account students' suggestions on improvement of study programmes does not exist.
- 4) Only teaching staff participate in monitoring of efficiency of study programmes; students and employers do not participate (though formally such practice exists). There is no practice of external monitoring.

Recommendations:

- Regular market surveys must be carried out to assure up-to-date study process and quick response to changes in labour market.
- There should be greater involvement of graduates and professional practice representatives in the study process (teaching, participation in councils and State Attestation Committees).
- Participation of student community and employers should be encouraged and opportunities for them provided in the process of establishment and development of study programmes and curricula.
- Chairs and the Faculty (Institute) in general should carry out annual self evaluation and discuss its results at the meetings with the staff.
- Accept and analyse students' suggestions and requests concerning study of law enforcement practice (this recommendation is based on meeting with students, graduates and employers).
- It is necessary to update on a regular basis the content of disciplines and curricula taking into account experience in corresponding study programmes of the leading foreign countries
- It is necessary to create conditions for maximum correspondence of assessment and control systems for competences of Bachelor's Degree programme students with their further professional activity.
- It is necessary to increase the share of distant forms of consulting students in study and research work.

The Panel members think that with regard to Standard 2 (Approval, monitoring and periodic review of study programmes) partial compliance of the programmes under review has been achieved (the level of compliance is not high enough). The indicators are determined in a general way and documented, clearly related to the mission. The study programmes have closely approached the threshold level of compliance with the NCPA Standards

3.3 Standard 3. Assessment of student learning outcomes (competencies)

There is a system for organization study and research work of students established, which allows identification and favouring creative, academic and intellectual capabilities of students. There is active cooperation established with foreign universities, which allows enhancement of student and teaching staff mobility.

Students' research work at the Faculty takes various forms: participation in conferences, field competitions, work in scientific and discussion clubs 9 scientific clubs function at the Faculty in: History of Foreign State and Law; Commercial Law; Land Law; Tort; Civil Procedure; Labour Law; Criminal Law and Criminology; Crimi-

nal Procedure; Forensic Science. As a part of work in clubs, students study current problems, present their reports

The Chair of International and European Law holds a regular seminar on current problems of International, European and Constitutional Law.

The Faculty of Law has the Student Research Society, which holds discussion meetings. Students of the Faculty of Law take active part in conferences, held by major Russian higher education institutions: Lomonosov Moscow State University; Southwest State University in Kursk; Kutafin Moscow State Law Academy; Saint Petersburg State University.

Annually the Faculty chooses the best student's research project in the Prof. V. Nazhimov Competition. The goal of the competition is to encourage students' research work and enhance its quality. Best projects enter the National Round of the competition.

Students of the Faculty participate in top competitions held nationwide and internationally and win prizes there.

The Faculty actively implements programmes of student exchange with all higher education institutions, who signed partnership agreement. 7 students of the Faculty of Law took internship in partner universities in 2011. 6 students of the final year of studies received M&K Mølgaard Foundation grants in 2010-2011 for research work in research and education centres of Germany. Teaching staff mobility is also increasing. In 2011 8 instructors of the Faculty of Law took internship abroad

The Faculty maintains bonds with graduates and employers. Employment monitoring of graduates is carried out in the course of the first year after their graduation. Surveys involving employers are also held to determine if graduate level corresponds to requirements of professional activity.

As a rule, all students are employed by state and local government bodies, judiciary system, investigation bodies and public prosecution office. Many graduates hold senior positions in governmental bodies: preside in Kaliningrad Regional Court, District Court, Statutory Court of Kaliningrad Region, Chamber of Lawyers and Notary Chamber of Kaliningrad Region, work in ministries and departments of the Russian Federation and Kaliningrad Region, and this way determine legal policy in the Russian Federation and the Region.

Findings:

- 1) On the one hand, the prospective students of the Bachelor's Degree programme take Unified State Examinations, which determine only general level of knowledge rather than capability of students to study law. On the other hand, the list of exams for admission to the Master's Degree programme is established by the University, this allowing identification of required academic and intellectual abilities of candidates, their knowledge of legal notions and categories.
- 2) Giving positive assessment to use of clearly defined criteria and impartial procedures of assessment of knowledge and competences of students, the Panel points out the absence of the system of appeal of a grade, in case a student is not satisfied with the grade.
- 3) The procedure of retaking exams and pass-fail tests is not established locally, the students are not informed of the possibility and number of attempts of taking an exam.

- 4) Giving positive assessment to students' active participation in research, carried out by Chairs and educators, it should be pointed out that employers are completely left out from the research activity.
- 5) Positive assessment must be given to University's encouragement of students' mobility and sufficient financial support for that, as well as participation of students in educational processes of foreign universities and international events and competitions.
- 6) Prospective students' insufficient level of knowledge of foreign languages, low motivation of students for study of foreign languages affects involvement of a greater number of students in existing exchange programmes.
- 7) Students' mobility depends on knowledge of foreign languages. The motivated students have opportunities to improve their knowledge of foreign language through participation in Summer Schools and other, but the majority of students (according to content of curricula) are not obliged to study foreign languages beyond the set level, i.e. additionally over the standard study load. This affects study of authentic literature in the original.
- 8) Insufficient level of knowledge of foreign languages by teaching staff does not allow inclusion of courses to be delivered in foreign language, which is a factor preventing foreign students' participation in the study process.
- 9) Professional practice representatives participate in students' knowledge assessment only during final state examinations and presentations of graduation projects and papers. They do not participate, unfortunately, in intermediate knowledge assessment in particular disciplines.

Recommendations:

- To resolve the situations with students who are not satisfied with the assessment result there must be a procedure of appeal stipulated in the University regulatory documents.
- Events for raising employer awareness of differences of knowledge and qualification of Bachelor's Degree programme graduates, Master's degree programme graduates, and Specialist Diploma programme graduates should be organised.
- It is recommended to involve professional practice representatives, outside professors (including those from foreign universities) in examination committees for some particular legal disciplines.
- Professional practice representatives and foreign professors should be involved in presentation of field training results and the Final State Attestation Committee of the Faculty of Law.
- The rule should be introduced for study of literature in the original language for each particular branch of law (should be included in the course programmes).

The Review Panel members consider the study programmes under review fully compliant with regard to Standard 3 (Assessment of student learning outcomes (competencies)). The indicators are clearly determined and related to the mission, regularly reviewed and upgraded.

3.4 Standard 4. Quality assurance of teaching staff

The teaching staff of the Faculty (Institute) of Law is actively involved in delivery of the study programmes in "Jurisprudence (Law)".

The number of instructors involved in the study process corresponds to the outlined objectives. All the instructors in professional disciplines have basic education, corresponding to the profile of the discipline.

The teaching staff, involved in the basic study programme delivery, includes 11 Doctors of Science and 38 Candidates of Science. The share of instructors at the Faculty having scientific degrees is 78%

The teaching staff of the Faculty includes instructors in all spheres and disciplines, outlined in the basic study programmes, except for some disciplines in Humanities, Social Studies and Economics (Philosophy, Logics, Foreign Languages), who are invited from other Faculties, as well as specialists having practical experience in law are invited to conduct classes.

Hiring of teaching staff members is done basing on the results of competition, which is held basing on Regulation on selection for an academic teaching position, approved by the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation. This is the guarantee of qualification of the teaching staff. Regular attestation once every three years is required for confirmation of qualification

The University encourages enhancement of professional qualification of the teaching staff by means of holding at the University regular courses aimed at improvement of qualifications in modern education, by means of requirement of advanced training for instructors with the leading universities of the country or state governmental bodies or law enforcement authorities every three years.

Teaching staff members of the Faculty are actively involved in teaching and research work, elaborate and publish teaching materials and course books in leading publishing houses.

The main area of research of the Faculty of Law in 2009-2012 was "Improvement of legal control of social relations". Every Chair of the Faculty conducted its own more specifically oriented research. Efficiency of research carried out by the teaching staff is reflected in the following results: 20 monographs, 31 course books and study guides issued, 5 theses completed within the last five year's period. Research work as a rule is connected with practical activity.

The Faculty has established the system of quality and teaching staff competence assurance.

The Immanuel Kant Baltic Federal University has established and developed academic research centers in various areas of study (Civil Law, Criminal Proceedings, Criminalistics and others). They include Dissertation Councils and carry out post-graduate study programmes.

The University and the Faculty implement the system of encouragement of research work of teaching staff, which is based on internal and external grants. The result of their activity influences the amount of financial support of the teaching staff.

Findings:

- 1) Despite the fact that the level of qualification of the teaching staff members corresponds to the set requirements, it must be pointed out that the situation differs a lot depending on Chair. The situation with Chairs of criminal law cycle is good, for the chairs of state and civil law the level is not too good.
- 2) It must be pointed out that heavy teaching load of the teaching staff is an obstacle for their academic growth and extension of qualification, as well as for involvement of best outside educators.
- 3) A considerable share of the teaching staff is very competent in teaching and academic work, but there are some teachers that are not of such high level.

- 4) Special emphasis should be made on the practice of Summer Schools, which involves foreign educators and educators from other universities of the Russian Federation (internal internationalization).
- 5) Except for peer visits, control on the part of educational units and students surveys which do not provide full idea of the quality of teaching, other forms of control are not available.
- 6) Some teaching staff members participate in international projects and the University grant projects, but the major part of the teaching staff participate only in Russian conferences and publish only in Russian editions – their research work is unknown to foreign colleagues.
- 7) Unfortunately, mostly teachers having no scientific degree are involved in Master's Degree programmes, despite the fact that the requirement is to involve Doctors of Sciences and Professors. It is allowed to involve Candidates of Sciences and Associate Professors only as an exception.

Recommendations:

- For enhancement of academic mobility and competences of the teaching staff the Administration of the Faculty (Institute) of Law should assure regular (not occasional) pedagogical and academic internships in other universities, including foreign universities with provision of sabbaticals. Sabbaticals are also important for research and balancing heavy teaching load.
- The share of teaching staff members, having higher qualification (Professors, Doctors of Laws), and talented graduates should be increased.
- It is necessary to enhance the quality of academic research and monographs, published basing on its results. More papers should be published in leading foreign editions.
- The system of financial and professional encouragement of participation of the teaching staff in teaching and academic work should be developed.
- The level of Heads of Chairs should be extended to the level of Doctors of sciences and Professors, as they are responsible for development of branches of legal sciences.
- Sabbaticals should be granted before the termination of the election periods for extension of qualifications and academic research.
- Leading Professors, Doctors of Sciences should be invited to deliver complete courses in particular disciplines, involving the teaching staff members as audience.
- It is recommended to elaborate tests for monitoring of quality and level of qualification and research work of teaching staff members and associate professors of the Faculty (Institute) of Law.

The Panel members consider the study programmes under review substantially compliant with the requirements with regard to Standard 4 (Quality assurance of teaching staff). The indicators are determined clearly enough and correlate with the mission and users' requirements

3.5 Standard 5. Learning resources and student support

Available facilities and resources assure necessary level of quality of the study process. The Faculty of Law is housed in a modern municipal building in the centre of the city which is used by the Immanuel Kant BFU. The Faculty has 19 classrooms (6 lecture rooms and 13 rooms for group practical studies): 2 computer classrooms,

forensic study room, forensic testing room, moot court hall; reading halls; administrative rooms (Dean's Office, second higher education unit, Centre of International and European Law, Chairs); Legal Clinic; refreshment room, cloak-room.

The rooms meet sanitary and fire safety requirements, and are newly furnished. All the 19 classrooms are equipped with overhead projection devices and screens. Six lecture rooms (including moot court room) are also equipped with air conditioners, microphones, solid body PCs and fixed overhead projection devices, large plasma display panels (3 pcs.) or interactive boards (3 pcs.).

Moot court hall (room 703) and room 702 are equipped with all equipment necessary for videoconferences, online lectures and viewing online Regional Court sessions. Three rooms for practical classes are equipped with tablet PCs (25 pcs.) and laptops (50 pcs.). The reading hall, located in the first floor is equipped with plasma information panel, 25 PCs, 3 laptops, multifunction device. The reading hall in the third floor is equipped with 5 PCs, copiers and a printer

The Faculty has its room for classes in Informatics, equipped with 15 PCs, a laptop, a projection device, a network printer, an overhead projection device, displaceable screen. Students have access to this room (except for the time of classes) for their individual work on computers. The Faculty owns 2 laser printers (one colour printer), a risograph, paper cutter, collator, laminating machine, bookbinding machine, electric stapler and 2 copiers.

The room for forensic studies is equipped with a plasma display panel, a PC, criminalist equipment for practical studies (video recording camera, photo equipment, dactyloscopic tools and materials, "Regula" document study devices, microscope, voice recorders, television set, video record player, videotapes and discs with study materials), expert examination sets. The forensic testing room has a dwelling room setting.

At present the Immanuel Kant BFU Faculty of Law has 200 computer units for various purposes, connected on a common network (100 Mbit/s, Full Duplex). The network warranty is provided from Siemon company for 15 years. All computers are modern and meet safety requirements (TCO, ISO), are connected on the network, have access to the Internet, WI-FI connection is available in all rooms of the Faculty.

Financial support of the University allows study process at high quality level. Financial support of the teaching staff is (average salary and other financial support) 38 520 RUR (including insurance). Level of financial support of supporting staff is 11 753 RUR (including insurance). Level of financial support for students is 60 200 RUR per annum.

The existing long-term financing plan of the Immanuel Kant Baltic Federal University as a part of programme for development allows necessary upgrading of facilities and teaching and methodological support for the study process. Technical and Administrative staff of the University assure high-quality study process. The University has created environment favourable for professional growth of the supporting staff, there is a possibility for them to study at the Faculty of Law

Findings:

- 1) Classrooms are well equipped with devices and materials, desks and electronic data storage devices.
- 2) In general giving positive assessment to classroom facilities, laboratories and equipment, it should be pointed out that there are no separate offices for Heads of Chairs, professors and other staff for scientific and methodological work.

- 3) Library stock and information resources meet the requirements, and are used by both students, and teaching staff.
- 4) Facilities of the Faculty (Institute) of Law allow quality education for students, but there are no such possibilities for special groups of students – disabled, handicapped people.
- 5) Publicity and promotion of Master’s Degree programmes are not sufficient for the region (as a part of lifelong learning programme).
- 6) In the course of review of study programmes of the Faculty (Institute) of Law there was no confirmation received of functioning of the club of graduates and of their suggestions and recommendations on development of the study process being taken into account.

Recommendations:

- For enhancement of students’ self-study and independent study, it would be recommended to establish a computer classroom in the hall of residence of the Baltic Federal University.
- Elaborate and provide admission to the Master’s Degree programmes through examination in the sphere of professional interest of the applicants to encourage study at Master’s Degree programme.
- Despite the increased financing of the University, the teaching staff of the Faculty need raise in their earnings.

The Panel members consider the study programmes under review substantially compliant with the requirements with regard to Standard 5 (Learning resources and student support). The indicators are determined clearly enough and correlate with the mission and users’ requirements.

3.6 Standard 6. Information system providing effective implementation of the study programme

All study programmes of the Faculty of Law are supplied with electronic teaching materials: subject specific programmes, guidelines for study of a discipline, books, tests.

The study process is carried out with support of such University divisions as the Department of study programmes and the Department of information infrastructure and others.

The following databases are used for optimization and coordination of decision-making on strategic issues: “Curricula” provides the opportunity of downloading and browsing curricula of study programmes; “Applicant” data system which provides the opportunity to register applicants, keep record of submitted applications, print personal records automatically, keep record of submitted by applicants originals of documents, it also makes it possible to monitor applicants’ preferences of study programmes and rank applicants within individual study programmes; “Electronic mark sheets” software compiles mark sheets automatically based on curricula; portal of documentation circulation provides a common platform for compiling documents, their electronic approval, it also serves as an electronic archive of documents submitted by various subdivisions of the University, provides the opportunity to keep electronic journals and report forms.

Information for students and teaching staff is published on the official website of the University (www.kantiana.ru) as well as the website of the Faculty. Besides, the teaching staff members of the Faculty are provided with all relevant information via

e-mail, while the information for students is available in the group of the Faculty of Law of the Immanuel Kant Baltic Federal University in social networking services which are actively used by students.

The Immanuel Kant Baltic Federal University has internal electronic resources such as the portal of documentation circulation and the "System of Distance Education" (lms-2.kantiana.ru), storing educational and methodological materials for students which are also available in the internal local network of the Faculty (Drive P). All electronic editions purchased by the University are available on the official website of the Immanuel Kant Baltic Federal University library (lib.kantiana.ru).

Findings:

- 1) The Faculty of Law has created efficient information system, assuring delivery of study programmes.
- 2) Singling out positive sides of the system of gathering, analysis and use of information, it should be noted that there are no special indexes for groups (sex, age, quality characteristics, performance, etc.). The present system requires further development for correlation of the indexes for analysis of group's particular features and their weaknesses.
- 3) There is lack of indexes on quality and level of employment of the graduates.
- 4) Compared to other specialties, i.e. on the University level, programmes in "Jurisprudence (Law)" show higher levels.
- 5) Although teaching materials are sufficient, untimely updating of some literature on law, especially subject specific literature, must be pointed out. The same is the situation with text and course books.
- 6) The Faculty lacks qualified staff, assuring work of modern communication systems, located in the classrooms.

Recommendations:

- The experience of the Baltic Federal University and the Faculty (Institute) of Law in development of information systems can be recommended for other universities in Russia and Europe.
- It is necessary to hold a campaign for raising computer literacy among older generation of the teaching staff.

The Panel members consider the study programmes under review substantially compliant with the requirements with regard to Standard 6 (Information system providing effective implementation of the study programme). The indicators are determined clearly enough and correlate with the mission and users' requirements.

3.7 Standard 7. Public information

The Department for public relations of the Immanuel Kant Baltic Federal University is responsible for provision of up-to-date information on the University's and its divisions' activities.

The Faculty of Law cooperates with various professional associations and organizations. It closely collaborates with the Kaliningrad Regional Court, the Prosecutor's Office of the Kaliningrad Region, the Department of Internal Affairs of the Kaliningrad Region, the Arbitration Court of the Kaliningrad Region, the Chamber of Notaries of the Kaliningrad Region, the Chamber of Lawyers of the Kaliningrad Region, the Chamber of Commerce and Industry of the Kaliningrad Region, the Arbitration Court for resolving economic disputes at the Kaliningrad Chamber of Commerce and Industry, the Kaliningrad Territorial Department of the Federal Antimonopoly Ser-

vice, the Kaliningrad regional office of the public organisation "Association of Lawyers of Russia".

In order to get information on the needs of the labour market the Faculty of Law regularly carries out surveys among regional employers to study new professional opportunities for students.

The long-term strategy for improvement of relationships with professional community embraces the following activities: membership of academic staff members in various professional organisations, involvement of employers into the teaching process as teachers of courses of top interest and members of the State Attestation Committee, holding of joint round tables and conferences, setting up a basis for organization of student training practices

Prospective students and students of the Faculty can get all necessary information on the delivered study programmes at the official website of the Faculty of Law. This information corresponds to the current study programmes, environment, facilities and resources available at the Faculty of Law.

Findings:

- 1) The Faculty of Law has established bonds with professional community, elaborated efficient mechanisms of informing society on its study programmes.
- 2) Positive assessment is given to the Legal Clinic, public accessibility of the library and dissemination of information via Internet among people, who are interested in studying at the Faculty of Law.
- 3) English version of the web site is updated slowly and not fully compared to the Russian version.
- 4) Employers work mostly with graduates and students, taking field practice in their organization.
- 5) Major collaborative partners of the Faculty are bodies of state power and local authorities of Kaliningrad region, courts, public prosecutor's offices, investigative departments.
- 6) Results of analysis of graduate employment data are considered occasionally, not on a regular basis, at the meetings of the Faculty Council. Information on employability of graduates is published at the Immanuel Kant Baltic Federal University website.

Recommendations:

- It is necessary to expand and deepen relationships with the economic community of the region that will make it possible to identify the needs of the business market, shortcomings in training of students for this field and thus, enhance the quality of training of lawyers seeking future employment in this sphere.
- It is necessary to arrange the structure and content of the English version of the official website of the University.
- It is necessary, having such a great number of partners, to develop the information resources in English in the Internet.

The Panel members think that with regard to Standard 7. Public information a particular partial compliance has been achieved, but the level of compliance is not high enough. The indicators are determined in a general way and documented, clearly related to the mission. The study programmes have closely approached the threshold level of compliance with the NCPA Standards.

4. RECOMMENDATIONS FOR IMPROVEMENT:

- It is important to introduce with professional practice representatives (employers) in work of the Faculty and research and methodological councils of the University for the purpose of systematic and extended cooperation of the University with them.
- Main regulatory documents of the study process of the University must be available in English for the purpose of development of international cooperation.
- Regular market surveys must be carried out to assure up-to-date study process and quick response to changes in labour market.
- It is necessary to update on a regular basis the content of disciplines taking into account experience in corresponding study programmes of the leading employer representatives and universities of foreign countries.
- To encourage integration of disciplines it is necessary to introduce interdisciplinary course and graduation papers in the curricula.
- Traditional forms of assessment based on student-to-teacher interaction should be used more often for more efficient assessment of students' knowledge.
- It is recommended to involve professional practice representatives, outside professors (including those from foreign universities) for enhanced efficiency and impartiality of assessment of students' knowledge.
- Outside professors from other Russian universities (from other regions, e.g. Moscow, Saint-Petersburg) should be involved systematically in the teaching process.
- Professional practice representatives (also foreign professional practice representatives) should be included in the Final State Attestation Committee for evaluation of practical and current applicability of the graduation research paper.
- Development of research culture means more active involvement of students in research work of Chairs and the Faculty.
- For enhancement of academic mobility and competences of the teaching staff the Administration of the Faculty (Institute) of Law should assure pedagogical and academic internships in other universities, including foreign universities, with provision of sabbaticals.
- It is advisable to create conditions for the staff members to take their post-graduate courses at other Russian and foreign universities
- For further motivation of personal and professional growth of the teaching staff it is preferable to hold conferences, seminars involving representatives of Russian and foreign academic societies more often.
- Events for enhancement of qualification should not be focused only on technical side of teaching (extension of computer literacy of the teaching staff, experience in applied programmes, etc.), but also on didactics (modern methods of teaching).
- The system of financial and professional encouragement of participation of the teaching staff in teaching and academic work should be developed.
- For extended level of professional and linguistic training of students leading Professors should be invited more often to deliver complete courses in particu-

lar disciplines (in foreign languages), involving the teaching staff members as audience.

- To develop students' mobility, their knowledge of foreign languages and professional knowledge the University must encourage and support students' participation in academic exchange programmes with foreign universities.
- For enhancement of students' self-study and independent study, it would be recommended to establish a computer classroom in the hall of residence of the Baltic Federal University.
- The experience of the Baltic Federal University in development of information systems, assuring efficient delivery of study programmes under review, can be recommended for other universities in Russia and Europe.
- It is necessary to arrange the structure and content of the English version of the official website of the University.
- It is necessary to assure systematic cooperation of Majoring Chairs with employers.

5. CONCLUSION

The Expert Panel recommends accrediting the reviewed study programmes in "Jurisprudence (Law)" for the period of 6 years, as these programmes are substantially compliant with Standards of the National Center of Public Accreditation.

Nevertheless there are some aspects that should be improved; the recommendations for improvement are presented in Chapter 5 of the present report.

ANNEX

SCHEDULE OF THE SITE-VISIT

Time	Activity	Participants	Place
28 October, Sunday			
19.00	The first meeting of Review Panel members and coordinators of the review of study programmes of the Immanuel Kant Baltic Federal University	Conference room of the hotel ("Kalininograd")	
29 October, Monday			
9.45	Arrival at the Immanuel Kant BFU		
10.00 – 11.00	Meeting of Review Panels with the University Administration and staff members responsible for accreditation	Rector, vice-rectors Members of five Review Panels	14, Al. Nevsky Str., Administration building
11.00 – 13.00	Excursion around the university (classes, libraries, etc.)	Directors of Institutes, Deans, Deputy Directors and sub-Deans Review Panel	6, Frunze Str.; 14, Al. Nevskogo Str; 2, Universitetskaya Str.
13.00 – 14.00	Lunch		Dining-hall, 3 rd floor, 6, Frunze Str.
14.00 – 15.00	Meeting with BFU staff members responsible for accreditation of the study programmes under review	Review Panel	Room 703 6, Frunze Str.
15.00 – 16.30	Work with documentation	Review Panel only	Room 717 6, Frunze Str.
16.30 – 17.30	Meeting with professional practice representatives	Professional practice representatives, Review Panel	Room 703 6, Frunze Str.
17.30 – 18.00	Internal Panel meeting	Review Panel only	Room 717 6, Frunze Str.
30 October, Tuesday			
9.45	Arrival at the Immanuel Kant BFU		
10.00-11.00	Meeting with Heads of Departments	Heads of Departments, Review Panel	Room 721 6, Frunze Str.
11.00 – 11.30	Internal Panel meeting	Review Panel only	Room 717 6, Frunze Str.
11.30 – 12.30	Meeting with teaching staff	Teaching staff, Review Panel	Room 703 6, Frunze Str.
12.30 – 13.00	Internal Panel meeting	Review Panel only	Room 717 6, Frunze Str.
13.00 – 14.00	Lunch		Dining-hall 6, Frunze Str.
14.00 – 15.30	Attending classes (upon request of the Review Panel)	Review Panel	6, Frunze Str.
15.30 – 16.30	Work with documentation	Review Panel only	Room 717 6, Frunze Str.
16.30 – 17.30	Meeting with alumni	Alumni, Review Panel	Room 703 6, Frunze Str.
17.30-18.00	Internal Panel meeting	Review Panel only	Room 717 6, Frunze Str.

Time	Activity	Participants	Place
31 October, Wednesday			
9.45	Arrival at the Immanuel Kant BFU		
10.00-11.00	Meeting with students	Students, Review Panel	Room 703 6, Frunze Str.
11.00-11.30	Internal Panel meeting	Review Panel only	Room 717 6, Frunze Str.
11.30-12.00	Meeting with post-graduate students	Post-graduate students, Review Panel	Room 703 6, Frunze Str.
12.00-12.30	Internal Panel meeting	Review Panel only	Room 717 6, Frunze Str.
12.30-13.00	Work with documentation	Review Panel only	Room 717 6, Frunze Str.
13.00-14.00	Lunch		Dining-hall 6, Frunze Str.
14.00-16.00	Internal Panel meeting: discussion of preliminary results of the site visit, preparation of the oral report of the panel	Review Panel only	Room 717 6, Frunze Str.
16.00 – 17.00	Closing meeting of the Review Panel with representatives of the Immanuel Kant BFU	Review Panel, representatives of the University Administration, Heads of Departments, teaching staff, students	14, Al.Nevskogo Str.